



# New York City 2013 Mayoral Election



## Transportation Policy & Issue Primer: Candidates' Positions and Plans



Primary Election Edition - September 10, 2013

Composed By:

**Professor Matthew W. Daus, Esq.**  
Distinguished Lecturer

**University Transportation Research Center (Region II)**  
**The City College of the City University of New York**

**CAMILLE KAMGA**  
DIRECTOR

**ROBERT E. PAASWELL**  
DIRECTOR EMERITUS

**CONSORTIUM MEMBERS**

City University of New York, Clarkson University, Columbia University, Cornell University, Hofstra University, New Jersey Institute of Technology, New York University, Polytechnic Institute of NYU, Rochester Institute of Technology, Rowan University, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, Rutgers University, State University of New York, Stevens Institute of Technology, Syracuse University, The College of New Jersey, University of Puerto Rico



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Acknowledgments

#### **I. Introduction**

#### **II. Transportation Issue Summaries & Related Candidate Positions:**

- 1. *Bicycle Use in New York City***
  - a. Bike Sharing
  - b. Bike Lanes
- 2. *For-Hire Ground Transportation Services***
  - a. The Taxi of Tomorrow
  - b. Smartphone Applications
- 3. *Outer-Borough Transportation Issues***
  - a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)
  - b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service
  - c. Livery Street Hails
- 4. *Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements***
  - a. Curb-Space Allocation
  - b. Parking Policy
  - c. Pedestrian Plazas
  - d. Trucking and Freight Delivery
- 5. *Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues***
  - a. History and Logistics of the MTA
  - b. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor’s Role
  - c. Service Improvements and Restorations
  - d. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge
  - e. Second Avenue Subway Project
- 6. *Transportation Funding***
  - a. New and Existing Funding Sources
  - b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance
  - c. Congestion Pricing
  - d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)
- 7. *School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)***
- 8. *Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services***
  - a. Access-A-Ride
  - b. Accessible Dispatch Program
- 9. *Sustainable Transportation***
  - a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives
  - b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans
- 10. *Passenger Rail***
  - a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak)
  - b. Moynihan Station Development Project
- 11. *Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements***
- 12. *Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)***

#### **III. Appendix: Candidate Biographies and Transportation Policy Statements**

1. Sal Albanese
2. John Catsimatidis
3. Bill de Blasio
4. Joseph J. Lhota
5. John Liu
6. George McDonald
7. Christine Quinn
8. Bill Thompson
9. Anthony Weiner



### *About the Author*

Matthew W. Daus was appointed by former Mayor Rudolph W. Giuliani and unanimously confirmed by the New York City Council on August 22, 2001 as the tenth Commissioner/Chairman of the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission (TLC). On July 23, 2003, Commissioner Daus was reappointed to a seven (7) year term by Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg and the New York City Council, which expired on January 31, 2010. Mr. Daus is the longest serving Chairman in TLC history, serving for 8 ½ years as Chief Executive Officer as well as counsel for a combined total of 14 years at the agency. Prior to his tenure as Commissioner/Chair of the TLC, Mr. Daus served as General Counsel to the Commission and Deputy Commissioner for Legal Affairs since 1998, and before that, as Special Counsel to the TLC Chairperson.

During his tenure at the TLC, Commissioner Daus designed and implemented unprecedented reforms in the country's largest for-hire ground transportation industry – which includes the taxicab, black car, livery, limousine, paratransit and commuter van businesses. These multi-billion dollar industries transport approximately one million passengers daily, and the TLC licenses and regulates approximately 100,000 drivers, over 50,000 licensed vehicles, and over 900 businesses. Commissioner Daus conceived and spearheaded numerous safety, technology, customer service and environmental initiatives, proactively responded to several crisis-related challenges, and effectively managed and streamlined a government agency with over 480 employees, a budget of over \$29 million and annual revenues in excess of \$40 million.

Under Commissioner Daus' leadership, the TLC's accomplishments included:

- Taxi Technology – oversaw the installation of credit/debit card payment options, Global Positioning Systems, and passenger and driver information screens in all taxicabs, enabling data collection, lost property recovery and fare opportunities;
- Hybrid Taxicabs– saw the introduction of significant numbers of clean air taxicabs, which now comprise more than 23 percent of the fleet;

- Medallion Sales – several medallion sales yielding hundreds of millions of dollars in revenue to New York City’s General Fund;
- Accessible Taxi Dispatch System Pilot Program – wheelchair accessible taxi service for disabled passengers available by calling 311;
- Taxi Group Rides – passengers ride share at stands where passengers pay less and drivers earn more;
- Livery Stands Pilot Program – passengers obtain more efficient car services via dispatcher-staffed stands on private property;
- For-Hire Vehicle Passenger Reforms – established passenger bill of rights, increased vehicle and safety standards;
- Taxi of Tomorrow – development and issuance of a Request for Proposals for a custom-built iconic future taxicab;
- Transit Strike Contingency Plan – implemented successful ride-sharing plan during 2005 transit strike and private bus strikes;
- Distracted Driving Program – implemented first-of-its-kind program to promote safety and combat the problem of cell phone use by drivers; and
- 9/11 Business Recovery Plan – agency policies expedited economic recovery of regulated industries.

Since leaving the TLC, Mr. Daus has joined the City University of New York’s (CUNY’s) Transportation Research Center of The City College of New York as a Distinguished Lecturer. The Transportation Research Center is one of ten original University Transportation Centers established in 1987 by the U.S. Congress. These Centers and their faculty members provide a critical link in resolving national and regional transportation problems while training the professionals who address our transportation systems and their customers on a daily basis. It represents the U.S. Department of Transportation’s Region II, which includes New York, New Jersey, Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin Islands. Functioning as a consortium of twelve major universities throughout the region, the Center is located at the CUNY Institute for Transportation Systems at The City College of New York, the lead institution of the consortium. The Center supports research, education and the transfer of technology in the field of transportation.

Mr. Daus also continues to serve as President of the International Association of Transportation Regulators (IATR), a group of government professionals and regulatory agencies from around the world who share best practices and promote positive change in the for-hire ground transportation industry.

Mr. Daus joined City government in 1994 as a Prosecutor for the New York City Commission on Human Rights, where he represented the agency in the prosecution and mediation of discrimination complaints in the areas of employment, housing and public accommodation. Thereafter, he was appointed General Counsel of the New York City Community Development Agency (CDA), now known as the Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD), where he supervised all procurement activities relating to government anti-poverty funding and social service contracts awarded to

community organizations. After serving at CDA, Mr. Daus was appointed Special Counsel to the New York City Trade Waste Commission, where he was responsible for assisting in the formation of this newly created agency designed to eliminate corruption within the private sanitation industry. Prior to joining City government, Mr. Daus began his legal career in private practice as a litigator specializing in tort law.

Mayor Bloomberg and the City Council appointed Mr. Daus as Commissioner of the Civil Service Commission, an independent quasi-judicial agency that hears and decides appeals under the New York State Civil Service Law. Mr. Daus has extensive experience in labor and employment law, including a Masters of Law (LL.M.) from N.Y.U. School of Law specializing in the field. He received his Juris Doctor (J.D.) degree from Touro School of Law and his Bachelor of Arts degree from CUNY, where he has also served as an Adjunct Professor of Business Law. Mr. Daus has published numerous legal articles in journals and periodicals on topics which include labor and employment law, mediation/alternative dispute resolution and transportation law.

Mr. Daus serves as Co-Chairman of the Brooklyn Economic Development Corporation and is a board member of Big Apple Greeter. He also served for over eight years on the Board of NYC & Co. (the City's tourism, marketing, convention and visitors bureau) and for several years on the Board of Brooklyn Dreams Charter School.

## *Acknowledgements*

First, I would like to thank the leadership of the UTRC, for Region 2, namely **Robert (“Buzz”) Paaswell**, our UTRC founder, as well as **UTRC Director Camille Kamga**, for their support, guidance and assistance in making our first-ever NYC Mayoral Transportation Forum such a resounding success. The forum was the inspiration for this report, and was the most well-attended event in the UTRC’s more than 22 years of existence. Our loyal followers and members, who attend event after event, came out in full force for this summer event, and we thank them for their dedication and interest, as always. Furthermore, the forum would not have been such a flawless event, with its many moving parts, without the organizational abilities and dedication of the UTRC staff, and their supervisor **Nadia Aslam** – to whom we owe a debt of gratitude.

Many thanks go to **Mitch Wallerstein**, the *President of CUNY’s Baruch College*, who welcomed the guests to the event at his facilities, and his fantastic technical and public relations staff, as well as to *CUNY Chief Operating Officer and Executive Vice Chancellor Allan Dobrin*, who delivered opening remarks at our forum. Our outgoing and incoming CUNY Chancellor and City College President’s mutual support of the UTRC, time and again, make not only these events, but the funding and endeavors like this report possible.

In addition, I would like to thank the many external volunteers who assisted in the preparation of this report, including: **Professor Pasqualino Russo** of *John Jay College, CUNY*; **Cher Manning**; **Andrew Matera**; **Joanna Drucker**; **Jesus Amezcuita**; **Jason Fromberg**; **Jennifer Ryan**; and **Carolyn Rinaldi**.

Finally, last but not least, I would like to thank the members and institutions involved in the **NYC Mayoral Candidate Transportation Forum Committee**, which included: **Lee Sander** (Chair, Regional Plan Association, former MTA CEO, former NYC Department of Transportation - DOT Commissioner and NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission - TLC Board Member); **Ira J. Goldstein** (Executive Director of the Black Car/Limo Fund and former TLC Chief of Staff); **Tim Gilchrist** (former Senior Transportation Adviser to the Governor, and former President of the Moynihan Station Development Corp.); **Dr. Robert “Buzz” Paaswell** (former Chicago MTA CEO and UTRC founder); **Paul Steely White** (Executive Director of Transportation Alternatives); **Chris Boylan** (former MTA Deputy Executive Director and executive at the General Contractors’ Association); **Gene Russianoff** (Senior Attorney of NYPIRG’s Straphangers’ Campaign); **Rohit Aggarwala** (former NYC Chief Sustainability Officer and Advisor to the Chair of the C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group); **Dr. Camille Kamga** (UTRC Director); **Dr. Steven Koonin** (Director of New York University’s Center for Urban Science and Progress -CUSP); **Christopher Ward** (former Executive Director of the Port Authority of NY & NJ); **Sam Schwartz** (former NYC Traffic Commissioner).

Last but not least, I would like to thank the media and the transportation reporters and journalists who covered our event (and who will undoubtedly benefit from this report), as

without their attendance and commitment to these issues, the voters and the general public would never fully benefit from such informed discussions on transportation policy.

## **I. Introduction**

This year's race for Mayor of New York City (NYC) may represent an historic and significant departure from the policies, practices and personnel of the past 20 years. New Yorkers, with an extraordinary number of registered Democrats, in a dynamic and changing city, have become accustomed to the independent Mayoralties of Rudy Giuliani and Michael Bloomberg, who have changed forever the expectations of the Big Apple's Chief Executive Officer. Whether one likes or dislikes their personalities, policies or accomplishments, nobody can argue that both have left an indelible mark on NYC. Come January 1, 2014, major change is on the way – like it or not – due to the term limits law.

This year's race for NYC Mayor involves many candidates from several major political parties, including: the former Bronx Borough President **Adolfo Carrión** as the Independence Party nominee; independent candidate **Jack Hidary**; Republican Party primary candidates **Joe Lhota** (past Metropolitan Transportation Authority – MTA Chair), **John Catsimatidis** (Red Apple Group CEO), and **George McDonald** (Doe Fund President); and the Democratic Party candidates **Bill Thompson** (former NYC Comptroller); **Christine Quinn** (NYC Council Speaker); **Bill de Blasio** (NYC Public Advocate); **John Liu** (current NYC Comptroller); **Anthony Weiner** (former U.S. Congress Member) and **Sal Albanese** (former NYC Council Member). It is a crowded field indeed, with endless candidate appearances and forums.

Unfortunately, until recently, there has been very little conversation about transportation policy. NYC is a global destination and a world class city, which is on the top 5 list of most major city surveys including parks, visitor spending and tourism, public transportation and private for-hire ground transportation. NYC's Silicon Alley is also becoming a technology magnate to rival San Francisco and Silicon Valley. On the other hand, NYC is also ranked among the top 5 worst cities for traffic congestion. As New Yorkers, we take for granted that our transportation system will always function and be top notch. It is not politically popular to raise the topic of funding to repair aging transportation infrastructure, but unless our transportation policies and systems are prioritized by our next Mayor, we may see our status as a global destination suffer when people have increased difficulty, less transportation options or increased expenses. I decided not to sit back and watch as a spectator, but rather do something about it by holding the first and only comprehensive, objective and independent mayoral candidate forum on transportation policy issues, in an academic setting at the City University of New York (CUNY).

The mayoral forums held by other groups mostly followed a simple format allowing each candidate to talk about whatever they wished, with tremendous flexibility. The goal of this unique forum was to not only educate voters on important transportation issues, but to educate the candidates on the issues that matter to New Yorkers. In order to accomplish this task, I appointed a panel of transportation policy experts comprised of former high-level transportation officials, academics and organizational stakeholders experienced in all modes of transportation and governmental agencies, and who have



worked closely with me in the past and/or with CUNY's Transportation Research Center at City College. This panel was charged with the task of assisting me in collecting data and information on numerous transportation topics and compiling the candidates' positions and facts to prepare for the forum. They all helped in vetting not just the topics, but also the specific questions. As part of our unique format, each expert asked certain candidates prepared questions unbeknownst to the candidates, as well as their own spontaneous and tough follow-up questions.

The Mayoral Transportation Forum was sold out many weeks in advance and was at capacity with between 400-500 attendees, including most major news and media outlets. Media coverage of the event can be accessed at the following link: [http://www.windelsmarx.com/news\\_detail.cfm?id=288](http://www.windelsmarx.com/news_detail.cfm?id=288). There was such unexpected interest in this event that we could have easily had thousands of attendees. A video of the event can be accessed at the following link: <http://vimeo.com/69013945>.

The goal of the forum was to ensure the candidates avoided general statements and did not defer policymaking statements until after the election. We gave the candidates notice of the topics to study, but not the questions, limiting the time to respond and narrowly tailoring questions for specific responses and positions to hold them accountable if elected. The audience attendees participated in advance by sending recommended questions and voting on the topics that were most important to them, and only those topics were addressed and raised in order of audience interest.

Until the forum, the most talked about issues were bicycle lanes, the bike share program and the taxi of tomorrow, including wheelchair accessibility. Well, even at the forum, those were the most vigorously debated topics. However, we managed to shift the discussion of the candidates to focus on many other important topics, including select bus service, outer-borough transportation equity, transportation technology, funding sources and research, school bus service, commuter vans, toll equity, traffic safety, congestion mitigation and sustainability. The responses and ideas of the candidates were varied and included unexpected suggestions such as: the creation of an "above-way" for monorail service; the widespread expansion of select bus service instead of increasing the size and funding for the subway system; the use of more light rail in Staten Island and throughout the city; off-peak freight delivery times; the additional of more park & rides in the other boroughs to increase mass transit usage to ease Central Business District traffic; making government data easily available to the public and to universities to conduct research and create innovative smartphone applications for public transportation; the addition of more speed and red light cameras; reducing some bridge and tunnel tolls while adding some bridge tolls to create toll equity; the creation of a coalition of Mayors for Mass Transit like Mayor Bloomberg organized for gun control; and creating cost efficiencies and new routes to save money in the implementation of city school bus contracts. Also, many of the candidates discussed the city and the Mayor controlling its own destiny by taking control of the MTA and in creating more transparency at the TLC. Overall there was no shortage of new ideas, making this event a true success.

As promised at the UTRC Mayoral Forum, the valuable ideas and positions of all candidates before, during and after the forum were carefully tracked, analyzed and set

forth in detail in this final report in preparation for the September 10, 2013 primary. This seminal report will serve as a primer on transportation policy issues facing the next Mayor, as well as a reference tool for voters, the media, academics and others interested in transportation policymaking and the future of NYC. While we have received and continue to compile research and information on all of the candidates' records and policy positions, this report will only focus on the major candidates who are on the ballot for both the Democratic and Republican primary elections. A sequel follow-up report will be prepared prior to the General Election scheduled for November 5, 2013, covering the updated and evolving positions of not only the Democratic and Republican nominees, but also of the Independence Party and any other major independent candidates.

This report is, without question, the most comprehensive document on transportation policy covering the candidates' positions, but it by no means is all encompassing. On the heat of the campaign trail, throughout hundreds of forums, public appearances, press conferences, media interviews, and for most of the candidates, long careers spent in public service advising and/or voting on legislation or rendering executive decisions involving transportation policy, it is not realistically possible to compile each and every utterance, thought and statement of every candidate. Nor is it reasonable to expect every candidate to form positions on each and every possible angle or issue that will or may arise when governing the city and improving our transportation options and efficiency. Simply put, we are better off with a document such as this, and contributing to an exercise where the candidates are compelled to focus and be careful in their approaches – exercising prudence, thoughtfulness, and relying on and agreeing to work with experts in the field, such as our colleagues affiliated with the UTRC.

This report is structured based on the topics selected for the Mayoral Forum, with additional categories and policy statements of candidates who participated and did not participate in the event. The report is organized around the issues, with a primer or brief history framing the debate, and then analyzing, explaining and comparing the positions of the various candidates – in chart format. As an appendix to the report, each candidate's biography and transportation policy plans and statements are set forth in a similar organizational framework – based on the forum topics – but with additional details and statements supporting each candidate's positions. Finally, we have prepared a voter guide or chart for those who intend to review and rely on the candidates' transportation policy positions prior to casting their ballots. This simplified chart – with one page per primary election – is by no means entirely representative of the complexity of the subject matter or priorities of the candidates, but is intended as a mere guidepost for quick reference by voters, and voters are advised to read this report or media of the candidates' positions more fully before deciding. The voter card focuses on some of the unique and new ideas each candidate has raised as part of their transportation plans, and also focuses on the topics that affect most commuters in the city and the issues most covered by the media.

Even good ideas proffered by other candidates who will ultimately lose the election, should hopefully be considered objectively by our next Mayor. We also hope that our policy briefings and this comprehensive report will become the Transportation Policy Primer and Transition Report for whoever becomes the next Mayor. Without question, it

appears that the UTRC Mayoral Forum had inspired almost all of the candidates (whether they attended or not) to develop their own, specific transportation policy plans and platforms, when only a few candidates had done so prior to our event. The work of the UTRC in not only organizing the forum but in supporting the preparation of this report has achieved its goal so far of getting the candidates to cast a spotlight on transportation policy.

We applaud all of the candidates who – regardless of whether we like them personally or agree with them on all issues – are working tirelessly around the clock and sacrificing their precious family, personal and business time to help our wonderful city become a better one. It is not easy running for office, with the intense and unforgiving media scrutiny and morass of legal requirements and the necessary foundation of both grass roots and economic support that must be garnered for the privilege of representing 8 million plus New Yorkers and the “Capital of the World.” My point is that in an ever changing global environment, where we will be confronting aging infrastructure, climate change, equity challenges, increased commerce and tourism everywhere on the planet – including NYC – transportation policy is important and deserves our attention, focus and the consideration of voters.

The forum and the work surrounding this report, has and continues to be a true exercise in participatory and representative democracy, and shows that when you bring together the right people and organize others effectively, you can make a difference by changing the debate, and generating useful and pragmatic ideas. Don’t forget the most important thing, to put transportation policies near the top of your personal voter’s wish list, and of course, don’t forget to vote!

## **II. Transportation Issue Summaries & Related Policy Statements**

### **1. Bicycle Use in New York City**

#### **a. Bike Sharing**

New York Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg rolled out a long-awaited bike-share program, an effort some call the city's first new public-transit option in 75 years. One of the Bloomberg administration's signature initiatives, Citi Bike, named for its main sponsor, debuted in May 2013 with more than 6,000 bicycles available at 330 stations in Manhattan and Brooklyn for about 15,000 people who paid a \$95 annual membership fee.<sup>1</sup> This launch represented the culmination of years of work by Mayor Bloomberg and his transportation commissioner, Janette Sadik-Khan, to promote the use of bicycles in and around New York City ("NYC"). The NYC Department of Transportation ("DOT") created 350 miles of bike lanes in preparation for the bike-share program and the city plans to eventually install thousands more bike stations in upper Manhattan, Queens and Brooklyn.

The program, which was funded with private money, was expected to launch last summer but faced setbacks and delays after technology failures and Hurricane Sandy. The DOT held 400 community meetings at which participants chose sites for the bike share docks, and many community board managers have been effusive in their praise of the process. But since the racks have hit the streets some residents and businesses have expressed alarm.<sup>2</sup> Some critics argue that the program will reduce road safety, absorb parking spaces, and tarnish the streetscape with ugly bike stations while others are also upset that the bicycles display a commercial logo in areas known for countercultural flair. It is apparent that the level of success and public response to bike-sharing this summer will partly determine whether the next mayor expands, shrinks, or scuttles the program.

#### **b. Bike Lanes**

Although bicycle lanes are typically little more than painted stripes on concrete, in New York City they have become the stuff of lawsuits, neighborhood squabbles and tense debates over the proper role of government. Over six years after the Bloomberg administration began its controversial campaign to edit the city's streetscape by adding 350 miles<sup>3</sup> of bicycle lanes onto streets previously dedicated to automobiles, controversies continue to arise.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424127887323855804578509491579798244.html> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.beezodogsplace.com/2013/05/03/nyc-mayoral-candidate-lhota-likes-bike-share-but-the-racks-notsomuch/> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>3</sup> <http://a841-tfpweb.nyc.gov/dotpress/2013/05/facts-on-citi-bike/>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/08/22/nyregion/most-new-yorkers-say-bike-lanes-are-a-good-idea.html>


A lawsuit, filed in March, 2011, came after a year of dueling petitions, pamphlets and rallies over a bike path installed by the city last summer along Prospect Park West. The lawsuit accuses the Transportation Department of misleading residents about the benefits of the lane, cherry-picking statistics on safety improvements and collaborating with bicycle activists to quash community opposition.<sup>5</sup> Opponents have criticized the two-way bicycle lane for reducing room for cars and restricting the views of pedestrians crossing the street. They also accuse transportation officials of ignoring required environmental reviews and subverting a public review process by presenting a full report on the lane only after the decision was made to make it permanent.


Despite this litigation and controversy, recent poll results suggest that residents have gradually become accustomed to bike lanes and bike sharing. In a city where most people cannot agree on the best pizzeria, polls find that 66% of New Yorkers say they support bike lanes, a figure consistent with several previous polls, while bike share has polled 72% support. Although bike sharing and bike lanes are widely popular among New Yorkers, these issues are still frequently the targets of newspaper and tabloid ire, indicating bicycle use in the City has become one of the flash point issues in the 2013 mayoral race.<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.nytimes.com/2011/03/08/nyregion/08bike.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2011/03/08/nyregion/08bike.html?_r=0)

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/08/22/nyregion/most-new-yorkers-say-bike-lanes-are-a-good-idea.html>

	 <p>Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes</p>
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	They are a positive thing overall, but Albanese believes that more community input is needed before installing them.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio wants to look at actual evidence, not “biased evidence,” about what has happened with each bicycle lane.
John Liu	Liu stated that removing existing lanes would be “a likely scenario in some parts of the city,” particularly in Brooklyn and Queens
Christine Quinn	Ms. Quinn said that the Transportation Department had begun to work more collaboratively with neighborhoods on bike lanes since the City Council passed a law in 2011 requiring the department to “hold hearings with affected community boards before a bicycle lane is constructed or removed.”
Bill Thompson	Thompson has criticized the way the Bloomberg administration proceeded with bike lanes, and singled out the Prospect Park West bicycle lane. He was critical that the community learned more only after the lane was installed.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner has stated the he personally enjoys bicycling, and wanted more people to take part in the bike share program. He has also disagreed with the bike lane installation process.

	 <p>Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes</p>
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	Catsimatidis has stated that unless convinced otherwise, he would reduce bicycle lanes or get rid of them completely. He noted that bicycles in the city impede traffic and present a safety hazard.
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota has spoken out that there needs to be more community involvement where bicycle lanes are located. He also cited the need to have more enforcement of bike riders — in the same manner that motorists adhere to road rules. Lhota cautioned that bike lanes that impede economic and commercial activity should be avoided, and were better suited for residential streets.
George T. McDonald	McDonald has expressed his concern that the bicycle lanes should be decided by members of the community, and touted himself as a founding member of the new bike share program.

## 2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services

### a. The Taxi of Tomorrow

Starting in October 2013, all taxi medallion owners will be required to replace retiring cabs with the “Taxi of Tomorrow,” a Nissan NV200, which resembles a minivan, and has transparent roofs, passenger USB chargers, sliding doors and extra headroom but cannot accommodate wheelchairs.<sup>7</sup> There are many design and safety benefits to these taxis, but the Taxi of Tomorrow has encountered much criticism, for neither being environmentally friendly nor wheelchair accessible. The design features of the Taxi of tomorrow have also been described as “large” and “clunky,” and not modern enough.<sup>8</sup>

<sup>7</sup><http://www.capitalnewyork.com/article/politics/2012/04/5737072/bloombergs-taxi-overhaul-plan-clears-one-obstacle-and-presented-ano> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>8</sup>[http://gothamist.com/2012/09/21/the\\_taxis\\_of\\_your\\_youth\\_are\\_gone.php](http://gothamist.com/2012/09/21/the_taxis_of_your_youth_are_gone.php) (Last visited August 30, 2013)

In late November, the Committee for Taxi Safety, which represents medallion owners, filed suit arguing, “The NV200 does not appear to be ruggedly built and therefore may not be able to remain in good repair over many miles of rough driving on the poorly maintained streets of New York City.” They also stated that, “Restricting taxi medallion drivers to one and only one type of car deprives drivers and riders of options that might better suit their individual preferences. And because the Taxi of Tomorrow is sole-sourced from a Japanese manufacturer, if any problems arise with the vehicle—such as mechanical issues, recalls or manufacturing delays—New York City taxi drivers and riders could find themselves facing a shortage of operable taxis.” The plaintiff withdrew this case citing procedural grounds: as the city had yet to formally sign a contract with Nissan, and so the Committee was seeking to overturn something that does not yet exist.<sup>9</sup>

The suit was one of two legal actions threatening to stall the city’s revamped taxi policies. The other lawsuit, Noel v. New York City Taxi & Limousine Commission (“TLC”), challenged the city’s use of non-wheelchair-accessible vehicles, arguing that in so doing, it violates the Americans with Disabilities Act (the Taxi of Tomorrow, like most New York City taxis today, cannot accommodate wheelchairs). U.S. Attorney Preet Bharara even publicly supported the disability advocates involved in the suit and stated that the federal government had “a strong interest in this matter”, urging the court to find in the plaintiffs’ favor. The lower court held that the TLC was not exempt from the ADA and required it to provide a “comprehensive plan to provide meaningful access to taxicab service for disabled passengers”. Noel v. TLC, 837 F. Supp. 2d 268 (S.D.N.Y. 2011). However, in June, 2012, the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit overturned the lower court’s ruling, upholding the exemption of taxicabs from the ADA’s mandates. The Second Circuit held that “Title II(A) [of the ADA] does not obligate the TLC to use its licensing and regulatory authority over the New York City taxi industry to require that taxi owners provide meaningful access to taxis for persons with disabilities.” Noel v. TLC, 2012 U.S. App. LEXIS 13287 (2d Cir. N.Y., June 28, 2012).

The Taxi of Tomorrow has been struggling with handicap accessibility since it was first announced. The latest issue relates to the current Comptroller John Liu (and Mayoral Candidate), who has written to the mayor making the argument that the city needs to rethink the contract or prepare to have it sent back by his office; Liu says that he would reject the contract as it now stands. While the Bloomberg administration maintains that Comptroller Liu does not have the legal authority to block the contract,<sup>10</sup> the TLC has since approved another accessible cab and made promises to retrofit the new ones to be accessible.<sup>11</sup>

In addition to recent attempts from the City Council and the Comptroller's office to stop the non-hybrid, non-accessible, Nissan NV-200 from becoming the only yellow cab in

---

<sup>9</sup> <http://www.capitalnewyork.com/article/politics/2012/04/5617717/taxi-tomorrow-gets-legal-perhaps-temporary-relieve> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.capitalnewyork.com/article/politics/2012/05/5824489/liu-will-reject-bloomberg-administrations-taxi-tomorrow-contract> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>11</sup> [http://gothamist.com/2012/05/02/comptroller\\_to\\_bloomberg\\_make\\_cabs.php](http://gothamist.com/2012/05/02/comptroller_to_bloomberg_make_cabs.php) (Last visited August 30, 2013)



the five boroughs, a new lawsuit has emerged. The Greater New York Taxi Association (“GYNTA”) filed a suit arguing that the city has way overstepped its authority with the new cab. The Association’s executive director argues that though the TLC is permitted to set the standards for vehicles, its charter does not permit it to require that one cab be used exclusively. Further, GYNTA asserts that the taxicab vehicle chosen as the “Taxi of Tomorrow” runs afoul of the law, since the TLC is required to approve one or more hybrid vehicle options as a taxicab. The Nissan NV200 is currently gas-only and would replace some hybrids already on the road.<sup>12</sup> “The Taxi of Tomorrow will give riders the safest, most comfortable and efficient taxi ride in the city's history, and we remain dedicated to the goal of bringing it to New Yorkers,” a TLC spokesman said.

There are potential hurdles for the Taxi of Tomorrow prior to the first NV200 being put into use on the projected date of October 28, 2013. A state court judge in Manhattan will hear arguments in September 2013 to determine if the TLC exceeded its authority in mandating that medallion owners purchase one single model of vehicle. Additionally, disability advocates have filed a federal motion in the Southern District of New York asking a judge to require that the Taxi of Tomorrow be accessible to wheelchairs.<sup>13</sup>



With regard to the contract, on September 3, 2013, Comptroller John Liu rejected the contract for the Taxi of Tomorrow for a second time. On that date, Liu informed Mayor Bloomberg that he refused to formally register the City contract with Nissan North America, Inc. because the base model of the Nissan NV200 does not accept wheelchairs. Mr. Liu believes that the ADA requires that the new taxicab vehicles be accessible to those in wheelchairs.<sup>14</sup>



---

<sup>12</sup> [http://gothamist.com/2013/01/22/city\\_completely\\_overreached\\_with\\_ta.php](http://gothamist.com/2013/01/22/city_completely_overreached_with_ta.php) (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>13</sup> <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424127887324123004579055442248544298.html>

<sup>14</sup> *Id.*

	  <p>Taxi of Tomorrow</p>
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese supported a firm deadline for phasing in an all-accessible fleet.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio opposed the Taxi of Tomorrow selections since Nissan does business with Iran. De Blasio stated that, for one billion dollars, taxpayers and taxi riders deserve a guarantee that Nissan will stop selling its vehicles to Iran.
John Liu	Comptroller Liu has twice rejected the proposed Taxi of Tomorrow contract. In the more recent rejection of the contract on September 3, 2013, he rejected the contract because the base model of the vehicle is not wheelchair-accessible. Liu believes the Americans with Disabilities Act (“ADA”) requires that these new taxicabs be accessible to those in wheelchairs.
Christine Quinn	Asked for comment on the plan, Quinn's office said in a statement that she believes taxi service should be accessible to all, but her remarks make it clear she is not willing to mandate an all-accessible fleet.
Bill Thompson	Thompson has publicly supported an increase in accessible taxicabs to the NYC fleet.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner stated his concerns in the potential for a vehicle recall of all of the Nissan NV200 taxicabs. He is concerned that if New York City uses only these new cars for the taxicab fleet, and there is one recall, the city’s entire yellow taxi fleet will be immobilized.

	  Taxi of Tomorrow
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	N/A
George T. McDonald	N/A

b. Smartphone Applications

With the introduction of the new “e-hail” phone application program, yellow taxis will have access to pre-arranged fares. Smartphone apps are already widely used to reserve livery and black cars, and will now expand to taxis. In December 2012, the city’s TLC (“TLC”) approved, by a vote of 7 to 0 with 2 abstentions, a pilot program for the apps to be used for yellow cabs. A permanent rule change had initially been proposed, but as the vote neared and it appeared that a majority of board members might oppose the program, the commission settled on a temporary pilot program instead.<sup>15</sup>

Owners of for-hire vehicles have argued that the city’s plan violates a longstanding ban on prearranged rides in yellow taxis and would upend their business model. Livery cab companies, fearing competition from e-hail technology, argue that they are the only ones who have approval to accept rides arranged in advance. They believe e-hail could distort the competitive practices of the taxi industry, agreed upon by the City Council, to favor one industry over another. As livery and black cars cannot pick up street hails, this encroachment by yellow cabs could potentially cause drivers to miss out on fares, and subsequently, income.<sup>16</sup>

The Bloomberg administration gave the green light to e-hail in December, but livery, black car, and limousine industry groups sued to stop the initiative, arguing that the TLC did not possess the legal authority to implement it. For decades, only livery cabs and black cars have been allowed to arrange rides in advance. Manhattan Supreme Court Justice Carol Huff rejected legal arguments that the TLC lacked the legal authority to

<sup>15</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/03/08/nyregion/judge-temporarily-blocks-use-of-smartphone-apps-to-hail-yellow-cabs.html?ref=taxicabsandtaxicabdrivers> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>16</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/guest-give-livery-cab-drivers-special-e-hail-concessions-article-1.1298025> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

launch a pilot program that would last 12 months and be restricted to Manhattan south of 59th Street.<sup>17</sup>

On May 01, 2013 Justice Helen Freedman of the Appellate Division of the New York State Supreme Court (New York State's intermediate appellate court) granted the Petitioners' application for an interim stay pending determination of motion by the full bench to grant the interim relief for the pendency of the appeal. The Appellate Division in its order provided for an expedited submission date of May 13, 2013, with the Respondents' papers due by May 8, 2013 and the Petitioners' responses by said submission date and a decision to be rendered by May 20, 2013.



On June 6, 2013, the temporary restraining order ("TRO") against the TLC with respect to the E-Hail Pilot Program was lifted and the request for an appellate injunction pending appeal denied. (Hailo's request to intervene was also denied.) The Court issued a one page decision and did not provide any substantive discussion on how it reached its decision. As such, the TLC issued an Industry Notice later that day which announced that the E-Hail Pilot Program would resume, and that the app, Taxi Magic had been the approved and joined Uber and Hailo as participants.<sup>18</sup>

On July 2, 2013, the Petitioner filed a perfected appeal on the merits with the Appellate Division, First Department. In response, the Respondents filed an appellate brief on August 13, 2013. The Petitioners filed their reply to the respondents' briefs within the next week, and the full panel of appellate judges will be expected to hear oral argument in September, 2013. In the interim, the E-Hail Pilot Program will continue to operate, and will do so absent a final decision on the appeal.


---

<sup>17</sup> [http://www.nypost.com/p/news/business/the\\_hail\\_it\\_ain\\_O5n5sluEVOd58qUSBCWHFP](http://www.nypost.com/p/news/business/the_hail_it_ain_O5n5sluEVOd58qUSBCWHFP) (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>18</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/industry\\_notice\\_13\\_21.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/industry_notice_13_21.pdf)

	  <b>Smartphone Applications</b>
--	---

<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese supports inclusion of the industry sectors in the process to decide future rulemaking.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio has criticized the TLC operations in the Bloomberg administration, and stated that he wanted to include the various sectors in key decisions.
John Liu	Liu criticized the lack of “sunlight” in the manner that the TLC currently operates.
Christine Quinn	Quinn has spoken in favor of using technology and mobile apps to increase productivity, but made no specific comments about the e-hail program.
Bill Thompson	Thompson pledged that the TLC, under his leadership, would include a dialogue with industry stakeholders and experts. He proposes a general strategy that first considers service to passengers.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner has criticized the TLC as operating behind “closed doors” and he wanted to ensure diverse input.

	  <b>Smartphone Applications</b>
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Republican Candidates' Positions</b>
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	N/A
George T. McDonald	N/A

### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

#### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)**

A commuter van is a privately owned bus service used to carry passengers throughout the country. Dollar vans typically operate in neighborhoods within urban areas that are under-served by public mass transit or taxis. Some of the dollar vans are licensed and regulated, while others operate illegally. Passengers may board them at designated stops along their route or hail them as share taxis. The name comes from the fact that many years ago it would only cost about one dollar or so to ride with such private transit.

In New York, commuter vans serve major corridors in Brooklyn, Queens and the Bronx that lack adequate subway and bus service. In 2006, the New York City Council began debate on greater industry regulation, including requiring all dollar vans to be painted in a specific color to make them easier to recognize. The vans pick up and drop off anywhere along a route, and payment is made at the end of a trip. During periods when even limited public mass transit is unavailable, such as the January 2005 Green Bus Lines and Command Bus Company strike or the December 2005 New York City transit strike, dollar vans were the only feasible method of transportation for many commuters. In such situations, city governments may pass legislation to deter price gouging.<sup>19</sup>

In 2010, Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg began a pilot program authorizing commuter vans to pick up passengers in areas of Brooklyn and Queens that lost bus service in 2010 public transportation cuts. The proposed zones include areas previously covered by the Q74 bus, which connected Queens College in Flushing to the transportation hub in Kew Gardens, and the B71 bus, which ran through Park Slope, Carroll Gardens and Prospect Heights. Rides will cost \$2 per passenger. The new service allows riders to be picked up and dropped off at specific locations, an important distinction from traditional commuter vans, which requires fares to be pre-arranged. The pilot program established three to six new commuter van routes in Brooklyn and Queens.<sup>20</sup>

To commuters, there are advantages and disadvantages. The vans will provide a means of reaching transportation hubs or other parts of the borough. But because the vans are privately operated, passengers who are connecting to a subway or bus will have to pay \$2 to ride the vans as well as public transportation fare, which is \$2.50 for a single trip.<sup>21</sup> Organized labor and bus drivers, on the other hand, are unhappy with this program, feeling as though there could be a potential threat to their jobs, especially with many bus drivers already losing jobs due to the 2010 cuts. They feel that the program would be replacing, rather than augmenting, MTA service.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>19</sup> Richardson, Lynda (December 12, 1999). "As Transit Strike Looms, 'Dollar Vans' and Ferries Are Poised to Cash In". The New York Times.

<sup>20</sup> <http://cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/07/29/creating-guidelines-in-commuter-van-crackdown/>

<sup>21</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/23/nyregion/23vans.html>



<sup>22</sup> <http://www.streetsblog.org/2010/06/24/questions-linger-about-bloombergs-new-livery-van-service/>

The pilot program is being accompanied by a major enforcement push. The TLC targets unlicensed vans, unlicensed drivers, and licensed vehicles working outside the bounds of authorized activities. The idea is that illegal vans, not subject to safety and insurance requirements, would undercut the more tightly regulated livery service.<sup>23</sup> The Police Department and the TLC have stepped up enforcement in places like southeastern Queens and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn, where most commuter vans, legal and illegal, circulate. The TLC has said that it is a priority to crack down on illegal van operation with the Police Department.<sup>24</sup>



---

<sup>23</sup> <http://www.streetsblog.org/2010/06/24/questions-linger-about-bloombergs-new-livery-van-service/>

<sup>24</sup> <http://cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/07/29/creating-guidelines-in-commuter-van-crackdown/>

	  <p>Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)</p>
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	Albanese supports equity for transportation in the outer boroughs, but did not specifically discuss the commuter van issues.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio stated that he wanted to include and review the operational modes of transportation to increase options, safety and efficiency for passengers
John Liu	As a City Council Member, John Liu introduced legislation governing commuter vans to abolish two rules he contends needlessly delay and complicate the daily trips of thousands of residents of Queens.
Christine Quinn	When the pilot program was announced by Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg and the TLC on June 22, 2010, Council Speaker Christine C. Quinn led the City Council delegation present at the announcement to demonstrate support for the pilot program.
Bill Thompson	Thompson cited a lack of transportation in Brooklyn, Queens, Staten Island and the Bronx. He supports transportation services that move people from their personal cars, but get them to work in a quicker and more efficient manner.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner has stated that – in the most densely populated region in the country – there needs to be a review of all “alternative modes of moving people from Point A to Point B.”



	  <p>Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)</p>
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Republican Candidates' Positions</b>
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	N/A
George T. McDonald	N/A

b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service

Select Bus Service (“SBS”), is a brand used by MTA Regional Bus Operations for bus rapid transit service in New York City. The SBS program was unveiled to the public on March 25, 2008.<sup>25</sup> At the time of the announcement, the MTA and the Mayor had stated that implementation on other corridors was contingent on the passage of congestion pricing, which ultimately did not make it for a vote in the legislature.<sup>26</sup> In June 2008 many elements were incorporated to change bus operations, including: high visibility stations, bus lanes where the road is dedicated to the exclusive use of buses, service plan that provides an easily understandable route map and schedule, high capacity low floor vehicles, a faster fare collection system where customers pay before boarding, and a Traffic Signal Priority (“TSP”) which gives buses priority at traffic lights System identity and branding which bring a unique and distinguished visibility to the BRT service.<sup>27</sup> There are currently five SBS routes along four corridors: Bx12 Fordham Road-Pelham Parkway; M34 34th Street Phase I Enhanced Bus Priority Corridor; Phase II off-board fare collection; M15 First Avenue-Second Avenue SBS S79; and Hylan Boulevard SBS. Three additional routes are to begin service in late 2013; Bx41 Webster Avenue x44 Nostrand Avenue-Rogers Avenue SBS; and M60 125th St/LaGuardia SBS.<sup>28</sup>

<sup>25</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/portal/site/nycgov/menuitem.c0935b9a57bb4ef3daf2f1c701c789a0/index.jsp?pageID=mayor\\_press\\_release&catID=1194&doc\\_name=http://www.nyc.gov/html/om/html/2008a/pr101-08.html&cc=unused1978&rc=1194&ndi=1](http://www.nyc.gov/portal/site/nycgov/menuitem.c0935b9a57bb4ef3daf2f1c701c789a0/index.jsp?pageID=mayor_press_release&catID=1194&doc_name=http://www.nyc.gov/html/om/html/2008a/pr101-08.html&cc=unused1978&rc=1194&ndi=1)

<sup>26</sup> [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Select\\_Bus\\_Service](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Select_Bus_Service)

<sup>27</sup> <http://web.mta.info/mta/planning/sbs/faqs.htm>

<sup>28</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/portal/site/nycgov/menuitem.c0935b9a57bb4ef3daf2f1c701c789a0/index.jsp?pageID=mayor\\_press\\_release&catID=1194&doc\\_name=http://www.nyc.gov/html/om/html/2008a/pr101-08.html&cc=unused1978&rc=1194&ndi=1](http://www.nyc.gov/portal/site/nycgov/menuitem.c0935b9a57bb4ef3daf2f1c701c789a0/index.jsp?pageID=mayor_press_release&catID=1194&doc_name=http://www.nyc.gov/html/om/html/2008a/pr101-08.html&cc=unused1978&rc=1194&ndi=1)

The New York City Department of Transportation and the MTA New York City Transit are working together to improve the city's bus system by implementing bus rapid transit (“BRT”) improvements on routes throughout the city. BRT is a cost-effective approach to transit service that cities around the world have used to make riding the bus more like riding the subway. BRT improves bus speed, bus reliability and passenger comfort and convenience. SBS is New York City’s brand for BRT improvements. SBS takes many of the elements of BRT and adapts them for New York City’s streets. Projects are tailored to individual corridors, but elements include:

- Faster Fare Collection: customers pay their fare at the SBS stop before they board on current SBS routes, reducing the time required to pick up and drop off passengers. Smart Cards and other technologies will also speed boarding on future routes.
- Bus Bulbs: widened sidewalks at bus stops provide more space for waiting bus riders and pedestrians.
- Bus lanes: travel lanes that are restricted to buses during certain hours of the day.
- Loading zones: Some projects may include new commercial vehicle loading zones and other improved parking regulations.

Other features that are part of Select Bus Service corridors:

- Camera enforcement: video cameras issue tickets to drivers illegally parking or driving in the bus lanes.
- Transit signal priority: buses get an extended green light at certain intersections, reducing stop time.
- Simplified service: Routes have easy-to-understand schedules and stops spaced like the subway.
- System identity and branding: brings a unique and distinguished visibility to SBS.

SBS service will benefit all the travelers in each corridor. Current bus riders who travel longer distances will benefit directly from the faster Select Bus Service option. Bus riders who travel a short distance between local stops will benefit from the provision of bus lanes. Automobile drivers should benefit from the traffic signal optimization measures. Finally, by increasing the number of people who travel by transit, everyone benefits by reduced traffic, pollution and demand for parking. Further, the 2013 plans could help counteract some of the cuts that the city underwent in 2010 to help plug an \$800 million



budget gap, including reduced service on two Co-op City bus routes, Bx26 and Bx28, and eliminated the entire QBx1.<sup>29</sup>



While there are several benefits to increased bus service, there are also several issues. Many vendors working on 125<sup>th</sup> Street are not going to be able to park. The bus plan has garnered widespread criticism from community leaders, who feel that many community boards were not brought to the table with regard to DOT's proposals. These changes come at a tough time for vendors considering 125th St. has undergone rapid development in recent years. A GAP and an Old Navy have moved in, and Whole Foods is planning to open a store at 125th and Lenox in 2015. Some vendors are lamenting that their long-term prospects are dwindling. The livelihood of these vendors is potentially threatened by increased bus service in this area.<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/bronx/piss-poor-bus-service-co-op-city-article-1.1358041#ixzz2Vr7VY3lw>

<sup>30</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/uptown/vendors-rip-planned-m60-bus-service-125th-st-article-1.1364184#ixzz2Vr5fboid>

	  <p>Bus Service/Select Bus Service</p>
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese has a proposal calling for 20 new Select Bus Service routes by 2018.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio said he wants more Bus Rapid Transit outside of Manhattan, citing a JFK-to-Flushing route as an example.
John Liu	Liu said that expanding Bus Rapid Transit should be part of the city's transit mix, but didn't get more specific than that.
Christine Quinn	Quinn said she'd aim to add ten Select Bus Service routes in four years. Given that it has taken five years for NYC DOT to roll out the four lines, Quinn said this would be a significant acceleration of the program.
Bill Thompson	At a forum, Thompson spoke about improving bus service and called the current system unfair and inequitable. Thompson advocated increased services for underserved neighborhoods, especially in the outer boroughs.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner supports a review of alternatives to modernize and expand services in all modes of transportation.

	  Bus Service/Select Bus Service
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Republican Candidates' Positions</b>
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota supports Select Bus Service to the airport as a convenience for travelers as well as airport workers, and as a boost for the entire New York economy.
George T. McDonald	N/A

c. Livery Street Hails

Many areas of New York City lack quality taxi service, which leads to black cars accepting illegal street hails. In December 2011, Mayor Bloomberg sought to remedy this inequity but failed to convince the City Council to back a plan to let livery cabs accept street hails in northern Manhattan and the other boroughs. Bloomberg then turned to the Legislature and Gov. Andrew Cuomo to pass a bill which would allow it. Governor Andrew M. Cuomo signed a Chapter Amendment authorizing New York City to allow for street hail service in northern Manhattan and the four City outer boroughs.<sup>31</sup> In February 2012, revisions were made to the Chapter Amendment, and the final Street Hail Livery Law was enacted. The Street Hail Livery Law allows the City to issue up to 18,000 Street Hail Livery vehicle permits and 450 Street Hail Livery base permits. The Street Hail Livery vehicle permits are to be sold over the course of three (3) years—6,000 permits each year, to existing livery vehicle owners and/or drivers who have been in good standing with the TLC for one (1) year. The Street Hail Livery Law also requires that a minimum of twenty percent (20%) of all Street Hail Livery vehicles be wheelchair accessible. Whether the percentage of accessible livery vehicles will increase will be determined by a HAIL market analysis to be conducted by the TLC. Additionally, the law authorizes the TLC to auction 2,000 yellow taxicab medallions for accessible taxicabs, which vehicles are permitted to pick-up street hails in all boroughs, including the central business district in Manhattan (“CBD”),<sup>32</sup> Further, purchasers of HAIL licenses will be eligible to apply for grants up to \$15,000 to either purchase a wheelchair accessible vehicle or to make their current vehicle wheelchair accessible.

<sup>31</sup> Senate Bill S5825 available at <http://open.nysenate.gov/legislation/bill/S5825-2011>; signed as Assembly Bill A8496.

<sup>32</sup> Assembly Bill A8691A-2011 available at <http://open.nysenate.gov/legislation/bill/A8691A-2011>.

The Street Hail Livery Law sought to address two key issues: the lack of accessible vehicles for City residents and non-residents with disabilities, and the lack of availability of yellow cabs in the four (4) boroughs outside Manhattan as well as Manhattan's CBD, along with JFK and LaGuardia airport, are demarked as the "HAIL Exclusionary Zone," in which Street Hail-licensed vehicles will be prohibited from accepting prearranged calls. Plaintiff medallion owners and their financiers sued the state of New York and Michael Bloomberg, challenging the constitutionality of the Street Hail Livery Law.<sup>33</sup> Attorneys for the city and state had argued that a significant state interest was at stake: broadening access to taxi service to residents outside Manhattan, who aren't served as comprehensively by yellow cabs. Roughly 80% of the city's residents live outside Manhattan. In oral arguments, attorneys for the state noted that taxis serve residents from outside the city as well. The state's highest court found that the entire law was in fact constitutional, which will now allow for livery cab drivers to pick up passengers, outside of Manhattan's CBD and the two nearby major airports, who hail them on streets.

Each Street Hail Livery must be affiliated with a base that is specially licensed to affiliate Street Hail Livery vehicles. Drivers and vehicle owners will be required to retrofit their For-Hire Vehicles to include a meter for street hails, a roof light, a credit card/debit card reader and a GPS device. The TLC has termed this new equipment and machinery with its associated media, firmware and other embedded technology the Street Hail Livery Technology System, or "L-PEP" (the moniker already being used by the industry to classify this program as a replica of the TLC's Taxicab Passenger Enhancement Program – or T-PEP – for yellow cabs). This decision essentially codifies the L-PEP provider rules proposed by the TLC.<sup>34</sup> The TLC will need to release the timing annually of when the sale of Street Hail Livery vehicle and base permits and accessible medallions will take place. However, there is nothing in the decision that prevents the TLC from proceeding with the Street Hail Livery program and the corresponding permit/medallion sales as soon as possible.<sup>35</sup>

#### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

##### **a. Curb-Space Allocation**

Proper curb space allocation is very important in New York City. Several entities rely on it, such as the newly installed bike-share stations,<sup>36</sup> sidewalk cafes; placard parking; on-street bus locations, and on-street parking.<sup>37</sup> In an effort to manage unauthorized bus stop

---

<sup>33</sup> The Plaintiffs are the MTBOT, the TSA and the GNYTA. The Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade (the "MTBOT") Plaintiffs are medallion owners and Lewis Fidler, a member of the New York City Council. The Plaintiffs in the Taxicab Service Association (the "TSA") are credit unions and other entities that finance the purchase of medallions. The Plaintiffs in the Greater New York Taxi Association (the "GNYTA") are medallion owners and one individual. The Defendants are the State of New York, Governor Cuomo, the City of New York, Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg, the TLC, and TLC Chair David Yassky.

<sup>34</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/proposed\\_lpep\\_providers\\_rule.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/proposed_lpep_providers_rule.pdf)

<sup>35</sup> As of the date of this report, the TLC has begun issuing the first group of Street Hail Livery vehicle and base permits.

<sup>36</sup> <http://www.streetsblog.org/2013/04/30/reality-check-bike-share-station-takes-up-less-space-than-parked-cars/>

<sup>37</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/pub/mnneeds\\_2013.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/pub/mnneeds_2013.pdf)

locations and issues raised by affected community boards<sup>38</sup> and local business' and residents' associations, the State legislature adopted Vehicle and Traffic Law § 1642-a, authorizing the City to establish an intercity bus permit system through the New York City traffic rules.

Representatives from local business' and residents' associations such as Dan Biederman, 34<sup>th</sup> Street Partnership, Clinton Hell's Kitchen Coalition for Pedestrian Safety (CHEKPEDS),<sup>39</sup> Community Board 3 Chair, Ms. Susan Stetzer; Community Board 4 Vice-chair, Ms. Christine Berthet; Operations Manager at Cornell University and Friends of the High Line, submitted oral and written testimony. The main issues put forward related to curb side management and they expressed that the criteria proposed under the rules for selection of on-street bus locations do not go far enough, arguing they should be clear and explicit. They also stated that there should be different criteria for stops and terminals, as it requires greater substantive analysis of what is happening on street level. Furthermore, they argued sidewalk obstruction and permits for on-street locations should be similar to sidewalk café/newsstand and that it would be wrong to grandfather permits for a three year period as existing locations should be evaluated.

In areas such as Hell's Kitchen and the Garment District, residents and business' are voicing complaints against buses for not using truck and bus designated streets, and double parking instead of doing a loop of the block. The lack of peak hour management with the convergence of subway users onto the streets and people waiting for buses has caused pedestrians to overflow onto the street. Over 15,000 pedestrians and cyclists were injured in New York City traffic in 2012, and 155 were killed, according to New York Police Department ("NYPD") data reports compiled by Streetsblog.<sup>40</sup>


---

<sup>38</sup> Letter in support of the State legislation from Community Board 4, dated April 6 2011,



<http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb4/downloads/pdf/Resolutions/April%202011/5%20Trans%20Letter%20to%20Sen.%20Squadron%20re%20Intercity%20Bus%20Permits.pdf>

<sup>39</sup> <http://www.chekpeds.com/images/bus44/44thstreetreport-2.pdf>

<sup>40</sup> <http://www.streetsblog.org/2013/01/31/nypd-15465-pedestrians-and-cyclists-injured-155-killed-in-traffic-in-2012/>

	 <p>Curb-Space Allocation</p>
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	Albanese stated that the mayor can and should control most directly the allocation of street space and advocated increased enforcement.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio called for more bus rapid transit outside of Manhattan. He also questioned if Mayor Bloomberg had implemented the SBS program quickly enough.
John Liu	Asked whether he would have installed the bike lane as mayor, Liu said he would not. He stated that Bus Rapid Transit should be part of the city's transit mix, but didn't get more specific than that.
Christine Quinn	Quinn spoke about improving bus service. Specifically, she supports launching 10 new Select Bus Service routes in the next 4 years.
Bill Thompson	Thompson supports creating a Bus Rapid Transit system in Queens and Staten Island.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner proposed reducing the distance required for fire hydrants to create additional curb space while also allowing emergency vehicles access to the hydrants.



	  Curb-Space Allocation
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	Catsimatidis wants to take measures to reduce the number of cars entering Manhattan below 59th Street.
Joseph J. Lhota	N/A
George T. McDonald	N/A

b. Parking Policy


Due to the presence in New York City of numerous City, State and Federal buildings, Manhattan has a major problem with government-authorized vehicles occupying space on streets and sidewalks. Community boards for the borough of Manhattan urge City, State and Federal agencies to continue to reduce the number of placards issued and better regulate them.<sup>41</sup> According to blogs and newspapers, cheap on-street parking causes double parking, traffic congestion & blocked bike lanes.

Delivery trucks and service vehicles double park because on-street parking is scarce. Some contend that spots are scarce because the City does not charge enough for on-street parking. Another big problem is city workers with parking permits-police and fire officials in particular-who take up thousands of on-street spots in the heart of Midtown and elsewhere. In busy parts of the city, like Manhattan's central business district, one could argue that it should cost far more to park in a scarce on-street spot than at a nearby parking garage. Curb-side parking is essential for delivery trucks and the service vehicles of plumbers, electricians and other skilled workers. This is especially true because NYC does not have alleys like many other major cities.<sup>42</sup>

There were discussions since early 2012 about New York City considering awarding a contract to a vendor and privatizing parking meter collections. Some cities have utilized this approach to reduce costs and generate revenue. In January 2013, the City scrapped its plans, and there has been no impetus to proceed with this approach.


<sup>41</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/pub/mnneeds\\_2013.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/pub/mnneeds_2013.pdf)

<sup>42</sup> <http://www.transalt.org/files/newsroom/magazine/032Spring/09parking.html>

	<div>Parking Policy</div> 
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	N/A
Bill de Blasio	Mr. de Blasio opposes privatization, which he states can lead to higher costs for drivers and small business owners at a time when they can ill afford it.
John Liu	Mr. Liu opposed the plan to privatize the City's parking meters. He stated that outsourcing to a private corporation would've led to higher meter rates.
Christine Quinn	Speaker Quinn supported new rules that ensure the city's parking meters don't charge drivers when they're out of paper.
Bill Thompson	Thompson said his administration will also install mobile pay parking meters that allow residents to conveniently pay for parking time using their mobile phones. <sup>43</sup>
Anthony Weiner	Mr. Weiner supports flexible time limits for parking meter restrictions based on local needs.

---

<sup>43</sup> Bill Thompson for Mayor, PRESS RELEASE, August 16, 2013.

	<div>Parking Policy</div> 
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota slammed the invasion of high-end food trucks that he claimed clog major thoroughfares. He said he would support regulations limiting where the food trucks can park. <sup>44</sup>
George T. McDonald	N/A

---

<sup>44</sup> <http://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/20130128/new-york-city/joe-lhota-warns-of-return-dark-days-if-democrat-elected-next-mayor> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

### c. Pedestrian Plazas

Mayor Michael Bloomberg began an initiative through the NYC Department of Transportation to create more public, open space by reclaiming underutilized street space and transforming the space into pedestrian plazas. As of the date of this report, there are twenty-three (23) completed pedestrian plazas, and an additional 26 plazas in some state of design or planning.<sup>45</sup> Mayor Bloomberg stated that the Times Square and Herald Square pedestrian plazas have achieved tenure status, and will not be returned to vehicle use. When, in 2009, the mayor and his transportation commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan announced that portions of Times Square and Herald Square would be closed to traffic, there was outrage from several different groups. Sadik-Khan and the mayor argued that the move would actually ease traffic, not further congest it. The following year, when changes were set to be permanent, the city issued statistics supporting its congestion-easing point of view. Bloomberg is, in fact, doing more than just saying the Times Square plaza has achieved permanency, and is actually prepared to invest new money in making it so.

Starting sometime this year, the administration is planning to plow millions into a Times Square pedestrian plaza redesign. The \$40 million project will create “a mosaic design embedded in the concrete—accompanied by new lamps and benches,” according to one news source, and will have “a noirish quality that evokes the square’s colorful and occasionally illicit past,” according to another. Bloomberg’s desire to get this project underway makes sense from a permanency standpoint. His third and final term concludes at the end of 2013, and it is not all that clear where his would-be successors stand on the issue. For his part, the mayor reiterated his belief that roads “are not necessarily designed to move automobiles. And so you might want to use your roads for other methods of transportation.”<sup>46</sup>

---

<sup>45</sup> <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/pedestrians/public-plazas.shtml> (Last visited September 2, 2013)

<sup>46</sup> <http://www.capitalnewyork.com/article/politics/2013/01/7230506/bloomberg-pedestrian-plazas-are-here-stay>

	Pedestrian Plazas
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese plans to design safer/smarter streets by expanding bike lanes, pedestrian plazas, and mass transit options.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio wants an approach with communication with the community.
John Liu	Liu stated that there is already a fair amount of dissatisfaction with the changes on Broadway, where large amounts of space have been expropriated.
Christine Quinn	<p>Quinn stated that she has learned of some very significant concerns about these projects from a lot of different communities in the city, who have said that these pedestrian plazas don't necessarily help our businesses.</p> <p>In addition, Quinn noted that people in the disability community have raised the concern that pedestrian plazas have not been constructed in a way that it is safe for them to move through those plazas.</p>
Anthony Weiner	Weiner has questioned the merits of the pedestrian plazas as a source to create additional motorist delays.

	Pedestrian Plazas
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Republican Candidates' Positions</b>
John Catsimatidis	Catsimatidis opposes pedestrian plazas. He has questioned their purpose, and considers the plazas problematic. He has stated that he would reduce them or get rid of them completely.
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota wants more community involvement where the plazas are located. He also advocated for more enforcement against bike riders.
George T. McDonald	McDonald has stated that he would keep the pedestrian plazas, and spoke in support of the plazas at Times Square and Herald Square.

d. Trucking and Freight Delivery

The movement of freight is one of the most critical transportation issues currently. How freight infrastructure is prioritized, invested in, and developed will have considerable bearing on how the economy grows. There are many issues with the current freight system in the New York metropolitan area. The former Port Authority of New York and New Jersey chief, Christopher Ward has said “the city is bedeviled by intraregional truck trips, criss-crossing the dense, congested region 364 days a year...is an economic and environmental crisis.” “We must finally realize small-scale rail freight distribution within this city,” he declared, noting that under his leadership, the Port Authority had acquired facilities in New Jersey needed to eventually build a long-desired cross-harbor rail freight tunnel. Beyond that, said Ward, the region needs to develop small, clean vehicles capable of carrying freight the last mile from rail stations to final destinations.”

Specifically, there are several problems in New York City. Although bus and truck routes have been designated, lax traffic enforcement has allowed limousines, taxis and trucks to illegally block dedicated bus lanes at evening rush hours in key midtown intersections for as long as 15 minutes on more than 350 different occasions without a single vehicle being ticketed, according to a recent survey by the office of Manhattan Borough President Scott M. Stringer. In the worst intersection, 40 buses were blocked every hour, an average of

one bus every 90 seconds.<sup>47</sup> In addition, former MTA Chairman and CEO Joe Lhota never did authorize bus lane camera enforcement because fines collected from lane violators do not reach the MTA. Instead, it gets siphoned into the city's coffers, unlikely to benefit transit projects or riders.<sup>48</sup>

	Trucking and Freight Policy
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	N/A
Bill de Blasio	N/A
John Liu	N/A
Christine Quinn	N/A
Bill Thompson	Thompson will ensure the safety of pedestrians, drivers and cyclists by investing in and fixing our roads. Utility companies that use our streets will stop the cheap patch jobs that turn into potholes months later; the City will employ more durable road surfaces with better material. <sup>49</sup> Thompson also wants to ensure that the Department of Transportation issues permits to do major road closures during off-peak hours.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner supports tax incentives for truck deliveries that would match a proposed city incentive, as well as better enforcement of truck traffic laws.

<sup>47</sup> [http://www.mbpo.org/release\\_details.asp?id=1338](http://www.mbpo.org/release_details.asp?id=1338)

<sup>48</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/mta-chairman-joseph-lhota-city-share-cash-generated-east-side-express-bus-lane-tickets-article-1.1093205>

<sup>49</sup> Id.

	Trucking and Freight Policy
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	N/A
George T. McDonald	N/A

## 5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues

### a. History and Logistics of MTA

The Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) is a public benefit corporation responsible for public transportation in the New York Metropolitan area, serving 12 counties in southeastern New York, along with two counties in southwestern Connecticut under contract to the Connecticut Department of Transportation, carrying over 11 million passengers on an average weekday system wide, and over 800,000 vehicles on its seven (7) toll bridges and two (2) tunnels per weekday.<sup>50</sup> The MTA is the largest regional public transportation provider in the Western Hemisphere. Its agencies serve a region of approximately 14.6 million people spread over 5,000 square miles (13,000 km<sup>2</sup>). MTA agencies now move more than 8.5 million customers per day (2.6 billion rail and bus customers a year) and employ approximately 65,000 workers.

Chartered by the New York State Legislature in 1965 as the Metropolitan Commuter Transportation Authority ("MCTA") it initially was created to purchase and operate the bankrupt Long Island Rail Road. The MCTA dropped the word "Commuter" from its name and became the Metropolitan Transportation Authority ("MTA") in 1968 when it took over operations of the New York City Transit Authority ("NYCTA") and Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority ("TBTA"), now MTA New York City Transit ("NYCT") and MTA Bridges and Tunnels ("B&T") respectively. The agency also acquired through lease the New York State commuter trackage of Penn Central Transportation's Hudson, Harlem and New Haven lines, contracting their subsidized operation to Penn Central, until that company's operations were folded into Conrail in 1976. The MTA took over full operations in 1983, as the Metro-North Railroad.

<sup>50</sup> <http://www.mta.info/bandt/html/btintro.htm>



The MTA has the responsibility for developing and implementing a unified mass transportation policy for the New York metropolitan area, including all five boroughs of New York City and the suburban counties of Dutchess, Nassau, Orange, Putnam, Rockland, Suffolk and Westchester, all of which together are the “Metropolitan Commuter Transportation District (“MCTD”). Thomas F. Prendergast is currently the Chairman and CEO of the MTA. Nuria Fernandez is currently the MTA's Chief Operating Officer (“COO”).<sup>51</sup>

b. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor’s Role

In January 2011, Mayor Bloomberg announced that he would not be an impediment to Governor Cuomo and whatever efforts that the Governor may make to stabilize the finances of the MTA.<sup>52</sup> Currently, the MTA Chair is appointed by the Governor, and the Mayor has a minority of the appointments to the MTA Board, with the majority of members being appointed by the Governor and by county leaders outside the city.<sup>53</sup> Nearly 11 million people use the MTA daily to get in and around the City and questions arise as to whether the Governor and county leaders are in the best position to make decisions when they do not live in the boroughs like the majority of the MTA riding public.<sup>54</sup>

With the central management of the MTA being in Albany, the people that are most often affected by the MTA’s shortcomings have difficulties getting their problems solved fast enough. Areas are constantly rising and bus routes and subway lines often get shut down. Much of this arises from an underfunded MTA.<sup>55</sup> There are two budgets that fund the MTA—the operating and capital budgets.

The operating budget includes the day-to-day costs of running the system -- worker pay and benefits, fuel, etc. The capital budget pays for maintenance and improvements to the system. This includes the new subway cars and buses, station rehabilitations, and big projects like the Second Avenue Subway. The two are related because the operating budget pays for the service you get, while the capital budget dictates the quality of that service. Costs in the operating budget, including health care, insurance, and fuel, have increased in recent years, meaning it costs the agency more to provide the same service. Shortfalls in the capital budget put additional pressure on the operating budget. When the MTA began to seriously rebuild its system in the 1980s, the state, city, and federal government covered large portions of the cost of capital construction. But state and city support has been cut back.<sup>56</sup> For example, the State contributed 19% of the cost of the

---

<sup>51</sup> <http://new.mta.info/mta-news>

<sup>52</sup> <http://www.capitalnewyork.com/article/politics/2012/01/4899808/bloomberg-agrees-grim-assessment-transit-says-hes-done-trying-help->

<sup>53</sup> <http://capitaltonightny.ynn.com/2013/04/quinn-proposes-mayoral-control-of-mta/>

<sup>54</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/quinn-city-run-subway-bus-systems-article-1.1314375>

<sup>55</sup> <http://www.tstc.org/101/mta.php>

<sup>56</sup> <http://blog.tstc.org/2008/08/20/show-us-the-money/>

MTA's first two 5-year construction programs, but less than 8% of the cost of the 2005-09 Program.<sup>57</sup>

c. Service Improvements and Restorations

The MTA's \$40 million operating surplus has led to a debate of the allocation of the available money. The Transport Worker's Union ("TWU") has argued that this one-time windfall should go toward a raise for all unionized employees, and politicians from all over New York are clamoring for a rollback of the 2010 service cuts.<sup>58</sup> Other organizations feel that it should go to other aspects of the MTA.

For example, on June 27, 2010, the MTA instituted what has been called its "Doomsday Budget Cuts," driven by an unprecedented fiscal crisis which led to the agency's implementation of massive bus and subway service reductions, line consolidations and even the elimination of certain bus lines. These cuts have affected virtually everyone, but some passengers protected by the civil rights laws, as well as certain neighborhoods, have felt the pain more than others. New York State Senator Martin J. Golden asked Matthew W. Daus (the author of this report) to arrange for settlement talks with the MTA to attempt to resolve legal claims by passengers who are disabled wheelchair users and senior citizens against the MTA and NYCTA.

In the geographically and demographically unique neighborhood of Bay Ridge, Brooklyn, these plaintiffs, including Jean Ryan, Pamela Talkovsky and Jen Halbert, and many thousands of other affected senior and disabled passengers, have been denied public accommodations, resulting in more unequal service and less access to buses and subways than more ambulatory younger and non-disabled passengers. The plaintiffs commenced a lawsuit that sought an injunction to restore bus line service to various lines in Bay Ridge, so that they may again have access to hospitals, government buildings and various points in Manhattan and beyond. In particular, some of the bus lines involved in the lawsuit include the elimination of x27/x28 weekend express bus service, elimination of the B37 extension to Lutheran Hospital and Downtown Brooklyn, as well as changes to the weekday Midtown/Downtown express bus service and B64 and B16 lines

On Friday, July 1, 2011, in a press conference held in Brooklyn, NY, Matthew W. Daus was joined by New York State Senator Golden, New York City Council Member Vincent Gentile, Assembly Member Nicole Malliotakis, UTRC member and expert witness Professor Jonathan Peters, and the plaintiffs to announce the withdrawal of a lawsuit filed against the MTA, and the restoration of weekday express bus service (x27/x28 and x37/x38 lines) together with the expansion of the Access-A-Ride Taxi Voucher Program to livery cabs in Brooklyn and other boroughs.

The suit was a case of first impression under the State and City Human Rights Laws, where it was alleged that more severe service cuts were made in areas where a very high

---

<sup>57</sup> <http://www.tstc.org/101/mta.php>

<sup>58</sup> <http://secondavenuesagas.com/2013/05/27/an-mta-surplus-and-the-games-politicians-play/> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

percentage of seniors and disabled reside, effectively stranding them while other communities with less seniors and disabled had less cuts.

In May 2013, lawmakers held a rally in Bay Ridge to call on the MTA to restore the B37 bus, a line that was eliminated in 2010. New York State Senator Diane Savino, whose district includes a section of Bay Ridge, told local residents at the rally that she wants to extract a promise from MTA Chairman Thomas Prendergast nominee that he would restore the shuttered bus line and other transit services when he faces the state senate at his confirmation hearing in two weeks. Governor Andrew Cuomo nominated Prendergast to replace Joseph Lhota, the former MTA chairman who is now running for mayor. Savino and other speakers pointed to the fact that the MTA currently has a \$40 million budget surplus as proof that the agency can afford to restore the B37 bus line.<sup>59</sup>

Others argue that the MTA cut the B37 because barely 3,000 people per weekday rode it, and the agency was losing significant money while operating the route. As the MTA addresses this \$40 million surplus, its planners will have to figure out how to boost service without re-implementing too many routes that ran empty or near-empty most of the time.<sup>60</sup> MTA spokeswoman Deirdre Parker said the agency has not yet decided how the \$40 million surplus would be spent or whether it would be used to restore service cuts. In the updated budget laid out this July, the MTA stated that they will increase MetroCard and toll fares again in 2015 and 2017. These hikes are proposed to address long term costs including pensions, healthcare for retirees and debt payments, among other costs. Due to these costs, the MTA needs an additional \$424 million in 2015 from increased mass transit fares and tolls from its bridges and tunnels and another \$469 million from new hikes is necessary in 2017. Even with the increases, the plan predicts a \$335 million deficit in 2015 and another \$403 million deficit in 2017.<sup>61</sup>

#### d. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

In 2009, New York State enacted legislation creating the Metropolitan Commuter Transportation Mobility Tax (“MCTMT”). The tax was imposed on certain employers and self-employed individuals engaging in business within the Metropolitan Commuter Transportation District (“MCTD”). Specifically, the tax applies to (1) employers required to withhold New York State income tax from employee wages and whose payroll expense exceeds \$2,500 in any calendar quarter, and (2) individuals with net earnings from self-employment allocated to the MCTD that exceed \$10,000 for the tax year. The tax proceeds were to be distributed to the MTA to financially support its transportation services. The tax rate is 0.34% of total payroll expenses for employees and self-employed persons within the MCTD.

---

<sup>59</sup> <http://www.brooklynneagle.com/articles/pols-play-hardball-mta-over-third-avenue-bus-2013-05-21-130000> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>60</sup> <http://secondavenuesagas.com/2013/05/27/an-mta-surplus-and-the-games-politicians-play/>

<sup>61</sup> <http://www.metro.us/newyork/news/local/2013/07/24/mta-subway-fare-and-toll-hikes-to-happen-in-2015-and-2017/>

The MCTD includes New York (Manhattan), Bronx, Kings (Brooklyn), Queens, Richmond (Staten Island) Rockland, Nassau, Suffolk, Orange, Putnam, Dutchess, and Westchester counties. The effective date for employers (other than public school districts) was March 1, 2009.

On December 10, 2011, Governor Andrew Cuomo signed into law the MTA payroll tax cut, which created reductions and partially-repealed the original tax. Based on the modifications, small businesses with 25 employees or less, as well as public and non-public schools throughout the entire MCTD, were exempted from the payroll tax as of January 1, 2012. In addition, the payroll tax rate for the seven suburban counties within the MCTD (not including New York City) was reduced to 0.23 percent as of January 1, 2012. The tax was further reduced to 0.12 percent for 2013 and will be completely repealed as of January 1, 2014. For New York City, the tax was reduced to 0.28 percent on January 1, 2013 and will be further reduced to 0.21 percent beginning on January 1, 2014.<sup>62</sup>

In 2010, Nassau County filed a suit against the MTA, alleging that the tax violated the state constitution and did not benefit all of New York State. State Supreme Court Justice Bruce Cozzens Jr. agreed with Nassau County that the tax was illegal.<sup>63</sup> On June 26, 2013, an appellate court ruled that the MTA payroll tax was constitutional, reversing the lower court judge who ruled in favor of Nassau County in the lawsuit seeking to abolish the tax.<sup>64</sup>

As part of an MTA bailout package in 2009, New York State approved a 50-cent surcharge on all metered taxi rides that has been in effect as of November 1, 2009. When New York State approved the street hail livery law in 2011 and amended the law in February 2012, Article 29-A1 of the Tax Law was amended to impose the fifty-cent-per-trip tax on street hail livery vehicle trips that begin in NYC and end anywhere in the MCTD. The fifty-cents-per-trip tax applies to street hail vehicle trips in the same manner as the yellow taxicabs.<sup>65</sup> Street hail livery bases must report and remit taxes for any taxable trips, and also must begin keeping records of trips as soon as any street hail livery vehicle affiliated with the base provides any hail trips.

e. Second Avenue Subway Project

East Side Access is a public-works project being undertaken by the MTA and is designed to bring the Long Island Rail Road into a new East Side station to be built below, and incorporated into, Grand Central Terminal. The new terminal is expected to be operational by 2019. The MTA has been forthcoming with budget information on East

---

<sup>62</sup> <http://www.nysenate.gov/press-release/senate-passes-mta-payroll-tax-repeal>

<sup>63</sup> <http://www.newsday.com/long-island/mta-payroll-tax-constitutional-rules-appellate-court-1.5576775>

<sup>64</sup> <http://www.newsday.com/long-island/mta-payroll-tax-constitutional-rules-appellate-court-1.5576775>

<sup>65</sup> [http://www.tax.ny.gov/pdf/memos/multitax/ml2\\_3m\\_7s.pdf](http://www.tax.ny.gov/pdf/memos/multitax/ml2_3m_7s.pdf)

Side Access. The project will cost more than \$8 billion, which is well beyond initial estimates.

The Second Avenue Subway project will include a two-track line along Second Avenue from 125th Street to the Financial District in Lower Manhattan. It will also include a connection from Second Avenue through the 63rd Street tunnel to existing tracks for service to West Midtown and Brooklyn. Sixteen new ADA accessible stations will be constructed.



The Second Avenue Subway will reduce overcrowding and delays on the Lexington Avenue line, improving travel for both city and suburban commuters, and provide better access to mass transit for residents of the far East Side of Manhattan. Stations will have a combination of escalators, stairs, and in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, elevator connections from street-level to station mezzanine and from mezzanine to platforms.

Under the current plan, the project will be built in four phases. Phase One will include tunnels from 105th Street and Second Avenue to 63rd Street and Third Avenue, with new stations along Second Avenue at 96th, 86th and 72nd Streets and new entrances to the existing Lexington Av/63 Street Station at 63rd Street and Third Avenue.

The first construction contract involves the construction of new tunnels between 92nd and 63rd Streets, the excavation of the launch box for the tunnel boring (TBM) machine at just south of 92nd to 95th Streets, and access shafts at 69th and 72nd Streets. These shafts will be used for the subsequent construction of the 72nd Street station. Contract One is expected to take about 45 months to complete.<sup>66</sup>



---

<sup>66</sup> <http://www.mta.info/capconstr/sas/> (Last visited September

	  <b>MTA Improvements</b>
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese wants to make busing a priority in New York City.
Bill de Blasio	Public Advocate Bill de Blasio, on April 19, 2013, criticized the MTA for cutting off-peak service on the shuttle bus in the Rockaways, while launching a ride from Penn Station to the Hamptons.
John Liu	Mr. Liu supports expanding the MTA's program of offering prepaid debit cards to allow some paratransit customers to use taxicabs instead of vans when possible.
Christine Quinn	Ms. Quinn wants to wrest control of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority from the state government "so New Yorkers are in charge of their own subway system." A more modest proposal from Ms. Quinn includes countdown clocks outside subway stations, displaying train arrival information at street level. <sup>67</sup>
Bill Thompson	Thompson pledged to appoint MTA Board members who are transit activists and more representatives of the riding public.
Anthony Weiner	Mr. Weiner said he would push for majority voting control for the mayor and the city on the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's board of 17 voting members. Mr. Weiner has also called for the installation of cell phone service on every subway platform, which the authority has already planned. <sup>68</sup>

<sup>67</sup> [http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2013/08/27/nyregion/where-the-mayoral-candidates-stand-on-key-issues.html?\\_r=1&&gwh=983F80DCACD09145BA50B4DD34C2F7C5](http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2013/08/27/nyregion/where-the-mayoral-candidates-stand-on-key-issues.html?_r=1&&gwh=983F80DCACD09145BA50B4DD34C2F7C5)

<sup>68</sup> [http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2013/08/27/nyregion/where-the-mayoral-candidates-stand-on-key-issues.html?\\_r=1&&gwh=983F80DCACD09145BA50B4DD34C2F7C5](http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2013/08/27/nyregion/where-the-mayoral-candidates-stand-on-key-issues.html?_r=1&&gwh=983F80DCACD09145BA50B4DD34C2F7C5)

	  MTA Improvements
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota proposed that the City of New York assume control over every bridge and tunnel in the City of New York.
George T. McDonald	N/A

## 6. Transportation Funding

### a. New and Existing Funding Sources

There are funding sources for transportation in New York City on a City, State, and Federal level. New York state transit funding comes from a variety of programs. First, there is the State Transit Operations Assistance (“STOA”) fund, first inaugurated in 1975 and funded with general funding. This funding, also known as section 18-b funding, requires a 100% local match to receive and accounts for about \$224 million of the total of \$3 billion.

Second, the Mass Transit Operating Assistance (“MTOA”) fund was started in 1981 and is divided into two sections: downstate, which is the New York City metropolitan area, and upstate, which is everything else. The downstate part of the fund is funded by a petroleum business tax (“PBT”) which is levied on any company that produces, refines, or imports petroleum for use in the state of New York, a New York MTA Corporate Tax Surcharge, a .25% sales tax in the New York City region, and the Long Lines tax. The upstate part of the fund is only funded by part of the PBT. Note that in New York petroleum is not only used to make gasoline but is also used extensively in electricity generation and home heating.<sup>69</sup>

Third, in 1993 the Mass Transportation Trust Fund was started, which is funded with PBT revenues from the State Dedicated Transportation Trust Fund. The State Dedicated Transportation Trust Fund is split as follows: 63% of highways and bridges, 34% for New York MTA, and 3% for all other transit providers in the state. Two other smaller funds also exist: the State Dedicated Fund (“SDF”), which provides money for capital needs of transit providers other than the New York MTA, and the Omnibus fund, which

<sup>69</sup> [http://publictransport.about.com/od/Transit\\_Funding/a/New-York-State-Public-Transit-Funding.htm](http://publictransport.about.com/od/Transit_Funding/a/New-York-State-Public-Transit-Funding.htm)

provides 50% of the non federal matching fund requirement for federal programs for transit providers other than the MTA. The SDF fund provides about \$21 million per year and the Omnibus provides about \$18.5 million per year. Apart from these two funds New York does not provide dedicated capital funding, which means that the New York MTA has to pay for vehicle purchases and maintenance itself.<sup>70</sup>



Since the 1970's, Federal transportation legislation has mandated that all urbanized areas with a population over 50,000 must have a designated Metropolitan Planning Organization ("MPO") in order to qualify for Federal transportation funding. Created in 1982 as the MPO for New York City, Long Island and the lower Hudson Valley, the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council ("NYMTC") provides a collaborative planning forum to address transportation-related issues from a regional perspective, undertakes studies for transportation improvements, forecasts future conditions and needs; pools the resources and expertise of its member agencies to plan for transportation and development in the region, and makes decisions on the use of Federal transportation funds. The NYMTC region includes New York City, Long Island and the lower Hudson Valley. The NYMTC planning area covers 2,440 square miles and a population of 12.4 million, which was approximately 64% of New York State's population based on the 2010 Census.<sup>71</sup>



---

<sup>70</sup> [http://publictransport.about.com/od/Transit\\_Funding/a/New-York-State-Public-Transit-Funding.htm](http://publictransport.about.com/od/Transit_Funding/a/New-York-State-Public-Transit-Funding.htm)

<sup>71</sup> <http://www.nymtc.org/>



	  New and Existing Funding Sources
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	Albanese proposed a fairer and more equitable tolling formula so that every borough pays its fair share.
Bill de Blasio	Public Advocate Bill de Blasio called for defending the MTA's existing revenue sources (namely the Payroll Mobility Tax, which Governor Cuomo has allowed Senate Republicans to chip away at) and for more federal funding and public-private partnerships.
John Liu	As mayoral candidate John Liu stated transit needs an ongoing revenue stream. Comptroller John Liu also wants more federal funding, as well as more state funding and said landlords should "contribute revenue" to the MTA.
Christine Quinn	Quinn advocated a campaign to get the commuter tax back Quinn during a mayoral forum on transportation hosted by the Transport Workers Union.
Bill Thompson	Thompson stated that we need to fund transit fairly, and it needs to be more affordable with existing dollars.

  New and Existing Funding Sources	
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	Catsimatidis wants an economic stimulus plan, which includes a revival of the 1964 World's Fair, to support construction, the hotel business, and the transportation industry." <sup>72</sup>
Joseph J. Lhota	In his role at the MTA, Lhota noted that the system can't succeed by cutting costs alone.
George T. McDonald	N/A

b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance

The 2013-14 state budget passed in March included an increase of more than \$358 million in operating support for subways, buses and commuter rail—an approximately 9% increase over what the state provided to MTA operations in 2012-2013. The increase exceeded the MTA's budget assumption by \$40 million, largely because transit-dedicated taxes brought in more money than expected due to a recovering economy. Members of the Riders Alliance, along with elected officials, a member of the MTA board and other transit advocates want Gov. Andrew Cuomo and the MTA to use the \$40 million surplus funds from unexpected MTA revenue to create a "Service Restoration and Enhancement Fund," which would be used to restore some of the bus and subway service cut in 2010 and increase existing service further. This group rallied on April 13, 2013 to demand this.<sup>73</sup>

In 2010, the MTA cut service by \$93 million annually to save money, cutting 32 bus routes and reducing or eliminating 3 subway lines. Partial restorations since then have brought back \$29 million in service restorations and new bus routes, but not the rest; meanwhile, according to MTA data released last month, weekday ridership is at its highest level since the year 1950. The Service Restoration and Enhancement Fund could help service the following issues; weekend and off-peak service that was cut in 2010 for

<sup>72</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/12/31/nyregion/supermarket-mogul-considers-running-for-mayor-again.html> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

<sup>73</sup> <http://www.ridersny.org/2013/04/21/servicerally/>

millions of subway riders, who now have longer trips and waits, more crowding and extra transfers; restoring bus service that was cut in 2010 and providing routes to new markets; adding LIRR service at the late shoulder PM rush, where trains are becoming crowded; adding reverse peak/off peak service to meet emerging demand on Metro-North; and expanding CityTicket to all off peak hours on both railroads.<sup>74</sup> The money could also be used for installing security cameras in more stations. Only 111 of the 468 stations have cameras. Outfitting a typical neighborhood station would cost between \$300,000 and \$800,000, the MTA said.<sup>75</sup>

### c. Congestion Pricing

There was a proposed traffic congestion fee for vehicles traveling into or within Manhattan's CBD. The congestion pricing charge was one component of New York City Mayor Michael Bloomberg's plan to improve the city's future environmental sustainability while planning for population growth, entitled PlaNYC 2030: A Greener, Greater New York. As proposed, the congestion pricing zone is defined as the island of Manhattan and the charge would apply on weekdays from 6:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Proposed fees would be \$8 for cars and commercial vehicles and \$21 for trucks entering from outside the zone. Transit buses, emergency vehicles, taxis and for-hire vehicles, and vehicles with handicapped license plates would not be charged the fee. Taxi and livery trips that begin, end or touch the zone would have a \$1 surcharge. Vehicles would be charged only once per day.

The accelerated MTA Capital Plan for 2008-2013 details transit investments that revenue from congestion pricing would pay for. These include 44 subway station rehabilitations, increased bus service, new Bus Rapid Transit service in all 5 boroughs, \$40 million for suburban park and ride facilities, Metro-North and LIRR station rehabilitations, third track work, East Side Access, Second Avenue Subway, and Fulton Street Transit Center, to name a few. The Campaign for New York's Future, a coalition of over 150 civic, business, environmental, labor, community and public health organizations that support the goals and strategic direction of PlaNYC, supported congestion pricing throughout the political discussion. They argued that the plan would reduce road congestion, shorten commutes, reduce air pollution, and raise funds for long-term mass transit upgrades.

New York State Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver opposed the plan, citing several issues. Since motorists would want to avoid the congestion pricing zone, he claimed they would choose to park in neighborhoods just outside the pricing zone. This, in turn, would allegedly create "parking lots" and add more traffic and pollution to those neighborhoods. Secondly, because the plan would reduce traffic in Manhattan's CBD, but, he thought, not necessarily elsewhere, neighborhoods with high asthma rates such as Harlem, the South Bronx, and Bedford-Stuyvesant would not benefit. The installation of cameras for tracking purposes might have raised civil liberties concerns. Silver stopped short of opposing the entire plan, and said he would continue to work toward an agreement.

---

<sup>74</sup> <http://www.ridersny.org/2013/04/21/servicerally/>

<sup>75</sup> <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/mta-40m-unexpected-funds-article-1.1299911#ixzz2Vr6njFQO>

Other opponents argued that the pricing could become a tax on middle- and lower-class residents, since those citizens would be affected the most financially. At the same time, higher-income commuters would not be turned off by paying the charges; thus the fee would not do much to discourage traffic into the congestion area. Assemblyman Richard Brodsky called the proposal a “regressive tax” on the poor and middle class, and harmful to citizens of New York City's outer boroughs.

Keep NYC Congestion Tax Free, a coalition of about 80 civic, business and labor organizations and businesses throughout the New York metropolitan area, proposed non-intrusive, low-cost traffic mitigation measures with some half billion dollars or more in incidental revenues as an alternative to the city's congestion pricing scheme that it argued would also qualify for the federal grant. It also recommended revenue measures that would raise nearly \$1.8 billion to mass transit projects to induce less driving through better transit service. Brooklyn and Queens strongly opposed the bill in the City Council, voting against it by a margin of nearly two to one. Brooklyn specifically becomes geographically isolated without access to its free bridges as Manhattan blocks its access to the mainland. Nonetheless the proposal did not succeed, as it was never put to a vote on the Assembly.

#### d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

As an alternative to the City's congestion pricing plan, the City could institute tolls on the City's free East River Bridges (Brooklyn, Manhattan, Williamsburg, and Queensboro). The City could replicate the MTA's toll, which is collected 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. Tolls would be collected via E-ZPass and license plate recognition, with the toll structure of \$4 each way for E-ZPass users, and \$4.50 each way for cash users.<sup>76</sup>

A toll increase on the free East River Bridges would reduce the “bridge shopping” phenomenon. Drivers would be encouraged to take the most direct route to their destination in Manhattan, thus encouraging a more even distribution of traffic over all East River crossings. This would reduce traffic in neighborhoods like Long Island City and Downtown Brooklyn, which are located near free East River crossings. Drivers who currently use the free bridges would be most affected. These drivers are predominantly from Brooklyn and Queens. Drivers destined to the CBD from the north or from New Jersey would not be affected. East River bridge tolls would reduce congestion and potentially costs to businesses, but would also increase costs for trucks and commercial vehicles using the East River bridges.

---

<sup>76</sup> <https://www.dot.ny.gov/programs/repository/Tolls-on-East-River-Bridges.pdf> (Last visited August 30, 2013)

## **7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

There is often a struggle between the New York City Department of Education and bus drivers between employee protection and lower costs for the City. This struggle dates back to 1979, when a school bus strike arose due to low wages of drivers. This led to the Mollen Agreement, which required all school bus companies that contracted with the Department of Education to have Employment Protection Provisions (“EPP”). EPPs assure that more senior drivers are given priority, as well as protecting drivers’ wages and benefits. The problem with EPP requirements, however, is that they drive up costs for the City, which could contract with bus companies without EPPs for a much lower cost.<sup>77</sup>

Last year, Mayor Bloomberg, in an effort to reduce costs, took away the EPP requirement for bus companies bidding on preschool bus routes, 1,110 routes that were previously required to have an EPP. Mayor Bloomberg contended this would save taxpayers \$95 million over the next five years, and that New York City was the only major American city to require EPPs and have such high costs. After these routes were put up for bid, many bus drivers lost their jobs and many bus companies, who had relied on Department of Education contracts for years, were forced to go out of business. In response, Local 1811 of the Amalgamated Transit Union, a union protecting transit workers, organized a strike in January 2013, lasting for one month. This protest affected more than 150,000 students in New York City, and forced many parents to take time out of work to bring their children to school. Democratic mayoral candidates Christine Quinn, Bill de Blasio, John Liu, and Bill Thompson all signed a letter to Local 1811 president Michael Cordiello stating that if they are elected to office in November, they will revisit the contracts with EPPs that were up for bid. While this may help bus companies bound by EPPs and bus drivers protected by EPPs in November, New York State’s highest court ruled in 2012 that employment provisions such as EPPs were illegal in public contracts on the grounds that they are anti-competitive.<sup>78</sup>

---

<sup>77</sup> <http://www.cnn.com/2013/02/15/us/new-york-school-bus-strike>

<sup>78</sup> <http://www.atu.org/media/news/2013-nyc-mayoral-candidates-pledge-support-for-striking-school-bus-drivers-matrons>

	School Bus Contract/Recent Strike
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	Albanese opposed the NYC DOE contract changes that eliminated the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio opposed the NYC DOE contract changes that eliminated the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.
John Liu	Liu opposed the NYC DOE contract changes that eliminated the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.
Christine Quinn	Quinn opposed the NYC DOE contract changes that eliminated the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.
Bill Thompson	Thompson opposed the NYC DOE contract changes that eliminated the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.
Anthony Weiner	Weiner has been critical of the school bus contract costs, but has not stated if he supports or opposes the Employee Protection Plan for school bus drivers and chaperones.

	School Bus Contract/Recent Strike
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	Catsimatidis stated that he would have taken all measures available to negotiate and avoid the strike.
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota supported the NYC DOE policy of not negotiating with the striking school bus workers.
George T. McDonald	McDonald criticized the bus drivers abandoned special needs students and undermined their safety by choosing to strike.

## **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services**

### **a. Access-A-Ride**

Currently in New York City, the Metropolitan Transportation Authority – New York City Transit (“NYC Transit”) provides paratransit services by administering Access-A-Ride (“AAR”). The AAR service area encompasses the five boroughs as well as a  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile corridor beyond fixed-route service across the NYC borderline into nearby areas of Nassau and Westchester counties. Services are provided by private carriers who contract with NYC Transit and use lift-equipped vans, or sedans. In addition, service is also provided by private taxis, livery and black car services.

There are three services offered: (i) shared-ride (several customers share a vehicle), (ii) door to door and (iii) feeder service, which is offered by both paratransit and public transit. Feeder service refers to a trip in which AAR transports the customer for the first leg of the trip, from the starting point to a fixed-route bus/subway stop. Customers must apply for the service, and if a fixed-route transit bus makes the entire trip, paratransit service will not be provided.

Attention has been given to the potential financial benefits of such integration, and some have estimated that cost-per-trip can be reduced by more than 50% by using yellow taxicabs and livery vehicles instead of the more costly AAR vans. AAR operates 7 days a week, 24 hours a day.

In his New York Times op-ed on January 4, 2012, Matthew W. Daus, former Chairman of the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission from 2001 to 2010 (and the author of this report) opined that a more sensible approach would be to have a small fleet of designated wheelchair-accessible vehicles available through a centralized dispatch system, available 24/7, as part of the region’s mass transit system. It was proposed that the existing van program be converted by the MTA into a system of subsidized door-to-door taxi rides. Access-a-Ride, costs on average \$380 million a year, while an average cost per van ride is between \$30 and \$50. According to Mr. Daus, this could be lowered if the use of vans were replaced with accessible cabs, with an average cost per ride at \$12 to \$15, and passengers would pay \$2.50 a ride, the same cost as a subway trip. The Americans with Disabilities Act, enacted in 1990, exempted taxicabs, however, subsequent federal regulations required cabs for the disabled to provide “equivalent service.” As a result, governments are not required to provide accessible cabs but if they do try to do the right thing through access initiatives, they are open to being sued for discrimination.<sup>79</sup>

There are 14 private carriers that provide the service by sedans or lift-equipped vans. Usually, taxi service is allowed when the vehicle is delayed more than 30 minutes after

---

<sup>79</sup> Op-ed, The New York Times, January 4, 2012, Hailing the Wrong Taxi, Matthew W. Daus, [http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/05/opinion/improving-taxi-service-for-wheelchair-users.html?\\_r=1&pagewanted=print](http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/05/opinion/improving-taxi-service-for-wheelchair-users.html?_r=1&pagewanted=print)



scheduled pickup time and no other accessible car service is available; authorization by an AAR agent is required in order to hail a taxi. The customer is reimbursed the cost of the trip less the full AAR paratransit fare and some restrictions apply (MTA Paratransit, 2013). A trip's maximum ride time depends on trip distance and varies. For example, a trip 0-3 miles long can take 50 minutes, while a trip of more 14 miles can take maximum 2 ½ hours.

While the idea behind Access-A-Ride is well intentioned, its execution does not best serve the market it is trying to reach. To get a ride, one must make a reservation one to two days in advance. That means knowing not only when you'll be ready to set out, but also where your first stop will be, how long it will last, where your second stop will be, how long that will last, and so on. Further, while the MTA has maintained that 95 percent of departures are on time, "on time" means within a half-hour, which is a long time to wait on the sidewalk if the passenger has a serious disability or if it is during inclement weather.<sup>80</sup>

#### b. Accessible Dispatch Program

The New York City TLC launched in September 2012 a program called Accessible Dispatch, providing wheelchair-accessible taxi dispatching services to New York City residents. The Accessible Dispatch program arose from the Accessible Dispatch Pilot Program (the "Pilot Program") which took place from July 2008 to June 2010.<sup>81</sup> The TLC joined the Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities Commissioner, the Mayor's Office of Veterans' Affairs, as well as leaders from the taxicab and transportation industry to welcome this revamped program.<sup>82</sup> The Pilot Program attempted to use a central dispatch system to match passengers who use wheelchairs with accessible taxis.<sup>83</sup> The project tested dispatching technology, measured demand for wheelchair accessible vehicles, and also helped the City determine how to best provide accessible for-hire service.<sup>84</sup> Approximately 5,828 trips were taken throughout the duration of the Pilot Program, serving approximately 2,700 customers.<sup>85</sup> There were an average of 8 trips per day and the average wait time (call to pick-up) for "on-demand" trips was 44 minutes; the median wait time was 29 minutes. The average wait time for "scheduled" trips (schedule pick-up for 30 minutes or more in advance) was 23 minutes; with a median wait time of 10 minutes.<sup>86</sup>

---

<sup>80</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/07/nyregion/07critic.html>

<sup>81</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible\\_dispatch\\_presentation.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible_dispatch_presentation.pdf)

<sup>82</sup> <http://jfactivist.typepad.com/jfactivist/2008/12/nyc-taxi-commission-pilots-accessible-dispatch-program.html>

<sup>83</sup> <http://jfactivist.typepad.com/jfactivist/2008/12/nyc-taxi-commission-pilots-accessible-dispatch-program.html>

<sup>84</sup> <http://jfactivist.typepad.com/jfactivist/2008/12/nyc-taxi-commission-pilots-accessible-dispatch-program.html>

<sup>85</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible\\_dispatch\\_presentation.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible_dispatch_presentation.pdf)

<sup>86</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible\\_dispatch\\_presentation.pdf](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/downloads/pdf/accessible_dispatch_presentation.pdf)

In light of the success of the Pilot Program, the TLC launched the permanent accessible dispatch program on September 14, 2012.<sup>87</sup> The company Metro Taxi, a Connecticut company was awarded the city contract to dispatch 233 NYC accessible taxicabs to locations within Manhattan. Accessible Dispatch is a centralized service providing on-demand transportation 24/7, 365 days a year with no advance reservations necessary.<sup>88</sup> There are multiple ways to book a taxi from Accessible Dispatch. One can call 311, call or send a text message to the dispatch center directly, use their smartphone app, or book online. Reservations do not need to be made in advance, but can be if the customer wishes, that would lead to a lesser wait time. Passengers pay the normal metered taxi fare in New York City from the point of pick-up to destination. There are no extra costs to passengers. All cabs are equipped with GPS, so the dispatch center can effectively manage and monitor the fleet of 233 wheelchair accessible cabs.

## **9. Sustainable Transportation**

### **a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives**

The City Council passed a bill in 2003 requiring the TLC to set aside a proportion of new taxi medallions to be granted to vehicles that use cleaner fuels. The TLC cleared six vehicles for these medallions by mid 2005.<sup>89</sup> As an incentive for fleet owners to buy hybrids, the Commission auctioned in 2004 the first taxi medallions for hybrids at a discounted price of around \$170,000 less than the regular medallion price of \$400,000. In 2006, Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg announced that 254 of the 308 medallions to be auctioned by mid-2006 would be designated for hybrid and alternative-fuel cabs. It has been found, however, that it is very difficult to qualify for the tax credit.<sup>90</sup> As of mid-2009 New York City had reached 2,019 hybrid taxis and 12 clean diesel vehicles, representing 15% of New York's 13,237 taxis in service, the most in any city in North America. As of July 2011, New York City had 4,980 hybrid taxis, representing almost 38% of the city's overall fleet and about 6,000 by September 2012, representing 45% of the taxis in service.<sup>91</sup>

There are many benefits to alternative fueled vehicles, such as low fuel costs and overall benefits to the environment, but there are many legal complications with implementing rules or incentives for taxi drivers and fleet owners to compel them to use these vehicles.

---

<sup>87</sup> [http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/html/news/initiative\\_accessibility.shtml](http://www.nyc.gov/html/tlc/html/news/initiative_accessibility.shtml)

<sup>88</sup> NYC TLC, 2012.

<sup>89</sup> [http://www.nytimes.com/2005/07/27/nyregion/27hybrid.html?scp=6&sq=hybrid%20taxi%20new%20york%20city%20harlem&st=cse&\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2005/07/27/nyregion/27hybrid.html?scp=6&sq=hybrid%20taxi%20new%20york%20city%20harlem&st=cse&_r=0)

<sup>90</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/05/21/automobiles/21TAXI.html?scp=8&sq=hybrid%20taxi%20new%20york%20city%20harlem&st=cse>

<sup>91</sup> <http://wheels.blogs.nytimes.com/2011/07/12/mayor-bloomberg-adds-70-hybrids-and-e-v-s-to-city-fleet/?emc=eta1>

In 2007, Mayor Bloomberg implemented PlaNYC, a plan to improve quality of life for New Yorkers and help combat climate change. PlaNYC is an effort released by New York City Mayor Michael Bloomberg in 2007 to prepare the city for one million more residents, strengthen the economy, combat climate change, and enhance the quality of life for all New Yorkers. The Plan brought together over 25 City agencies to work toward the vision of a greener, greater New York. Since then, significant progress has been made towards the long-term goals set by the Plan. PlaNYC specifically targets ten areas of interest, including transportation. Over 97% of the 127 initiatives in PlaNYC were launched within one-year of its release and almost two-thirds of its 2009 milestones were achieved or mostly achieved. The plan was updated and accelerated in 2011 and has been expanded to 132 initiatives and more than 400 specific milestones for December 31, 2013, which coincides with the end of Mayor Bloomberg's third and final term in office. There are fourteen initiatives for transportation, which are listed under three groups/goals: a) improve and expand sustainable transportation infrastructure and options; b) reduce congestion on roads, bridges and airports; and c) maintain and improve the physical condition of our roads and transit system.<sup>92</sup>

Daniel L. Doctoroff, the deputy mayor for economic development and rebuilding, led the team of experts that developed the plan, which The New York Times called the Bloomberg administration's plan the most far-reaching, and its fate could determine whether the administration will be remembered as truly transformative. One provision of PlaNYC was a requirement that all new taxi vehicles entering the fleet beginning in October 2008 should have a fuel economy of 25 miles per US gallon, rising to 30 miles per US gallon for cars entering the fleet in October 2009.<sup>93</sup> Since hybrid cars were at that time the only vehicles that could meet those fuel standards, it was expected that most of New York's 13,000 taxis would be hybrids by 2012.<sup>94</sup> This plan was set to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 30 percent by 2030.<sup>95</sup> Further, these standards could save tens of thousands of gallons of gas each day in New York City.<sup>96</sup> Also, according to many drivers, customers prefer hybrid cars.

In September 2008, a group of taxi operators sued the city under the allegation that hybrids are not suitable for city taxis and partly based on a report that claimed that "hybrids could not handle 24-hour operation and that air bags might not deploy in taxis that have safety partitions between the driver and passengers."<sup>97</sup> In October 2008 a

---

<sup>92</sup> [http://nytelecom.vo.llnwd.net/o15/agencies/planyc2030/pdf/planyc\\_2011\\_transportation.pdf](http://nytelecom.vo.llnwd.net/o15/agencies/planyc2030/pdf/planyc_2011_transportation.pdf)

<sup>93</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/05/21/automobiles/21TAXI.html?scp=8&sq=hybrid%20taxis%20new%20york%20city%20-harlem&st=cse>

<sup>94</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/04/27/automobiles/27TAXI.html?ei=5124&en=bf63718c21ba02f7&ex=1366948800&partner=permalink&exprod=permalink&pagewanted=all>

<sup>95</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/05/21/automobiles/21TAXI.html?scp=8&sq=hybrid%20taxis%20new%20york%20city%20-harlem&st=cse>

<sup>96</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/05/21/automobiles/21TAXI.html?scp=8&sq=hybrid%20taxis%20new%20york%20city%20-harlem&st=cse>

<sup>97</sup> [http://usatoday30.usatoday.com/news/nation/2008-09-09-1482138991\\_x.htm](http://usatoday30.usatoday.com/news/nation/2008-09-09-1482138991_x.htm)

federal judge blocked New York City from implementing the fuel economy requirement based on the fact that these regulations were pre-empted by the federal laws and regulations that typically regulate fuel economy and emissions standards. At the time of the ruling NYC already had nearly 1,500 hybrids as a result of voluntary efforts, and only a fraction as a result of the medallion incentives.<sup>98</sup>

In March 2009, the TLC enacted a set of incentives to allow taxi fleet owners to charge drivers more to drive hybrid or clean diesel cabs, and penalize fleet owners by lowering the amount they could charge to lease cabs that use more fuel and pollute more.<sup>99</sup> Another suit by taxi owners followed this and these incentives were shut down for the same reasoning as the 2008 case; local governments cannot control fuel emissions. In a federal case brought by taxicab owners and drivers, they successfully challenged the City's plan to enact minimum mileage standard, in part, due to federal preemption.<sup>100</sup> The City appealed the decision, and the case reached the United States Supreme Court, but the justices denied certiorari. There are also some customer complaints about some of the hybrid vehicles. For instance, the step-in height of one of the most popular hybrid, the Ford Escape, is difficult for some passengers to board. Also, legroom in the back is less spacious than the typical Crown Victoria taxi.

#### b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans

In the spring of 2008, the Department of Transportation released Sustainable Streets, the agency's strategic plan, which is part of the above mentioned PlaNYC, which has over 127 overall initiatives. This plan is updated annually, based on the new goals each year in transportation. The overall goals were mobility, safer streets and the reduction of the impact on the global climate. More specifically, the first goals of the plan are as follows; Cutting city traffic fatalities by 50% from 2007 levels, implementing bus rapid transit lines and measures to improve bus speeds city-wide, doubling bicycle commuting by 2015, initiating city-wide parking policies to manage curb space to reduce cruising and congestion, adopting complete-street design templates for reconstruction projects, launching a Main Street Initiative to develop people-friendly boulevards in key corridors across the city, delivering better street surfaces through better management of street cuts and sub-surface infrastructure work, maximizing energy efficiency throughout street lighting and office operations, and retaining and attracting the best transportation engineers, planners and managers.<sup>101</sup>

While 97% of PlaNYC's initiatives have been launched, some have been delayed by either reduction in budget or by lack of federal or state permission.<sup>102</sup> As the above-

---

<sup>98</sup> <http://cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2008/10/31/judge-blocks-hybrid-taxi-requirement/#more-4613>

<sup>99</sup> <http://www.nytimes.com/2009/03/27/nyregion/27taxi.html?scp=14&sq=hybrid%20taxi%20new%20york%20city%20harlem&st=cse>

<sup>100</sup> [http://www.nytimes.com/packages/pdf/nyregion/city\\_room/20081031\\_Crottydecision.pdf](http://www.nytimes.com/packages/pdf/nyregion/city_room/20081031_Crottydecision.pdf)

<sup>101</sup> <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/about/stratplan.shtml>

<sup>102</sup> <http://blog.sprlaw.com/2011/05/nyc-releases-its-april-2011-planyc-update/>

mentioned cases in 2008 and 2010 showed, implementing certain standards in regards to vehicle emissions are set by federal agencies, and are difficult to change on a municipal level.<sup>103</sup>

---

<sup>103</sup> <http://cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2008/10/31/judge-blocks-hybrid-taxi-requirement/#more-4613>

	Sustainability
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Democratic Candidates' Positions</b>
Sal Albanese	Albanese stated that the current path is unfair and unsustainable, with whole neighborhoods stranded without any access to mass transit, while those with access are saddled with higher fares and fewer services.
Bill de Blasio	De Blasio pledged to convene public and private sector actors to expand and deepen PlaNYC, and update the plan every year on Earth Day.
John Liu	Liu has said that a healthy and modernized transit system is New York City's greatest contribution to sustainability. He noted that New York State is dead last in gasoline consumption per capita due to NYC's transit system.
Christine Quinn	Quinn has supported East River ferry service in the already-burgeoning East River communities and their surrounding neighborhoods. She extolled the launch of this much anticipated mass transit option as a responsible, efficient and sustainable way to move people.
Bill Thompson	<p>Thompson pledged to work leading transit advocates to develop a plan to create year-round ferry service to underserved neighborhoods. He vowed to increase night and weekend service to the Staten Island Ferry, find additional means to keep ferry service in the Rockaways by utilizing federal transportation dollars and public-private partnerships.<sup>104</sup></p> <p>Thompson offered to work in partnership with the faith-based community to offer subsidies to acquire parking lot space during weekdays for drivers. Since most services are on weekends, many parking lots go unused during the week and thus can be made available.<sup>105</sup></p>
Anthony Weiner	Weiner supports additional ferry service for Rockaway, Sheepshead Bay, Riverdale, and Harlem as good for the environment and as a means to reduce congestion.

	Sustainability
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Republican Candidates' Positions</b>
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota stated that the future of infrastructure is not about expanding the system, but using the existing system and putting in modern technology so that in the future, we can get more trains on the same track.
George T. McDonald	N/A

## 10. Passenger Rail

### a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak)

Access to the Region's Core ("ARC") was a commuter rail project to increase passenger service capacity on New Jersey Transit ("NJT") between Secaucus Junction in New Jersey and Manhattan in New York City. New infrastructure would have included new tracks, a new rail yard, and a tunnel under the Hudson River. A new station adjacent to New York Penn Station was to be constructed, since running more trains into the current station was deemed not feasible.<sup>106</sup> An estimated budget for the project was \$8.7 billion. Construction began in mid-2009 and the project was slated for completion in 2018, but it was cancelled in October 2010 by Governor of New Jersey Chris Christie, citing the possibility of cost and the state's lack of funds. \$600 million had been spent on the project.

Soon after work was halted there was speculation that the previously discussed idea of New York Transit Authority's 7 Subway Extension continuing into New Jersey would be revived, but was later scuttled. In February 2011, Amtrak announced the Gateway Project, a plan to build a right of way and new tunnels from Newark Penn Station to New York Penn Station, passing through Secaucus Junction, which would be shared with NJT trains. A recent cash infusion of \$185 million will be used to build an 800-foot concrete encasement between 10th and 11th Avenues to preserve the tunnel right-of-way while Manhattan's massive Hudson Yards development project rises. The funds come from the Sandy package, officials say, because the storm showed the vulnerability of Hudson crossings. A full tunnel is likely decades away.<sup>107</sup> The west side of New York has long

been a regional rail bottleneck, and Gateway as planned would more than double trans-Hudson rail capacity. But it could cost upwards of \$13 billion, and so far that funding hasn't been identified. There is also no set timetable for construction.

b. Moynihan Station Development Project

Many officials have called for renovations to be done to New York Penn Station, including expanding and adding tracks to meet increased demands of the aging station. However, significant improvements would require Madison Square Garden – which sits atop Penn Station – to relocate. Specific improvements include an expanded concourse, reconfigured subway entrances and a new ventilation system.<sup>108</sup>

Daniel Patrick Moynihan began advocating for improving Penn Station in the early 1990s. His plan was to build the station in the James A. Farley Post Office. After Moynihan's death in 2003, Senator Charles Schumer and Governor George Pataki renamed the project after Moynihan in his honor and continued to support the project.<sup>109</sup> In 2005, the project was said to have a developer, but Amtrak pulled out of the project leaving New Jersey Transit as the project's main tenant.<sup>110</sup>

All the while, Madison Square Garden planned to wait to make improvements until the Moynihan project was completed. But due to delay and politics, the Garden decided to go ahead with over a billion dollars worth of internal improvements to the arena.<sup>111</sup> Many are pushing to limit the Garden's operating permit to 10 years, which would give them a fair amount of time to relocate. Opponents, however, cite historical significance as well as its recent improvements as a reason to keep the Garden in its place.<sup>112</sup> Fixing Penn Station would be a massive undertaking. In order to add more tracks it would take a significant amount of space and money which would most likely require the Governor and Mayor to go to Washington for funding.<sup>113</sup> Supporters of the project have cited the need to meet increasing demand, and that Penn Station is often overcrowded and operating at more than its legally allowable capacity, as well as fixing the mistake made with the 1963 demolition of the old Penn Station. Supporters also state that currently Penn Station is unpleasant and that improvements would make the station more pleasing to the 600,000 travelers who use the station each day.<sup>114</sup> Still others believe the Moynihan project is not enough. A potential plan, proposed by Governor Andrew Cuomo, would be to repurpose the Javits Center as a new Penn Station, moving the Javits Center to Brooklyn.<sup>115</sup>

Those opposed to the project cite historical significance, impracticality and lack of available funding to undertake the project. As Kathy Wylde, President and CEO of the Partnership for New York City, a nonprofit organization of the city's business leaders, states, "Penn Station clearly is not the first-class facility one would expect in New York. We're all embarrassed about it, but at this point, it's a matter of financial resources."<sup>116</sup> This July, by a vote of 47 to 1, the Council voted to extend Madison Square Garden's special operating permit for one decade — not in perpetuity, as the owners of the Garden had requested, or 15 years, as the Bloomberg administration had intended. Madison Square Garden was given a 10 year deadline to move, so that construction of Penn Station can begin.<sup>117</sup>



## **11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements**

The use of GPS and other technologies in transportation is very important, for customer convenience, safety, and to enforce a fair payment system. One technology already in place is MTA bus time. MTA Bus Time integrates a number of proven technologies to bring real-time information to riders. The result is a system that delivers great results to customers while being highly cost-effective, fast to deploy, simple to maintain and operate, and supports expansions in the future as time and money allow. The two main parts of the MTA Bus Time system are the on-bus hardware and the MTA Bus Time server. The delivery of each of these was tailored to the project's specific needs and to meet the broader MTA's strategic technology goals. In order to continue achieving these goals, the MTA Bus Time system is open to external developers to create their own real-time bus applications using the Bus Time data feed. MTA Bus Time uses GPS technology to let customers learn on their smartphones the distance to the next bus.<sup>118</sup>

In March 2004, the TLC's Commissioners mandated that specific technology based service improvements be implemented in all medallion taxicabs. T-PEP focuses on four areas: automated collection and submission of trip data, the installation of a passenger information monitor (including a passenger information map), incorporating electronic message transmission capability into the taxicab, and finally, the addition of equipment to enable the acceptance of credit/debit cards. T-PEP represents a rare opportunity to significantly improve the riding experience of countless New Yorkers and visitors, as well as for drivers. This technology greatly improved communication between the TLC and its constituents. All medallion taxicabs offer varied payment options for the riding public. The ability to communicate with taxi drivers on a real time basis has enabled the TLC to increase the level of service available to the riding public in groundbreaking ways.

Before T-PEP, drivers were required to maintain a trip-log that details each and every fare that they served. The trip sheet was filled out by hand and stored in paper form. Medallion owners were required to maintain these paper trip sheets for three years. By leveraging state of the art vehicle location technology, the TLC has automated this process. By integrating with the taximeter, the T-PEP equipment automatically captures the pick-up and drop-off location of every fare. Paper trip sheets disappear as the TLC receives the data electronically. The data collected is also more accurate. Another new technology feature is the passenger information monitor (PIM), a flat screen monitor – similar to a laptop screen – that provides information such as news, sports, and weather to the passenger.

There is some concern that the TLC will track drivers, which some cab drivers had opposed, but the TLC has ensured that the technology is primarily used to provide better customer service. The use of GPS for the purpose of enforcement will also help the new HAIL license system, which was just validated by the Court of Appeals, New York's highest court. These new livery hail vehicles, which will also be required to accept credit cards, and are prohibited from performing street hails in parts of Manhattan (south of East 96th Street and West 110th Street) and at the city's airports, where yellow taxis tend to cluster. Although these livery hail vehicles can drop off passengers at these locations,

the city said, their meters, through the use of a GPS device, will not operate if a driver tries to begin a trip within the so-called yellow zone.<sup>119</sup>

	Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements
Candidate	Democratic Candidates' Positions
Sal Albanese	N/A
Bill de Blasio	N/A
John Liu	N/A
Christine Quinn	<p>Quinn said today that, if elected, she would appoint an interagency "Safe Streets Working Group" tasked with cutting traffic fatalities in half by 2021.</p> <p>The news was featured in the transportation section of a mobile app Quinn's campaign released. The app also lays out a few other ideas related to transit and bicycling: installing countdown clocks outside of subway stations, installing MetroCard vending machines above ground at transit hubs along Select Bus Service routes, reducing the amount of time between a bike rack request and its installation, and increasing the amount of bike parking at train stations, bus stops, and ferry landings.</p> <p>Quinn also focused on expanding ferry service, increasing city control of the MTA, rolling out 10 new Select Bus Service routes in the next four years, and an already-planned expansion of Metro-North service through the Bronx to Penn Station.<sup>120</sup></p>
Bill Thompson	Thompson recommended that area airports modernize the local air traffic control system, consider market-based landing fees with peak and off-peak pricing, and explore the capping of flights to prevent delays and save time and money.
Anthony Weiner	N/A

	Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements
Candidate	Republican Candidates' Positions
John Catsimatidis	N/A
Joseph J. Lhota	Lhota noted that the MTA says subway ridership is at its highest level since 1950, and wants to improve service. Lhota advocated using technology to provide riders up-to-the-moment information.
George T. McDonald	N/A

## **12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)**

After Superstorm Sandy, the City of New York needed to update its evacuation plans to better protect citizens from storms like Sandy in the future. June 18, 2013 updated plans were announced. Now there are six evacuation zones instead of three, which now include the residences of 37% of New Yorkers, (adding an additional 600,000 residents), an additional 26 NYCHA developments, four additional hospitals, and nine additional nursing homes. Now, all six Hurricane Evacuation Zones include a total population of 2,990,000 New Yorkers.<sup>121</sup>

The City also released a pamphlet which outlines precautions and guidelines for New Yorkers for future storms. The pamphlet contains details about hurricanes, resources where people can find more information, and a detailed map including the new evacuation zones.<sup>122</sup> The new zones were created in response to the inadequacy of the old plans. As many persons who were told not to evacuate during hurricane Sandy were met with significant hardships.<sup>123</sup>

The City Council just recently pushed legislation that would require the Office of Emergency Management to develop plans around food and water distribution, shelter and outreach to vulnerable New Yorkers who may not evacuate during a storm. One bill mandates a plan to manage transportation problems, such as flooded streets and subway stations. Also, the bill would require installation of a back-up power system to ensure roadways are usable.<sup>124</sup>

**Appendix:**  
**Mayoral Candidate Biographical Summaries & Policy Statements**

(Page left intentionally blank)

Sal Albanese



Sal Albanese- Photo: Facebook

Past Position: Member of the New York City Council from the 43<sup>rd</sup> District (January 1, 1983 – January 1, 1998).

Constituency: Brooklyn's Bay Ridge, Dyker Heights and Bensonhurst.

Date of Birth: August 29<sup>th</sup>, 1949 (age 63)

Place of Birth: Calabria, Italy

Political Party: Democratic Party

Residence: Bay Ridge, Brooklyn

Website: [www.SalAlbanese2013.com](http://www.SalAlbanese2013.com)

Sal F. Albanese<sup>125</sup> was born in Calabria, Italy on August 29, 1949. At eight years old, he moved to Park Slope, Brooklyn, graduating from John Jay High School in 1967. He received his B.A. in Education from CUNY York College in 1972. He earned an M.A. in Health from New York University in 1976 and a J.D. from Brooklyn Law School in 1990. He is also a member of the New York State Bar and holds Series 7 and 63 financial services licenses.

After graduating from CUNY York College, Albanese was a New York City public school teacher for eleven years. In 1982, at the urging of community residents, he ran for City Council and defeated a 21-year incumbent and Republican-Conservative Minority Leader. He won re-election four times, representing the people of southwestern Brooklyn until 1997 when he became a candidate for Mayor of New York City for the first time.

As a Council Member, Albanese was a member of the Public Safety, Education, and Transportation committees. An expert on police issues, he successfully worked with community leaders to put more officers on patrol. He also initiated legislation requiring

police to publish response times to emergency calls and led the successful effort to overhaul the NYPD's antiquated 911 system.

Albanese was the leading advocate for public school accountability and proposed giving parents a formal role in the decision-making process. He crafted laws requiring mandatory drug testing for school bus drivers and fought to transform a struggling high school in his district into the very successful High School of Telecommunications Arts and Technology.

To protect workers and taxpayers in the city contracting process, Albanese introduced the pioneering New York City Living Wage Bill. The Living Wage Bill still protects city contract employees from abuse by setting wage levels that comply with industry standards. It also requires contractors to find savings in management efficiency and services, rather than worker's paychecks.

To ensure that middle class and working people's interests trump special interests, Albanese has been a leading advocate for campaign finance reform and term limits. He was the original sponsor of a campaign finance reform bill that would permanently remove big money from the political process.

Throughout his career, Albanese has been a strong supporter of LGBT rights. He helped pass one of the first bills in the nation that prohibited housing and employment discrimination based on sexual orientation.

For the past fifteen years, Albanese has worked in the private sector in the legal and financial field. For the last nine years, he worked for Mesirow Financial and held the title of Managing Director. Albanese lives in Bay Ridge, Brooklyn with his wife of 40 years, Lorraine. They have two daughters.

### ***Political Career***<sup>126</sup>

In 1978, Albanese ran for New York Assembly 50, where he lost with only receiving 44.25%. Four years later in 1982, he ran again, but this time for New York City Council 31 where he won with 51.43%. Three years later he won re-election with 60.52%. In 1989, the New York City Council 31 held a D Primary, which Albanese won with 99.35%; two months later, he won re-election with 62.91%. In 1991, Albanese transitioned from District 31 to District 43 after seven years. He ran for New York City Council 43 and won with 50.69%. Only a year later, Albanese attempted to transition again to District 13, however he lost, having only received 38.24% of the vote. The following year however, in 1993, Albanese returned once again to District 43 where he won with 55.81%. He served District 43 for the next four years until 1997 when he first ran for New York City Mayor. In the Primary election, he lost, having only received 21.02% of the votes, however in the actual election, he lost after receiving only 1.05% of all votes. The results of the 2013 Mayoral Primaries are yet to be available.

As a Council Member, Albanese was a member of the Council's Public Safety, Education, and Transportation committees. He drafted laws requiring mandatory drug



testing for school bus drivers and overhauled the previously-failing High School of Telecommunications.<sup>127</sup>

He was credited with increasing police presence in under-patrolled neighborhoods through community policing.<sup>128</sup> He also initiated legislation requiring police to publish response times to emergency calls and led a successful effort to update the City's antiquated 911 system.<sup>129</sup> Despite objections from Mayor Rudy Giuliani, Albanese passed the New York City Living Wage Bill in 1996, which “required some city contractors to pay higher minimum wages to their employees.”<sup>130</sup> He was also the original sponsor of a Campaign Finance Reform Bill, stating that “If the present system stays in place, you will continue to have a city run for a few wealthy interests and by big business.” He famously voted against the proposed 1995 and 1996 budgets, arguing that they “balanced the budget on the backs of the middle class, poor, elderly and the youth of this city.”<sup>131</sup>

In 2008, Albanese was part of then-Senator Barack Obama's New York delegation to the Democratic National Convention.<sup>132</sup>

Albanese opened a campaign committee for Mayor of New York City on December 14, 2012.

### **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

“New York City's mass transit system has enabled a few small cities to become five united boroughs. It has fueled economic growth in each one. Millions of New Yorkers depend on it to get home, to the doctor, to visit family, and to do business. But a dysfunctional government has let it fall behind. Whole neighborhoods have been left without any access to mass transit, while those that have it are saddled with higher fares and fewer services. It's simply not fair. We can and we must do better. The greatest city in the world deserves the world's greatest transit system.”<sup>133</sup>

If elected Mayor of New York City, Albanese's plan includes:

- Writing a fairer and more equitable tolling formula so that every borough pays its fair share.
- Finally putting the transit system on solid financial footing with new sources of revenue and smarter spending.
- Launching a series of enhancements to our highways and roads to improve the flow of commercial traffic across the city.
- Increasing cost-saving ferry service to areas lacking in mass transit options.
- Lobbying aggressively for city control of the mass transit system, and giving the reins back to leaders who must answer to New York City residents.<sup>134</sup>

## **1. Bicycle Use in New York City**

### **a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

Sal Albanese: “They are a positive thing overall, but I do believe that you need more community input before you install them. I’ve had people tell me that the city rammed the bike lanes down their throats and no one consulted with them. Getting people on bikes is a good thing. You want to get people out of their cars as much as possible. I do think there is room for growth.”<sup>135</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

Sal Albanese: “Every New Yorker deserves to be able to get where they need to go as rapidly as possible, no matter how they travel. In cities that we compete with, like London, entire taxi fleets are accessible to disabled riders. While the United States’ accessibility laws are more stringent, that is no excuse for New York City to lag behind. Unfortunately, retrofitting our existing fleet or undoing Mayor Bloomberg’s “Taxi of Tomorrow” design would cost millions of dollars that are better used by other programs that empower the disabled. The next round of new vehicles, however, must be accessible. Had I been in Bloomberg’s shoes, I would have committed to a firm deadline for phasing in an all-accessible fleet. Taxis aren’t the end-all, be-all of transportation. It’s absurd that less than 25 percent of subway stations are wheelchair-accessible. Entire communities, especially the elderly or disabled, are denied access to our subway system. I’m advocating city control of the mass transit system, which would finally allow disabled New Yorkers to hold their local elected officials accountable and put accessibility at the top of the agenda.”<sup>136</sup>

### **b. Smartphone Apps – N/A**

## **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A**

### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service**

Albanese has the most specific proposal, calling for 20 new Select Bus Service routes by 2018.<sup>137</sup>

Transportation by bus:<sup>138</sup> Every day, more than 2 million people ride buses in New York City. For many seniors, disabled riders, and students, buses are the only way to get from point A to point B. Unfortunately, these lifelines have been slashed drastically in recent years, and our Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system lags far behind other world cities. The success of BRT globally and on the few routes we have in New York City is evidence enough that these “subways on the streets” are key to the future of mass transit.

As Mayor, I will embrace that future and make busing a priority in New York City. I will:

- Launch an unprecedented expansion of the wildly-successful Select Bus Service by adding 20 more routes by 2018.

- Restore local and express bus services cut in 2010, which generated little savings for the MTA at enormous costs to transit-starved neighborhoods.

- c. Livery Street Hails – N/A

#### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

- a. Curb-Space Allocation

The transit issue that the mayor can control most directly is the allocation of street space. How much real estate should be dedicated exclusively to transit, so riders don't get bogged down in traffic? More than anyone else, the mayor has the power to decide.

At the Mayoral Forum, on the Prospect Park West Bike Lanes:<sup>139</sup>

“The question of the Prospect Park West bike lane, posed by WNYC’s Andrea Bernstein at the Park Slope mayoral forum on Monday, may have been intended as red meat. But it’s also a serviceable litmus test. If a candidate can’t get behind one of the city’s premiere cycling facilities, which grew from the grassroots and transformed a dangerous speedway into a humane neighborhood street, it’s a pretty good indication as to where that candidate stands on the issue of street safety in general. So congratulations to Sal Albanese for setting himself apart from a pack of know-nothings and fence-sitters.”

- b. Parking Policy –N/A

- c. Pedestrian Plazas

Sal Albanese plans to design safer and smarter streets by expanding bike lanes, pedestrian plazas, and mass transit options.<sup>140</sup>

- d. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A

#### **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

- a. Service Improvements and Restorations

As Mayor, I will embrace that future and make busing a priority in New York City, I will:<sup>141</sup>

- Launch an unprecedented expansion of the wildly-successful Select Bus Service by adding 20 more routes by 2018.

- Restore local and express bus services cut in 2010, which generated little savings for the MTA at enormous costs to transit-starved neighborhoods.

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

Former New York City Councilman turned Mayoral candidate, Sal Albanese, is currently in support of a plan introduced to the New York State Democrats Assembly by current Mayor, Michael R. Bloomberg, which originally failed however, to get the backing of the assembly due to the fact that the plan would introduce tolls on East River bridges, yet not lower any tolls elsewhere. Albanese hopes that, if elected, he will be able to gain the support of the Assembly by re-introducing that same plan with an important adjustment. Albanese's plan suggests introducing tolls to the East River bridges just like Bloomberg's, however Albanese will use the new toll income to lower the toll prices of other popular bridges, such as the Verrazano Bridge which connects Staten Island to Brooklyn, making it the only way Staten Island residents can reach the rest of the city using their cars.<sup>142</sup>

c. Second Avenue Subway Project – N/A

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role

"I also plan to lobby the legislature to let NYC control its transit system. We should not have this amorphous agency called the MTA, which isn't transparent, overseeing the city's most vital services. I will also organize Mayors for Mass Transit, uniting Mayors across the country to lobby Washington to better fund mass transit. We have to keep it affordable and safe, and that takes resources."<sup>143</sup>

## 6. Transportation Funding

a. New and Existing Funding Sources

As Mayor, Sal Albanese plans to put the transit system on solid financial footing with new management, new sources of revenue, and smarter investing, including:<sup>144</sup>

- Lobby aggressively for city control of the mass transit system, ending an era of buck-passing and giving the reins back to city and borough leaders who must answer to New York City residents.
- Direct 2/3 of the estimated \$1 billion in new revenue from equitable tolling, the elimination of the parking rebate, and vehicles-for-hire surcharges to fund mass transit. Direct the remaining 1/3rd to maintaining roads and bridges. Safe bridges and tunnels are essential to drivers and mass transit riders alike.
- Explore and implement value-capture mechanisms, like negotiated contributions from developers and tax increment financing, which prioritize funding for mass transit. Example: if a development adds significant transit congestion but limited vehicle congestion, the developer could contribute funds to the addition of a new bus route in the area instead of unused parking spaces.

b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance

Fair Tolling Plan: "... would generate \$1 billion in revenue. \$750 million of that would go to mass transit; the rest to infrastructure for roads and bridges."<sup>145</sup>

c. Congestion Pricing

Mayoral candidate Sal Albanese has never before played a crucial role in terms of putting in place a congestion pricing plan, however, recently Albanese expressed his support for the Fair Toll Plan; the first re-visitation of any kind of congestion pricing or congestion control plan since 2008 when Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg failed to gain enough support for his own congestion pricing plan.<sup>146</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

Currently, Sal Albanese contends, drivers pay high tolls where there are limited mass transit options, such as Staten Island, the Rockaways, and other parts of Queens, Brooklyn, and the Bronx. Meanwhile, drivers who have multiple alternatives pay nothing to enter the most congested parts of New York City. Mr. Albanese believes that this makes no sense. Adding insult to injury, the free East River Bridges draw huge numbers of commercial vehicles and drivers looking to avoid tolls, directing them onto our city streets rather than our highways. He observed that some of our neighborhoods have to battle clogged and dangerous roads all day, every day, as a result.<sup>147</sup>

We need to write a sensible formula that implements tolls in areas where congestion is high and mass transit options are plentiful while reducing tolls in areas where options are limited. This is both fairer and better for business. Smarter tolling will reduce congestion, cut travel time on our streets, and dramatically improve the flow of commercial goods through the city.

As Mayor, Mr. Albanese promised to break the political gridlock by finally putting fair tolling in place by:

- Create performance-driven tolling, lowering prices during off-peak periods.
- Significantly reduce tolls on the Verrazano, Gil Hodges, Throgs Neck, Cross Bay, Whitestone, and RFK bridges.
- Implement open tolling systems on the East River bridges, with discounts for vehicles-for-hire and certain commercial vehicles and trucks.
- Eliminate the parking tax rebate south of 86th Street in Manhattan, which rewards car ownership where mass transit is most plentiful.
- Create a surcharge on vehicles-for-hire that travel below 86th Street in Manhattan.

## **7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

Former City Councilman and current candidate for mayor Sal Albanese, the only former public school teacher in the Democratic field, released the following statement on the breakdown of talks between the NYC teachers union (the “UFT”) and the City’s Department of Education.<sup>148</sup>

“Enough already! Mayor Bloomberg, Tweed officials, and UFT negotiators had a year to get this deal done, and they failed. This is an unmitigated disaster. Amid a bus strike that's affecting 150,000 of our most vulnerable students, this just adds insult to injury. If we can't afford to invest in early childhood and after school programs, how can we afford to throw \$250 million out of the window like this?”

“Unfortunately, I can't say I'm surprised. After years of demonizing teachers and ignoring parents, the administration has proven itself unwilling and unable to lead meaningful negotiations. As a former public school teacher with two daughters who currently teach, I know firsthand how a counterproductive environment like that negatively impacts the classroom. Teachers need better recruitment, training, and support, not a nose turned up at them.”

“If I was Mayor, it never would have gone this far. I would have been in that room myself, and no one would have left until a deal was done. The fact that all parties are now crafting media spin instead of a contract is further evidence that political dysfunction is keeping this great city from getting the job done for its students.”

On Feb. 15, 2013, a deal, apparently brokered by ATU International President Larry Hanley, was announced in a statement released by five Democratic candidates for the mayoral election in November 2013. Candidates Christine Quinn, Bill Thompson, John Liu, Bill de Blasio, and Sal Albanese asked the ATU to end the strike and pledged to “revisit” the issue if one of them is elected mayor. The pledge avoided embracing the EPP demand by name, while warning the ATU that all decisions will be “fiscally responsible,” that is, maintaining the threat of lowered wages and benefits for workers.<sup>149</sup>

## **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services)**

In response to a question asking about making New York more handicap accessible: “That's a great question, Katrina. I'm going to do everything that I can to make sure that we're thinking about New Yorkers with disabilities when we make policies. I want a universally-accessible taxi fleet. London has one. We're the leading city in the world, and we should, too! I'll also create an emergency evacuation plan that actually considers disabled New Yorkers, who were essentially abandoned during Hurricane Sandy.”<sup>150</sup>

## **9. Sustainable Transportation**

### **a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives – N/A**

b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans

Mr. Albanese believes our current path is simply unfair and unsustainable. Whole neighborhoods have been stranded without any access to mass transit, while those that have access are saddled with higher fares and fewer services. As a result, our economy, our communities, and our position as a global capital are suffering.<sup>151</sup>

“We can, and we must, do better. The world’s greatest city deserves the world's greatest transit system. As Mayor, I plan to deliver just that. My vision for transportation will revolutionize the way we move people and goods around the city and restore New York City’s place as the most forward-thinking transit city in the world.”

The plan can be seen at: <http://www.salalbanese2013.com/transportation-plan>

***10. Passenger Rail***

- a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) – N/A
- b. Moynihan Station Development Project – N/A

***11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements*** – N/A

***12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)*** – N/A

## John Catsimatidis



Self-Portrait, 2011

Past Position: C.E.O. of the Red Apple Group and Gristedes

Date of Birth: September 7<sup>th</sup>, 1948 (age 64)

Place of Birth: Nisyros, Greece

Political Party: Democratic Party

Residence: Upper East Side, Manhattan

Website: [www.cats2013.com/](http://www.cats2013.com/)

### ***Early Life***

Catsimatidis grew up in New York City after coming to the United States as an infant with his parents from the island of Nisyros, Greece. He graduated from Brooklyn Technical High School in 1966. While pursuing a BS in electrical engineering at New York University (NYU), Catsimatidis worked for an uncle in a small supermarket on 137th Street. Catsimatidis ultimately dropped out of college, and in 1971, convinced he could make money in the grocery business, he opened his first store on Manhattan's Upper West Side at 99th Street and Broadway under the name “Seven Eleven” (unrelated to 7-Eleven). Soon afterwards he opened a Red Apple supermarket on 87th Street just west of Broadway.<sup>152</sup>

### ***Aviation***

A certified jet pilot, Catsimatidis has been involved in the airline industry since the early 70's. His holdings in the aviation industry have included a fleet of leased commercial aircraft operated as C&S Acquisition and Capitol Air Express. His corporate jet company, United Air Fleet, operated as many as forty corporate aircraft.<sup>153</sup>



### ***Red Apple Group***<sup>154</sup>

In 1986 the Gristedes supermarket chain was acquired by the Red Apple Group. Gristedes was founded in 1888 by brothers Diedrich and Charles Gristede. There are over 30 stores in the chain operating throughout Manhattan and a single store in Brooklyn and Scarsdale.

In 1987, Catsimatidis purchased United Refining Company of Warren, PA., a company founded in 1902, for \$7.5 million after the company had declared Chapter 11 bankruptcy proceedings and was in danger of liquidation under \$120 million of debt. Operated as a subsidiary of Red Apple Group, United, as of December 2012 filed annual profits of \$190 million, currently employs over 4,000 people and the refinery processes 70,000 barrels of oil a day providing fuel to the company's 375 Kwik Fill/Red Apple food marts and gas stations, as well as associated motels and truck stops, in New York, Pennsylvania, and Ohio.

In October, 2009, Forbes Magazine reported that United Refining Energy Corp., a publicly traded special purpose acquisition company (SPAC) sponsored by United Refining, was purchasing “privately held Chaparral Energy in a deal worth roughly \$1.6 billion.” However, United Refining Energy Corp. shareholders did not approve the deal and it was terminated in December 2009. As of November 2012, the Red Apple Group ranked 97th on Forbes list of largest private companies with revenue of \$4 billion and 8,000 employees. (This compares to its 2008 and 2009 rank, both at #100, 2010 at #78, and 2011 at 98th).

### ***Charitable Involvement***

Catsimatidis' charitable interests are largely centered in his Greek roots, such as the Hellenic Times Scholarship Foundation and the Greek Orthodox Church where he served as President of the Archdiocesan Council of the Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America. However, he is a large donor to the G&P Foundation for Cancer Research. Catsimatidis has served on the Board of Directors of the Police Athletic League of New York City since the 1980s, and on the Board of Directors of the Drum Major Institute since 2002. He was the Vice-chairman of the Ellis Island Awards Foundation, of the National Ethnic Coalition Organization (NECO), and is co-founder of the Brooklyn Tech Alumni Foundation. This foundation has a \$10 million endowment and the first foundation in the country established on behalf of a public school.

### ***Political Affiliations***

He has made donations to Democratic Party and Republican Party campaigns, and helped run a fund-raiser in 2006 with New York City Mayor Bloomberg for Joseph Lieberman. This was for Lieberman's run as an Independent after losing the Connecticut Democratic Party primary for the U.S. Senate.

## ***Personal Finances***

As per the Forbes' Magazine's list "The World's Billionaires", published in March, 2013, Catsimatidis ranked #458 with a net worth of \$3.0 Billion (up from #634 and 2.0 billion the previous year). Similarly, as per the magazine's list of "The Richest People in America" (Sept, 2012), Catsimatidis ranked number 132 with a substantially increased net worth of \$3 billion.

## ***Aborted NYC Mayoral Run 2009***

Previously a Democrat (during the Bill Clinton administration), John Catsimatidis was reportedly going to make a bid in the New York City mayoral election in 2009 as a Republican. He planned to self-fund his campaign. In media interviews during the fall of 2007 and again during an interview with Steve Forbes in March 2009, he repeatedly confirmed his mayoral candidacy. However, once Mayor Bloomberg successfully changed the "term limits" law so that he could run for a third term, Mr. Catsimatidis quietly withdrew.

## ***NYC Mayoral Run 2013***

During the spring of 2012, Catsimatidis described his dismay over the quality of the announced as well as the presumed candidates. He suggested that he would support NYC Police Commissioner Ray Kelly, but as Kelly has repeatedly denied any intention to run, Catsimatidis has expressed his own interest. On December 4, 2012, the NY Post reported that Catsimatidis had "set up an exploratory committee to consider running for mayor." A similar piece, including an interview, appeared in the NY Times of December 31, 2012. He also filed paperwork with NYC's Campaign Finance Board on January 3, 2013. On January 14, 2013, he told the NY Post that he had just written his own check for one million dollars to seed his campaign. He made his official announcement at City Hall on January 29, 2013. During which, he said, "I'm not a Mike Bloomberg billionaire. I'm not wearing a \$5,000 suit." In early March, 2013, he began airing advertisements on the radio.

## **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

### **1. Bicycle Use in New York City**

#### **a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

"I have to see it, but right now, I think we should not block our streets," said John Catsimatidis.<sup>155</sup>

"I think Mayor Bloomberg is getting overzealous," Catsimatidis says. "I hate those bicycle lanes... But overall Mayor Bloomberg has done a great job. What I would do through the education process is teach the kids about nutrition while they're in school. I went to the movies a few weeks ago and I looked up at the board and it said a big Coca-

Cola was 1,100 calories. Telling kids what they should eat and shouldn't eat I think is a better way.”<sup>156</sup>

“One of those things I don't like are those bicycle lanes,” Catsimatidis said, saying that bicycles in the city impede traffic and present a safety hazard.<sup>157</sup>

Catsimatidis clarified his comments to the NYCity News Service after a debate, saying that he was not against bicycles, and presented a solution: “We could make one bike lane on the east side and one on the west side.” He said he has seen people get out of taxis and almost get run over by bicycles, and that removing the bicycles was the way to keep people safe. “It's common sense,” he said.

John Catsimatidis: “I hate them. I don't think they serve a lot of purpose. They cause more problems than they solve. You have thousands of cars stuck in traffic and four bicycles going by. It makes no sense. Unless someone convinces me otherwise, I would reduce them or get rid of them completely.”<sup>158</sup>

Asked if the number of bike lanes in the city would increase, decrease or remain the same under his administration Catsimatidis said that “the way the bike lanes were put in was wrong” and took issue with the “concrete barriers” that border some of them -- presumably the dividers that accompany some create protected lanes. He said they had caused problems for fire trucks and ambulances responding to emergencies; the city has dismissed similar criticisms as unfounded in the past.<sup>159</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

- a. The Taxi of Tomorrow – N/A
- b. Smartphone Apps – N/A

## **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

- a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A
- b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service – N/A
- c. Livery Street Hails

At the CUNY mayoral candidate transportation forum, Mr. Catsimatidis was asked how he would expand or improve taxi service outside Manhattan in his response he touched on bus rapid transit, a revamped network of deputy mayors and his belief that each borough requires affordable transportation options. He did not mention taxis.<sup>160</sup>

#### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

##### **a. Curb-Space Allocation**

All mayoral candidates but Republican John Catsimatidis assured the audience that they believed in climate change, thought the next mayor should take measures to reduce the number of cars entering Manhattan below 59th Street, and would like to see an increase in bicycle commuting.<sup>161</sup>

##### **b. Parking Policy – N/A**

##### **c. Pedestrian Plazas – N/A**

##### **d. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A**

#### **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

##### **a. Service Improvements and Restorations**

Asked to name one thing he would do as mayor to improve subway service, Catsimatidis response was “one word: monorail. Its slogan: “Not subway, above-way.” Mr. Catsimatidis, arguing that elevated transit systems have proved economical in other cities, said “there is no reason we can't look into those types of projects” in New York. At a candidate forum in June, Mr. Catsimatidis said he imagined a monorail running alongside the Long Island Expressway.<sup>162</sup>

##### **b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge**

Again, focusing on toll prices rather than the actual fare prices that the MTA charges, Mayoral candidate John Catsimatidis uses the toll price of the Verrazano Bridge as an example. In an interview with Castimatidis,<sup>163</sup> he explains how the Mayor needs to have a much more direct role in the operations of the MTA. He explains how the toll price for the Verrazano Bridge in 1998 was \$4.00, whereas now it is \$15.00; representing a 400 % increase in about 12 years; a number which Catsimatidis finds to be worrisome. He also noted that the MTA raises toll prices in order to raise funds to distribute in its sole discretion, which he finds to be unacceptable.

“You should have put your foot down and said, no increases and that’s what you call leadership,” John Catsimatidis directed to Joseph Lhota. Lhota dismissed the statement as a “cheap shot.”<sup>164</sup>

##### **c. Second Avenue Subway Project – N/A**

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role

"I think the problem is the MTA, and we have to find a way to fix it. I gave a press conference by the Verrazano Bridge. Their tolls went from like \$4.00 in 1998 to \$15.00. That's a 400 percent increase in 12 years! That is ridiculous. What they're doing is taking the money from the people of Staten Island and Brooklyn and diverting it someplace else that they want. I think the mayor has to have a bigger say in how the MTA runs in the five boroughs, because we can't have people take advantage of our citizens and divert the money to places we don't know."<sup>165</sup>

6. Transportation Funding

a. New and Existing Funding Sources

His economic stimulus plan includes a revival of the 1964 World's Fair, whose iconic globe logo he once included on a custom-made necktie, an annual gift to family and friends. "The construction business will do well, the hotel business will do well, the taxi business would do well," he said of the fair. "Everybody's going to do well."<sup>166</sup>

b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance – N/A

c. Congestion Pricing

Catsimatidis also said he voted against congestion pricing, though it's unclear where that vote would have taken place.<sup>167</sup>

At a Park Slope civic council candidate forum, Mr. Catsimatidis rebuffed the idea of congestion pricing as a formula intended to encourage people using mass transit, coming in to the city. "I voted against congestion pricing. I was against congestion pricing," Mr. Catsimatidis said when asked whether he supports Mayor Bloomberg's idea of congestion pricing. "I don't think we should penalize people coming from the outer boroughs to New York."

"If people want to drive, God bless them. That's what America is all about... I grew up on 135th street, and I wanted to work hard. You know why I wanted to work hard? So I can buy a car. And you know what car I wanted to buy? I wanted to buy a GTO. Why? Because I wanted to. I worked hard and Americans work hard. They should have the ability to do what they want to do," he added.<sup>168</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels) – N/A

7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)

Catsimatidis admitted that he considers himself a "union guy," from his days as a member, and said that, if he were mayor, he would have been able to reach deals with the teachers' and bus drivers' union on a teacher evaluation system and new contracts to avert the school bus strike.<sup>169</sup>

The key, he said, is locking both sides in a room with pizza and not letting them out. “By four in the morning... after you eat the third pie of pizza, boy you get more reasonable,” he said.

8. **Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services** – N/A

9. **Sustainable Transportation**

a. **Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives**

“Catsimatidis is the only candidate who does not believe in global warming.”<sup>170</sup>

b. **Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans** – N/A

10. **Passenger Rail**

a. **ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak)** – N/A

b. **Moynihan Station Development Project** – N/A

11. **Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements** – N/A

12. **Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)** – N/A

## Bill de Blasio



### Past/Current Position(s):

- NYC Public Advocate (incumbent)
- Council Member of the 39<sup>th</sup> District
- Member of Community School Board 15 and
- Regional Director for U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development

Date of Birth: May 8, 1961 (age 52)

Place of Birth: Manhattan, New York City

Political Party: Democratic Party

Residence: Park Slope, Brooklyn

Website: [www.billdeblasio.com](http://www.billdeblasio.com)

### *Early Career*

De Blasio's introduction to City politics came during David Dinkins' 1989 mayoral campaign, for which he was a Volunteer Coordinator. Following the campaign, de Blasio served as an aide in City Hall. De Blasio was elected to the New York City Council in 2001, and was subsequently re-elected in 2003 and 2005 to represent District 39, which includes the Brooklyn neighborhoods of Borough Park, Carroll Gardens, Cobble Hill, Gowanus, Kensington, Park Slope, and Windsor Terrace. In the Council, de Blasio chaired the Committee on General Welfare, and is a member of the Education, Environmental Protection, Finance, and Technology in Government Committees. On the City Council, de Blasio passed legislation to prevent landlord discrimination against tenants who hold federal housing subsidy vouchers, and helped pass the HIV/AIDS Housing Services law, improving housing services for low income New Yorkers living with HIV/AIDS. As head of the City Council's General Welfare Committee, Bill helped

pass the Gender-Based Discrimination Protection law to protect transgendered New Yorkers, and passed the Domestic Partnership Recognition Law to ensure that same sex couples in a legal partnership could enjoy the same legal benefits as heterosexual couples in New York City. During his tenure, the General Welfare Committee also passed the Benefits Translation for Immigrants Law, which helped non-English speakers access free language assistance services when accessing government programs. In 1999, he was elected a member of Community School Board 15. In 1997, he was appointed to serve as the Regional Director for the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (“HUD”) for New York and New Jersey under the administration of President Bill Clinton. As the tri-state region’s highest-ranking HUD official, de Blasio increased federal funding for affordable and senior-citizen housing. He was tapped to serve as campaign manager for Hillary Rodham Clinton's successful United States Senate bid in 2000.

### ***2009 Campaign for Public Advocate***

In November 2008, he announced his candidacy for Public Advocate, entering a crowded field of candidates vying for the Democratic nomination which included former Public Advocate Mark J. Green. The New York Times endorsed de Blasio in an editorial published during the primary, praising his efforts to improve public schools and “help many less-fortunate New Yorkers with food stamps, housing, and children's health” as a Councilmember. The editorial went on to declare de Blasio the best candidate for the job “because he has shown that he can work well with Mayor Bloomberg when it makes sense to do so while vehemently and eloquently opposing him when justified”. On September 15, 2009, he came in first in the Democratic primary with 33% of the vote, and then won the run-off election on September 29, 2009 with 62%. His candidacy was endorsed by then Public Advocate Betsy Gotbaum, former Mayor Ed Koch, former Governor Mario Cuomo, and Reverend Al Sharpton. On November 3, 2009, he defeated Republican Alex Zablocki with 77% of the vote in the general election.

## **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

### ***1. Bicycle Use in New York City***

#### ***a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes***

Public advocate Bill de Blasio has said that while he, too, favors bike lanes, Mayor Bloomberg has not been pro-active enough in reaching out to different communities.

“Where bike lanes have worked, he said, “great, let’s keep them,” but “where they haven’t worked, let’s revise them or change them.” He also suggested that the city should consult “actual evidence not biased evidence” in appraising the effectiveness of its lanes.

De Blasio, meanwhile, has refined his bike lane stance, sending out a more recent statement insisting, “I fully support bike lanes and I want to see them continue to expand around the city. They are clearly making many NYC streets safer. But I think we need to take an approach different from the Mayor’s. While more and more communities and



riders want bike lanes, the City still hasn't come around to proactively engaging those who are concerned by them.”<sup>171</sup>

De Blasio said he would expand bike lanes and bike sharing, with a goal of raising the percentage of city trips taken by bike to 6 percent by 2020. The enthusiastic embrace of cycling represents a shift -- at least in tone -- for Mr. de Blasio, who once called the city's bike-friendly transportation commissioner, Janette Sadik-Khan, a radical.<sup>172</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

Now that the city has given Nissan a \$1 billion contract to manufacture New York's "Taxi of Tomorrow," public advocate and likely 2013 mayoral candidate Bill de Blasio has launched an offensive against the automaker for doing business with Iran. Mr. de Blasio sent out a statement and a string of Tweets demanding the car company stop selling its wares to the Iranian regime.<sup>173</sup>

"You cannot do business with the people of New York City with one hand, and prop up the dangerous regime in Tehran with the other," Mr. de Blasio said in his statement. "For our billion dollars, taxpayers and taxi riders deserve a guarantee that Nissan will stop selling its vehicles to Iran."

Nissan is one of the companies on Mr. de Blasio's "Iran Watch List," which highlights 12 automakers that do business with the Iranian regime. According to the watch list, which was launched in partnership with the advocacy groups Iran180 and United Against Nuclear Iran, Nissan has produced more than 7,500 cars in Iran through a partnership with local manufacturer Pars Khodro. (See article written by Mr. de Blasio at: <http://www.nydailynews.com/opinion/new-yellow-cabs-new-jobs-taxi-tomorrow-contest-economy-article-1.112340>)

### **b. Smartphone Apps – N/A**

## **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A**

### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service**

De Blasio indicated that he wants more Bus Rapid Transit outside of Manhattan, citing a JFK-to-Flushing route as an example.

When a Streetsblog reporter asked de Blasio if the Bloomberg administration has been implementing the Select Bus Service program quickly enough, de Blasio said he didn't know enough to say if implementation was going slowly, but that the implicit answer is "yes" because his vision calls for more bus rapid transit in the outer boroughs.<sup>174</sup>

c. Livery Street Hails

New York City Public Advocate Bill de Blasio supported a lawsuit against the city and the mayor filed by taxi fleet owners. De Blasio said the plan will do more harm than good.<sup>175</sup>

“I think it’s going to make it harder for people who own taxi medallions to be able to do their job, I think the value of the medallions could well go down, I think the outer borough on-call car services can be compromised,” he told 1010 WINS’ Stan Brooks. “I thought this plan was built wrong to begin with.”

De Blasio filed a brief saying the mayor exceeded his authority by issuing new medallions for those cabs, adding only the City Council has that ability.

“This lawsuit is simple. It says you can’t make a decision of this importance for the City of New York without the City Council being involved,” De Blasio told WCBS 880’s Rich Lamb. “You can’t have the state Legislature make a decision and leave the City Council of New York City out.”

Mr. de Blasio, an opponent of the city's plan for street-hail livery cabs outside Manhattan, has called for something similar: “outer borough medallions” authorized for service in the other boroughs. He has criticized the existing law because the Legislature approved it, bypassing the City Council.<sup>176</sup>

**4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

a. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A

b. Parking Policy

Public Advocate Bill de Blasio on Tuesday criticized the Bloomberg administration for its moves toward privatization of the city's parking meters.<sup>177</sup>

The administration is in the early stages of considering whether to bring in a private entity to operate the municipal network of single- and multi-space meters that cover the city's roughly 85,000 paid on-street parking spaces. The city will issue a request for qualifications to potential bidders in coming weeks.

Mr. de Blasio hit at the mayor's willingness to consider privatization of the meter system's operation, and used recent civic misadventures in high-tech investment—including the scandal-plagued City Time payroll project—to do so.

“As we have seen in cities like Chicago, privatization can lead to higher costs for drivers and small business owners at a time when they can ill afford it,” Mr. de Blasio wrote, in a letter obtained by The Wall Street Journal. “The pitfalls of this proposal far outweigh its benefits—and we must prevent it from advancing any further.”

New York officials say they would never cede meaningful control over parking policy. But Mr. de Blasio also cast doubt on the rationale for which Deputy Mayor Robert Steel said the city would be willing to consider a private operator: the chance that a for-profit vendor would more readily embrace new technologies and parking systems.

Invoking the CityTime criminal investigation, as well as improvements to the city's 911 system, Mr. de Blasio wrote that “the ill-considered roll-out of yet another new technology could lead to significant disruption and spiraling costs for taxpayers.” He also questioned the administration's failure to rule out an increase in parking fees under a private vendor.

“Our streets are not assets to be sold, nor are parking spaces simply a revenue tool,” Mr. de Blasio wrote. “They are an essential public good that millions of New Yorkers rely upon. I urge you to halt this process now, before walking any further down the path of privatization.”

c. Pedestrian Plazas

Bill de Blasio wants to get the number of New Yorkers who are killed or badly injured in city traffic crashes down to zero.<sup>178</sup> His “Vision Zero” plan includes an expansion of 20-mph speed zones in the city, changes to street design to discourage speeding, and city control of the placement and number of speed enforcement cameras.

d. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A

**5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

a. Service Improvements and Restorations

Public Advocate Bill de Blasio and other elected officials blasted the MTA for cutting off-peak service on the shuttle bus in the Rockaways while launching a ride from Penn Station to the Hamptons. “It’s a ‘Tale of Two Cities,’” de Blasio said. “How can you start new service for folks who are obviously doing quite well when you’re taking away service from people who need it most here in the Rockaways? It makes no sense.”<sup>179</sup>

Mr. de Blasio, in keeping with the theme of his campaign, said he would “address outer borough subway service needs,” though he did not specify what policies he would promote.<sup>180</sup>

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge – N/A

c. Second Avenue Subway Project – N/A

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor’s Role

Bill de Blasio states that he will deliver a safe, sustainable and affordable transportation system that can drive our economy and contribute to vibrant neighborhoods across all five boroughs.<sup>181</sup> De Blasio promises to prioritize long-neglected parts of the outer

boroughs, alleviate dangerous conditions that make streets unsafe, and work toward a more efficient and flexible network that delivers real choice for New Yorkers.

## **6. Transportation Funding**

### **a. New and Existing Funding Sources**

At a candidate forum on mass transit in February, Bill de Blasio, the city's public advocate, drew cheers when he said that he had spent much of his life without owning a car.<sup>182</sup> But most candidates, demurred when asked if they would pledge to substantially raise the share of the city budget devoted to mass transit. "I can't see how we could make that kind of increase in the contribution to mass transit responsibly," said Mr. de Blasio, a Democrat, citing the city's unresolved labor contracts.

Public Advocate Bill de Blasio called for defending the MTA's existing revenue sources (namely the Payroll Mobility Tax, which Governor Cuomo has allowed Senate Republicans to chip away at) and for more federal funding and public-private partnerships.<sup>183</sup>

### **b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance**

*Build the Cross Harbor Freight Tunnel and Invest in Rail Infrastructure:* Bill de Blasio's position is that it is not all about moving people. Right now, more than 90 percent of the freight to and through our region is shipped by trucks that pollute our air and clog our streets."<sup>184</sup> De Blasio intends to increase the share of freight that moves by rail, and Bill de Blasio will fight in Washington for a fully funded Cross Harbor Freight Tunnel to take thousands of trucks off local streets, create local jobs, and make the entire region more economically competitive. The Environmental Impact Study will be released later this year, and de Blasio will work to ensure this project becomes a significant piece of the Port Authority's long-term strategic plan. He stated the City also needs to establish intermodal rail yards in New York and in the region east of the Hudson. To help spur this agenda, he will not just rely on Washington and Albany. Expanding on his work to invest public pension funds locally, he will work with trustees of the city's \$140 billion-worth public pension funds to identify strategic local transportation infrastructure investments that will foster growth, add local jobs, and stimulate economic development.

### **c. Congestion Pricing**

In 2008, Bill de Blasio was strongly opposed to the proposition of congestion pricing, which is why when it came time to put the proposition to a vote, he voted against the idea. However, less than a year later in January of 2009, de Blasio went on record via an E-Mail blast encouraging his supporters to join him in standing against the MTA's proposed fare hikes. He went on record saying: "Tell the MTA there is another solution to this problem – reinstating a commuter tax could create similar revenue without placing the entire burden on our City's residents."<sup>185</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

De Blasio opposed congestion pricing, but supported a Sheldon Silver proposal to put \$2 tolls on the East River bridges. He has also said he supported a commuter tax.<sup>186</sup>

Bill de Blasio: “In just two months (April, 2009), New York City commuters will face drastic fare hikes and service cuts unless our state government solves the MTA’s budget crisis. Time is running out and Albany needs to act now. In light of these troubling circumstances, I am supporting Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver’s proposal to combine a payroll tax with a toll on the East and Harlem River bridges set at two dollars, the same amount as a subway fare. Final legislation must permanently keep these tolls at the level of subway fares and the revenue generated should be used to maintain and improve outer-borough transportation services. In the past I have supported several different solutions to this problem, from reinstating the commuter tax to increasing driver registration fees. Now, above all, I believe Albany needs to fix this problem before straphangers across our city are left carrying the burden by themselves.”<sup>187</sup>

7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)

Two of the Democrats contending to be mayor — Public Advocate Bill de Blasio and Comptroller John Liu — have come out strongly on the side of the Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1811, which represents 8,800 bus drivers and matrons.<sup>188</sup>

“The city needs to stop stonewalling on safety and recognize what every parent knows: experience matters,” Mr. de Blasio said in a statement. “These protections ensure that no matter what happens with bus companies, we have the most experienced drivers behind the wheel who know our kids and their special needs.”

On Feb. 15, 2013, a deal, apparently brokered by ATU International President Larry Hanley, was announced in a statement released by five Democratic candidates for the mayoral election in November, 2013 Candidates Christine Quinn, Bill Thompson, John Liu, Bill de Blasio, and Sal Albanese asked the ATU to end the strike and pledged to “revisit” the issue if one of them is elected mayor. The pledge avoided embracing the Employee Protection Plan (“EPP”) demand by name, while warning the ATU that all decisions will be “fiscally responsible,” that is, maintaining the threat of lowered wages and benefits for workers.<sup>189</sup>

8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services – N/A

9. Sustainable Transportation

a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives

*Harnessing the Power of the Purse to Promote Energy Efficiency:* The City of New York has enormous leverage through its purchasing power to promote the use of green

products and increase energy efficiency. As a City Council member, Bill de Blasio pushed the city to change its purchasing to ensure New York's power of the purse obtained economies of scale.<sup>190</sup>

The green collar economy begins with a clear commitment to alternative energy sources. As mayor, Bill de Blasio promises to expand the city's investment in large-scale clean energy production, including wind, solar, geothermal, hydropower and biofuels. He claims not only would such a transition reduce New York City's carbon footprint, it would expand economic opportunities — from entrepreneurs to production and installation jobs. Bill de Blasio also advocates at the state level for the New York Solar Act, which will provide additional incentives to support the adoption of solar energy production.

b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans

When a 2013 mayoral contender calls the last five years of progress toward safer, more sustainable streets the product of a “radical” approach, as Public Advocate Bill de Blasio did, everyone's ears should perk up.

De Blasio soft-pedaled his words by framing himself as the “incrementalist” to DOT Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan's “radical approach.”<sup>191</sup>

***10. Passenger Rail***

a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) – N/A

b. Moynihan Station Development Project

Democratic candidates, including Christine C. Quinn, Bill de Blasio and John C. Liu, have called on Madison Square Garden to vacate its home atop the underground rail station so that a new structure can be built that would more safely accommodate transit riders and serve as a grand entry point to the city.<sup>192</sup>

Ms. Quinn and Mr. de Blasio have joined some of the city's most prominent civic groups, which have long lamented the demise of the celebrated structure, in asking the city to approve a measure that would extend the Garden's operating permit for only 10 years. That would provide enough time, they say, to find an alternative home for the Garden and to devise plans for an expanded Penn Station and the development of the surrounding neighborhood. Recently the Garden's operating permit was extended for only 10 years.

***11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements*** – N/A

***12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)*** – N/A

## Joseph J. Lhota



Past/Current Position(s): Chairman and C.E.O. of the MTA

Date of Birth: October 7, 1964 (age 58)

Place of Birth: The Bronx, New York City

Political Party: Republican Party

Website: [www.joelhotaformayor.com](http://www.joelhotaformayor.com)

### ***Early Life and Education***

Lhota is the son of a retired lieutenant in the NYPD. His paternal grandfather was a FDNY firefighter and his maternal grandfather was a New York City taxi driver. His father's side is from the Czech Republic and his mother's side is Italian. Lhota is married and has one daughter. The first member of his family to attend college, Lhota graduated with honors from Georgetown University in 1976. He also received an MBA from Harvard Business School in 1980.

### ***Giuliani Administration***

In 1994, Lhota joined the administration of Mayor Rudy Giuliani, where he held several positions over Giuliani's two terms. He first served as chief of staff to the deputy mayor for finance and economic development and that year was quickly promoted to New York City finance commissioner. In 1995, he was selected as director of the office of management and budget. In 1998, Giuliani appointed Lhota to deputy mayor for operations. Lhota served as Mayor Giuliani's liaison to the White House, United States Congress, governor of New York, New York State Legislature and New York City Council. Additionally, he was responsible for oversight of the City's relationships with the public employee unions and development of collective bargaining agreement strategies. Lhota, known as a problem solver while serving in city government, has "an unparalleled knowledge of city government." As deputy mayor, Lhota served as the highest-ranking member of the Mayor's core management team. On this team, Lhota developed and implemented the strategies and initiatives that accomplished the successful "turn-around" of New York City, which had been plagued by a high crime rate, sense of

fear among citizens, reduction in social services, and high tax rates that were famously chronicled in the September 17, 1990, cover story of Time, “The Decline of New York.” Lhota also coordinated the City's response to the terrorist attack on the World Trade Center on September 11, 2001.

### ***Chairman of the MTA***

On October 20, 2011, New York Governor Andrew Cuomo nominated Lhota to serve as chairman of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), the largest mass transit provider in the United States (servicing 8.5 million customers daily). While awaiting confirmation by the New York State Senate, Lhota began serving as interim CEO. He was unanimously confirmed by the state Senate on Jan 9, 2012. During his tenure he received praise for New York City Transit’s successful FASTRACK program which saw more than \$16 million in productivity gains in 2012, by concentrating and targeting subway station maintenance efforts. In July 2012 Lhota announced a \$30 million service enhancement package that not only restored transportation services that the MTA had previously eliminated in 2010, but also provided the opportunity to add new transit services in underserved areas, including Williamsburg, the South Bronx and Brooklyn Navy Yard—all New York City neighborhoods that have seen significant residential and commercial development since 2005. Lhota also spearheaded the MTA making information about the MTA and its services more accessible to its customers through its website and apps. Lhota granted pay raises to managers at the MTA before he left office. Lhota resigned as head of the MTA on December 31, 2012, in order to explore running for mayor of New York City.

### ***Mayoral Candidacy***

On January 17, 2013, Joe Lhota filed paperwork with the New York City Board of Elections and the New York State Board of Elections which formally launched his mayoral campaign.

## **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

### ***1. Bicycle Use in New York City***

#### ***a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes***

Joseph J. Lhota, the former chairman of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and a Republican candidate for mayor, also said he “could see” removing lanes that he deemed problematic. He noted that some bus drivers along the B63 route in Park Slope, Brooklyn, had complained about the perils of sharing space with bike riders.

Lhota said, he’s “absolutely in favor of” bike share, and in “no way, shape or form” means to criticize bike share or bike lanes.



Joe Lhota also said Mayor Bloomberg hasn't been top down enough. He said the mayor and his deputies, when choosing where the docks would go, needed to demand more coordination among city officials.

"You bring in the police commissioner and the fire commissioner and the DOT commissioner and you coordinate all of the issues related to, for example, where the new bike racks are going," Lhota told WNYC's Brian Lehrer. "I don't know if they've done that," he said about the mayor's office. "I'm just using this as an example," he added. "You just don't put in the new bike racks — which I'm absolutely in favor of, this is by no way shape or form a criticism — it's about management style. I think leadership begins at the top."

Lhota said there hadn't been sufficient care to make sure, for example, the racks didn't go where emergency vehicles typically park. "That's insensitive," he said.

Polls — taken before the docks began to be installed — have shown overwhelming support for bike share.<sup>193</sup>

Joe Lhota: "We need to have more community involvement where they're located. And we need to have more enforcement of bike riders — if it's one way for cars, it's one way for bikes. We should avoid bike lanes that impede economic and commercial activity and keep them to residential streets ... Bikes and buses should not share the same streets."<sup>194</sup>

Lhota also criticized the way the DOT has painted bike lanes without regard for the needs of police cars, fire trucks, and ambulances.

"The coordination with the different agencies has been horrific," said Lhota.

He then complained about the thoughtless placement of the new BikeShare racks, noting that one of the two-wheeler depots now sits directly in front of the entrance to the Clark Street subway stop.

"Those bikes are going to be in the way. God forbid the Fire Department has to get into that station," said Lhota.<sup>195</sup>

Lhota said that he would increase the number of lanes, though he called for "common sense in their placement." In the past, he has said that he "could see" removing existing lanes that he deemed problematic, mentioning that some bus drivers along the B63 route in Park Slope, Brooklyn, had complained about sharing space with bike riders.<sup>196</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

a. The Taxi of Tomorrow – N/A

b. Smartphone Apps – N/A

### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

- a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A
- b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service

“The MTA is always working to make it easier to get around, and faster rides to LaGuardia will be a huge benefit for our customers,” said MTA Chairman and CEO Joseph J. Lhota. “Select Bus Service to the airport will make LaGuardia more convenient for travelers as well as airport workers, and that means a boost for the entire New York economy.”

- c. Livery Street Hails

Mr. Lhota said the city should "allow market forces to take over" and embrace technology like ride-hailing smartphone apps for both taxis and car services. He also expressed support for allowing the hailing of livery cabs outside Manhattan.<sup>197</sup>

### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

- a. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A
- b. Parking Policy

Lhota slammed the invasion of high-end food trucks that he claimed clog major thoroughfares while appealing to social media-savvy young people with epicurean tastes. He said he would support regulations limiting where the vehicles can park.<sup>198</sup>

“They send you a Tweet and let you know what corner they’ll be at. It’s part of their business model,” said Lhota. “They’re parked all over the streets, on every corner of the city, and they cause congestion.”

- c. Pedestrian Plazas – N/A
- d. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A

### **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

- a. Service Improvements and Restorations

MTA Chairman Joseph Lhota urged patience, saying that the subject would have to wait until the MTA's finances had achieved a new level of “stability.” He added: “Not a day goes by when I don't think about restorations of services and further investments in the system.”<sup>199</sup>

Joseph Lhota: “By the way, all of the bridges and tunnels that are controlled by the MTA are within the five boroughs. None of them connect anything other than the five boroughs.

It now costs \$15 round-trip to go from the Bronx to Queens. It costs \$15 to go from Brooklyn to Staten Island. The reality is, right now, I can't think of anything that's reducing economic development as much. It begs the question, what are they doing with all that money, the \$600 million of surplus which is going to subsidize mass transit?<sup>200</sup>

"I think mass transit needs to be subsidized. But when you look at the numbers, New York State actually ranks last in the country in the subsidy-per-rider that they provide. You can look at what they do in Massachusetts for the T or what they do for Metro in Washington or MARTA in Atlanta. Those states give more money per rider than in New York State. New York State shouldn't be last in anything. It should be first. But I also believe that if you ever want to have any issues of talking about congestion pricing or anything like that, it would be great to get the MTA out of the picture, let the City of New York control every bridge and tunnel in the City of New York."<sup>201</sup>

Mr. Lhota, a former chairman of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, called for a subway extension to Staten Island and shorter waiting times between trains to decrease overcrowding. He also said he would supply city financing to the authority to begin an in-station recycling program and to keep platforms clean.<sup>202</sup>

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge – N/A

c. Second Avenue Subway Project

While speaking with the Long Island Association, MTA Chairman Joseph Lhota let slip the news on East Side Access that has been a few months' coming. "We were originally looking at 2018, but the most recent analyses put the opening at 2019," Lhota said. "I don't want to see it go past 2019."<sup>203</sup>

"The problem with East Side Access isn't digging below Grand Central Station, where 'cavernous tunnels' have been carved out, but on the Queens side of the project. Tunneling underneath the Queens rail yard near Jamaica, where trains from Amtrak and Acela are stored in addition to MTA's own vehicles, has become an issue."

"Contaminated soil languishes and must be disposed of properly, and unlike closer to the water, the ground is soft rather than rocky." Lhota also stated that workers have also run into springs and brooks that nobody knew existed below the surface.

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role

Lhota has made numerous statements concerning mayoral governance, including:

"The transportation world in this city is balkanized. It truly is. You have major roads in New York City that are controlled by the state. For example, the FDR Drive is not a city road. It is a state road and the state repairs and upkeeps it. You have the MTA, which has the subways and buses and the bridges and tunnels."<sup>204</sup>

“What I have been calling for, just as an aside, is that the bridges and tunnels need to be given back to the mayor. They were taken away from the mayor in 1968 by the Legislature at the request of Gov. Rockefeller. The Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority still exists; it is a subsidiary of the MTA. I have called as a candidate to have the mayor take over the TBTA again because that way they can control the tolls over there because tolls are going up for the purposes of subsidizing things unrelated to the bridges and tunnels.”

“I think what I would like to do, that existed pre-Mike Bloomberg is bring back the Mayor’s Office of Transportation. It was a coordinating body of all of the transportation agencies. In fact Janette Sadik-Khan was the head of the Mayor’s Office of Transportation during the Dinkins administration.”

“Their role was to make sure the city was heard at every level within every one of those agencies, so much so that the mayor’s representatives on the MTA board would meet with the Mayor’s Office of Transportation before committee meetings, before board meetings, and understand what the committee and what the city wanted from the MTA, and so it was very important.”

“There really needs to be an overall effort to try to get everyone to work together. That is one of the reasons I want the City to control the bridges and tunnels — by the way, the bridges and tunnels only connect the five boroughs. They don't go to Nassau County, they don't go to Westchester County. They only connect one borough to another borough. In one case in the Rockaways, a bridge connects Queens to Queens.”

“So the people who want to go from one side of the borough to the other side of the borough have to pay a toll. It is amazing how inequitable that seems to be. I don't know any other place in the country where it costs you money to go in the same county from one side to the other side. The mayor and City Council should control all of the bridges and tunnels in the five boroughs. Then there will be the beginning of less balkanization going on because then you will be able to control the ability to get from one borough to another borough and have a cohesive or at least a coherent transportation policy and strategy, maybe strategy then policy.”

“Quite honestly the subsidy that is provided by the state to mass transit is voluminous and we can't lose that subsidy. The subsidy right now on the transit ride — about 50 percent of the cost for your subway ride, and I'm going to be off by a couple percentages, but it's about 50-50. Fifty percent of the cost of the subway ride comes from the fare and the other 50 percent comes from the state in the form of subsidies.”

“But those subsidies are different things, they can take the form of every time you get in a cab, 50 cents goes to the MTA. Every time you have a new mortgage, you have something called the mortgage recording tax that goes to the MTA. Again, even the subsidies’ streams are balkanized.”

“Maybe I know too much because I am wonkish on this issue. But you can't just say the mayor should take over the MTA without realizing the fiscal implications. It needs to be a much more comprehensive answer than we are just going to take it over.”

## 6. Transportation Funding

### a. New and Existing Funding Sources

The MTA needs new revenues, announced chairman Joe Lhota during a broad-ranging panel discussion at Fordham University. (Jan. 2012) “There’s going to be the need for broad-based tax revenue somewhere within the system over the next couple of years,” Lhota said, noting that he’s generally the kind of conservative person loath to call for tax increases.<sup>205</sup>

In calling for new revenues, the then-new transit chief gave notice that the system can’t succeed by cutting costs alone. While Lhota said little about specific revenue sources, bridge tolls or congestion pricing don’t seem to be high on his list.

### b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance

Mr. Lhota said that the agency he led diverts the \$300-\$400-million surplus it derives from bridge and tunnel tolls each year to maintain subways and the suburban rail lines.<sup>206</sup>

### c. Congestion Pricing

Current MTA chairman Joe Lhota and former MTA executive director Elliot Sander agree that congestion pricing is hard.<sup>207</sup>

“My experience in London, having been there before and after they’ve done the congestion pricing, it’s extraordinary,” Lhota said. “I mean, it moves in New York in comparison to London. And no disrespect, I love London.

“But you can tell I really don’t want to talk about congestion pricing,” Lhota continued. “Just to be very honest with you, because I think it’s one that I think the elected officials need to look at and determine if it’s necessary here.”<sup>208</sup>

### d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

While Joe Lhota is not in favor of new tolls on the East River bridges, he indicated he’s open to a revised version of congestion pricing that limits strain on the outer boroughs; “a great place to begin the debate.”<sup>209</sup>

“The former head of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority”, the editorial board wrote, “said that if he were to be elected mayor, he would seek to get full mayoral control of the bridges and tunnels in the city.”<sup>210</sup>

Aside from the non-tolled East River bridges that belong to the city—the Brooklyn, Manhattan, Williamsburg and Queensboro bridges—major river crossings between the five boroughs belong to the state, under the guise of the MTA Bridges and Tunnels.

Lhota has said he would not support putting tolls on the East River bridges “until we have

a better understanding and a better control of all of our bridges and tunnels at the city level.”<sup>211</sup>

He cited the mix of state and local agencies involved and said that “New York City needs to control its own destiny. We need to have it all integrated.”

#### **7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

With regard to the letter that five Democratic mayoral candidates signed in February 2012 concerning the school bus strike, Lhota said, “put in black and white” those candidates’ lack of commitment to protecting the taxpayer’s interests.<sup>212</sup>

Joe Lhota supports Mayor Bloomberg’s position to not negotiate with striking school-bus workers.

Lhota called the demands by Local 1181 of the Amalgamated Transit Union for job protections given only to public employees a “very, very slippery slope that we go down.”

“They’re private-sector workers, but they want the same benefits and everything else that goes on that you would have at the Transit Authority . . . The mayor is absolutely correct,” Lhota said on WNYW/Channel 5’s Good Day, New York.

“The courts have held that what the union is asking for is illegal,” he added. The city has cited a 2011 New York appeals court ruling that deemed the job protections the union wants to be illegal.<sup>213</sup>

#### **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services** – N/A

#### **9. Sustainable Transportation**

##### **a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives** – N/A

##### **b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans**

“With the amount of expansive growth we’re seeing in the number of passengers, the future of infrastructure is not about expanding the system, but using the existing system and putting in modern technology so that in the future, we can get more trains on the same track. Is this model of infrastructure spending sustainable? It is only sustainable if our economy continues growing, or grows anywhere between 5 and 10 percent a year—forever. We can’t always rely on that.”<sup>214</sup>

#### **10. Passenger Rail**

##### **a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak)**

Lhota was asked about a trans-Hudson rail connection and what might fill the gap of the

ARC Tunnel, a project killed by New Jersey Governor Chris Christie in late 2010. Lhota said he favors Amtrak's proposed Gateway Tunnel project, which would bring Northeast Corridor trains from New Jersey through a tunnel under the river to an expanded Penn Station.<sup>215</sup>

"I think it's really important to support that," Lhota said. The impetus for a No. 7 train extension comes from Mayor Michael Bloomberg, who proposed the project last year. "I've told the mayor this, I can't see that happening in our lifetime," Lhota said.

b. Moynihan Station Development Project

This proposal has provoked stiff opposition from the owners of Madison Square Garden, including Lhota, a former executive vice president at the Garden. Lhota, along with Bill Thompson, have stated that the permit should be extended in perpetuity.<sup>216</sup>

**11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements**

As the former MTA Chairman, and as a mayoral candidate, Lhota has made numerous statements regarding the use of technology and data for transportation improvements, including:

"Our customers are desirous of when they get down on a track, when is it going to get here or at a bus stop, when is my bus going to get here, and that's the critical part of it," said Joseph Lhota, MTA Chairman and CEO.<sup>217</sup>

"We have a lot of raw data about when our trains are coming, our subways are coming, we wanted to get it into the hands of as many people as possible," Lhota told CBS 2's Dana Tyler.

"There's this burgeoning community of young folks who really understand technology. There are generational issues in this part of the world," MTA chairman Joseph Lhota told WCBS 880 reporter Paul Murnane.

In sum, Lhota has supported the MTA using systems to provide riders up-to-the-moment information.

**12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)**

On the Hurricane Sandy response, Lhota stated "I wasn't criticizing the mayor directly but that city could have been better prepared."<sup>218</sup>

Lhota called for an additional recommendation to Mayor Bloomberg's comprehensive storm resiliency plan, saying the state should mandate electrical companies whose service areas cover evacuated flood zones to terminate power prior to expected storm surges to prevent another mass fire like the one that swept through Breezy Point during Superstorm Sandy.<sup>219</sup>

John Liu<sup>220</sup>



### ***Biography***

John's story is a New York story. A son of immigrants, with education as the means of getting ahead, and the belief that a life with so much given should be lived in service to others.

Like many who arrive seeking the American dream, Liu immigrated to New York from Taiwan with his parents and two brothers when he was five years old. His parents believed in the opportunities that this City affords and her sacred promise of a fair shot if you dream big and work hard. Liu's parents believed in that promise: that an immigrant family named Liu could work their way up to become like a family named Kennedy. So much so that his father, Joseph, named his sons John, Robert and Edward.

Liu's parents made sacrifices for John and his brothers. He never forgot the long hours working in a sweatshop with his mother and learning first-hand what it is to struggle and overcome the challenges that working families face every day.

Today, Liu is a proud product of New York City public schools, beginning with kindergarten at P.S. 20 in Queens through the Bronx High School of Science. He earned his bachelor's degree from the State University of New York at Binghamton in Mathematical Physics.

Now as a father of a son in the New York City public schools, Liu knows what it means to want your children to succeed with every opportunity within their reach and no limits to their dreams. These experiences and principles helped make Liu the man he is today and are at the core of his campaign to become the next Mayor.



In 2009, Liu won the historic race to become the 43rd Comptroller of the City of New York. An independently elected citywide official, he pledged at his inauguration to “Exercise the powers of that office in the most robust manner for the future of our City.” In just over three short years, Liu has kept that promise:

- Produced more than \$4 billion in cost savings in just one term as Comptroller. Because every dollar does something, so every saving means something.
- Served as a watchdog – a pit bull – to aggressively root out waste, fraud and abuse from the City’s coffers, especially spending on outside consultants. The infamous CityTime corruption investigation led to the recapturing of half a billion dollars, and John has identified even more to recoup from other mismanaged and over-budgeted projects like the 911 Call Center.
- Saved over \$1 billion by reducing the City’s debt service. Because any homeowner knows, refinancing is the kind of savings that goes straight to the bottom line.
- Enhanced the assets of the City’s \$137 billion pension funds and retirement security of the City’s working retired men and women, amassing over 50% cumulative returns within three years.
- Expanded opportunities for women and minority-owned businesses to do business with the City of New York.
- Developed innovative ways to get a better deal for taxpayers and create jobs while meeting the infrastructure needs of tomorrow, including a Capital Acceleration Plan for approved City construction projects, significant pension fund investments for post-Sandy recovery and Green Apple Bonds to remove dangerous PCBs in 700 schools.
- Protected wage standards and recouped back wages and fines on behalf of cheated workers from contractors who just don’t want to play by the rules.
- Proposed sound economic policies to create real economic growth and narrow the ever-widening wealth gap.
- Exposed the billions of dollars in publicly-subsidized corporate welfare doled out by the City that failed to deliver on promised new jobs and fair housing.
- Propelled New York City as the most financially transparent government in the United States by creating [www.checkbooknyc.com](http://www.checkbooknyc.com). It offers unprecedented public access into how the City of New York spends its nearly \$70 billion annual budget and compels more judicious spending of precious tax dollars.

Hailed as a “Trailblazer” and “Pioneer,” Liu’s historic elections as the first Asian American elected in the City – both to the City Council in 2001 and as City Comptroller

in 2009 – were milestones for Asian Americans in New York and across the nation. Although he wishes APAs had been elected long before, Liu is honored to be the first and embraces the opportunity to broaden representation and public service.

Prior to serving as Comptroller, Liu was a member of the New York City Council from 2001 to 2009, representing District 20 in Queens. He was Chair of the Council's Transportation Committee and also served on the committees on Education, Consumer Affairs, Contracts, Oversight & Investigation, and Lower Manhattan Redevelopment. John's significant accomplishments as a legislator included exposing financial irregularities at the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), shepherding bills through the Transportation Committee designed to enhance administrative efficiency, and enacting legislation like the Equal Access Bill mandating on-demand language services in health and human services agencies, the School Zone Engine Idling Bill limiting engine idling near schools, and the Dignity for All Schools Act requiring the Department of Education to track bullying and harassment in schools.

Prior to serving in the City Council, Liu worked in the private sector for 14 years, including as a manager at PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP where he managed a team of actuaries. John has drawn upon his real world fiscal expertise to root out waste and mismanagement in municipal government.

Liu, with all the opportunities from New York's sacred promise, has gone far but still stayed close to home. Within blocks from where he immigrated, he still lives in Flushing, Queens with his wife Jenny and their son, Joey.

### **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

John Liu's official campaign website calls mass transit the key to economic recovery and vitality in New York City.<sup>221</sup>

Liu's transportation plan for N focuses on the following key areas:

- Safety
- Increase City, State and Federal Funding to Mass Transit Maintenance and Expansion
- Expand Bus Service
- Waterways/Ferries
- Ensure Transparency at MTA
- Commuter Tax
- Tolling for Non-City Residents
- Staten Island Transportation

## **1. Bicycle Use in New York City**

### **a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

John C. Liu has called for a helmet requirement for the bike sharing program, and accused the City of underestimating its financial exposure in bike crashes.

“I hope no one gets hurt,” Mr. Liu said in an interview. “But this is thousands of bicycles on the streets of Manhattan, used by people who haven’t ridden bikes on the streets of Manhattan.”<sup>222</sup>

At a candidate forum in Brooklyn, Liu said he is skeptical of the city’s bike lane program.<sup>223</sup>

Liu said that the bike lanes make sense in Manhattan, but in Brooklyn and Queens, he said he’s stood watching for a long time without seeing any cyclists ride past. He also said that there is “little to no community input” when the Department of Transportation looks at installing bike lanes.

In an interview, Liu stated that removing existing lanes would be “a likely scenario in some parts of the city,” particularly in Brooklyn and Queens, if he succeeded Mayor Bloomberg.<sup>224</sup>

While calling himself “an avid bike rider,” Mr. Liu expressed skepticism about the polling numbers on bikes. “It depends who’s doing the poll,” he said. “I don’t recall any opponents of bike lanes conducting any polls.”

“There are too many of them. It would be one thing if the lanes were cluttered with bike traffic, but they aren’t. There’s a lot of competition for street space. There are a lot of people looking for parking spaces and trying to get around in their cars. We need parking spaces and traffic lanes. We need equilibrium.”<sup>225</sup>

Liu said the creation of lanes “would be a community-driven process.”<sup>226</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

Comptroller John Liu has twice rejected the City’s contract for the Nissan NV200.

“City Hall’s refusal to provide wheelchair-accessible cabs to people with disabilities is inexplicable and we believe it violates the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA),” Liu said. “We should not go ahead with a so-called Taxi of Tomorrow that perpetuates a shamefully separate and unequal cab fleet for another decade.” As such, Liu wrote to Mayor Bloomberg to say he won’t register the Taxi of Tomorrow agreement “on the grounds that it may not only violate the civil rights of wheelchair users, but also puts the City at significant risk of lawsuits.”<sup>227</sup>

Liu is not in the political wilderness on this one. His concerns have been shared by a number of Assembly and City Council members. But Liu claims the Bloomberg administration just doesn't care, and anyway says that Liu isn't allowed to not register the contract.<sup>228</sup>

“The new contract for taxis presents us with a historic opportunity to right a wrong that New Yorkers with disabilities have been fighting to achieve for nearly two decades,” Liu said in a statement regarding the letter. “Requiring cabs to have independent passenger climate controls is nice, but when you fail to make them accessible to a growing number of New Yorkers, it's not just a slap in the face, it's illegal. We will send back any plan that does not uphold the civil rights demanded by the Americans with Disabilities Act.”

The so-called Taxi of Tomorrow has been dealing with handicap accessibility since it was first announced. The Department of Justice has already come out saying the city, via the TLC, is discriminating against the handicapped by only offering 231 accessible vehicles (out of a fleet of 13,000)—which a federal court agreed with. Since then the TLC has approved another accessible cab and made promises to retrofit the new ones to be accessible. But that is not the same as making the whole fleet accessible as they upgrade, which is what Liu and others are calling for.<sup>229</sup>

Valerie Budzik, Deputy Comptroller for Legal Affairs/General Counsel, responded to the City Law Department by saying, “It is absurd to suggest that the City Comptroller should register a contract that is discriminatory and in violation of federal civil rights law.”<sup>230</sup>

Mr. Liu said he would require that all taxis be accessible, echoing a theme from his criticism of the Bloomberg administration's Taxi of Tomorrow. In December, Mr. Liu rejected the Taxi of Tomorrow contract -- a largely symbolic act that was not expected to affect its introduction -- noting that the vehicle, a Nissan NV200, was not wheelchair-accessible. (It can be retrofitted to become so.)<sup>231</sup>

In a letter sent on September 3, 2013 to Mayor Bloomberg, Comptroller John Liu rejected the city's Taxi of Tomorrow contract for a second time just weeks before the Oct. 28, 2013 deadline for the first yellow cabs to begin converting to the Nissan NV200.

Mr. Liu said he refused to formally register the city's contract with Nissan North America Inc., because the base model of the new taxi does not accept wheelchairs. Mr. Liu, like advocates for the disabled, has asserted that the Americans with Disabilities Act requires that the new taxis be accessible to those in wheelchairs, though a federal court has ruled in the city's favor. “By mandating a 'Taxi of Tomorrow' that is not wheelchair accessible, the city has disregarded the civil rights of the disabled community,” Mr. Liu wrote.<sup>232</sup>

b. Smartphone Apps - N/A

### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

#### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)**<sup>233</sup>

When he served as a City Council Member, John Liu introduced legislation governing commuter vans to abolish two rules he contended needlessly delayed and complicated the daily trips of thousands of residents of Queens.

Liu, who is the former chairman of the City Council Transportation Committee, saw as unnecessary and proposed abolishing the rules that:

- Require people taking commuter vans to make prior arrangements, such as by telephone or otherwise; and

- Require that the operator of such vans record the name and address of all passengers.

“Why should anyone have to make arrangements prior to boarding a commuter van?” said Liu. “We have specified locations where people go to board these vehicles.”

“As for giving names and addresses, I feel that the last thing that people on their way to work or shopping wants is to endure the delay and trouble of waiting for the van operator to take down and record this information.”

#### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service**

Liu said that expanding Bus Rapid Transit should be part of the city’s transit mix, but didn’t get more specific than that.<sup>234</sup>

#### **c. Livery Street Hails - N/A**

### **4. Traffic Issues-Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

#### **a. Curb-Space Allocation - N/A**

#### **b. Parking Policy**

“City Hall is making the right call in abandoning its plan to privatize the City’s parking meters. As I pointed out when this proposal first came to light, curbside parking is a municipal treasure that is hugely profitable for the City, thanks to the good work of the employees who maintain our parking system. Outsourcing to a private corporation would’ve led to higher meter rates, so it’s good news that New York City will retain control of its parking system.”<sup>235</sup>

#### **c. Pedestrian Plazas**

“There are too many of them. It would be one thing if the lanes were cluttered with bike traffic, but they aren’t. There’s a lot of competition for street space. There are a lot of

people looking for parking spaces and trying to get around in their cars. We need parking spaces and traffic lanes. We need equilibrium.”<sup>236</sup> Liu has proposed removing some of the Bloomberg-era bike lanes.<sup>237</sup>

d. Trucking and Freight Delivery - N/A

5. **Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

a. Service Improvements and Restorations

Comptroller John C. Liu applauded the MTA’s \$29 million transit-service restorations:

“The MTA did the right thing in restoring 13 bus routes it had cut in the Five Boroughs and in extending and creating several others. The restoration of the B39 makes it possible for people with disabilities to travel between Manhattan and Brooklyn on a local bus for the first time since the cuts went through in 2010. That saves the taxpayers money on Access-A-Ride trips. It would be even better if the MTA also restored the B51, the other Brooklyn-Manhattan local-bus route.”<sup>238</sup>

Asked to name one thing he would do as mayor to improve subway service, Mr. Liu pledged to increase the city's contribution to the Metropolitan Transportation Authority by \$100 million, and to urge Albany and Washington to increase financing for the agency as well. He did not specify what he hoped the extra money would yield. In the past, Mr. Liu has called for strengthening penalties against people who attack transit workers.<sup>239</sup>

Mr. Liu also proposed expanding the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's program of offering prepaid debit cards to allow some paratransit customers to use taxicabs instead of vans when possible.<sup>240</sup>

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

John Liu proposes a plan that the East River bridges have tolls; however, residents of New York City would be exempt from said tolls. Such a plan, Liu suggests, would bring in the City \$410 Million annually. What Liu fails to mention however, is whether or not the newly found \$410 Million would go to supplement existing tolls on popular bridges and tunnels, and lower those tolls.<sup>241</sup>

c. Second Avenue Subway Project - N/A

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor’s Role<sup>242</sup>

I have been a champion of transparency in government throughout my tenure as an elected official. While a councilmember I discovered the MTA’s practice of dishonest accounting. It is unacceptable for a government agency that has been plagued with budget problems to keep two sets of books. The MTA is obviously of paramount importance to the City of New York and must be properly funded. I have outlined my priorities for ensuring it is funded in a way that will allow it to thrive, but any increase in funding must be accompanied with transparency.

I will get MTA to report to Checkbook NYC. This is a tool created by my office that accounts for, and makes publicly available, spending by City agencies. The MTA should participate in this tool because the City provides funding for its operation.

## **6. Transportation Funding**

### **a. New and Existing Funding Sources**

Mr. Liu has pledged to substantially raise the share of the city budget devoted to mass transit. He deemed a possible increase of one percent as a pittance.<sup>243</sup>

Liu has also stated that transit needs an ongoing revenue stream.<sup>244</sup> He stated that he also wants more federal funding, as well as more state funding and indicated that landlords should “contribute revenue” to the MTA.<sup>245</sup>

Mr. Liu pledged to increase the city's contribution to the MTA by \$100 million, and to advocate that New York States and the federal government increase financing for the agency as well.<sup>246</sup>

### **b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance**<sup>247</sup>

Mr. Liu has made numerous statements concerning infrastructure repair and maintenance, including:

“Transportation has an extraordinary impact on the environment. Our mass transit system prevents a massive amount of harmful greenhouse gases from entering the atmosphere. Properly investing in our public transportation system is not just good economic policy, it is also smart environmental policy. In addition to making sure our subway, bus and rail systems are adequate, we must explore expanding other modes of transportation to meet the needs of the more than one million additional residents expected in the next two decades.”

“However, the aging infrastructure is increasingly expensive to maintain and the lack of investment is creating a system that cannot keep up with demand. Four fare increases in the last five years is the wrong way to try to balance the MTA’s budget. This is not a sustainable transit plan and it must be fixed. The MTA needs funding to run properly-I will work hard to make sure they have necessary resources.”

### **c. Congestion Pricing**

Liu has voted in favor of congestion pricing when he was a Council Member, and has also supported reinstating the commuter tax<sup>248</sup> Mr. Liu, the former chair of the City Council’s Transportation Committee, said, “I generally support the idea of congestion pricing and that is – it is because of the economic as well as the environmental costs of not doing so.” He said he has been persuaded by a study showing that traffic congestion costs the city \$13 billion a year in economic activity.

He said that some mom-and-pop shops and small businesses might actually support congestion pricing – if the benefits were adequately explained to them. “Time is money for these small businesses,” he said. “They could actually make more money if the streets were less congested; but they are so skeptical at this point that they’re not open-minded to hearing a lot of things. And we have to admit they have largely been left out of the process and the entire conversation.”<sup>249</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

The key component of Liu’s plan, which he says would raise \$410 million annually, isn’t the tolls – it is the exemption for city residents. Here’s what Liu said at an Association for Better New York event in April 2013:

“To get that money, we would toll the East River Bridges for non-city residents. Tolling the East River Bridges would mean that membership or, in this case, residency, New York City residency has its privileges. Non-residents commuting by car can and should contribute to the upkeep of our city’s infrastructure.”

Liu suggested devoting revenue to “infrastructure,” he also mentioned that it could be used for “offsetting increased city contributions to the MTA,” which might just lead to tolls that pad other areas of the city budget.<sup>250</sup>

Liu also expressed skepticism that any administration would ever be able to enact a scheme that involves tolls on the traditionally free bridges.

“Tolls get bandied about every time there is a fiscal crisis,” Liu told the New York Post in 2008 when he was a Council Member and chair of the Council’s Transportation Committee. He added, “The mayor tried to impose them during the dire fiscal straits in the wake of the 9/11 attacks, and even then it went over like a lead balloon.”<sup>251</sup>

**7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

Comptroller John Liu has come out strongly on the side of the Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1811, which represents 8,800 bus drivers and matrons.

Liu stated the following on the Department of Education’s proposed school bus contracts:

“Employee-protection provisions are necessary not just for the bus drivers, but also for the safe and reliable transport of city schoolchildren. City Hall’s behavior has been outrageous, and it needs to negotiate with workers immediately to avoid a disruption in school-bus service. The bottom line is: This is about the quality and safety of the busing we provide our special-needs students. Once again, the administration is displaying a pattern of disregard for human needs.”<sup>252</sup>

At a mayoral candidates’ UFT forum, Comptroller Liu opposed City Hall’s handling of this past winter’s school bus strike.<sup>253</sup>



On Feb. 15, 2013, a deal, apparently brokered by ATU International President Larry Hanley, was announced in a statement released by five Democratic candidates for the mayoral election in November. Candidates Christine Quinn, Bill Thompson, John Liu, Bill de Blasio, and Sal Albanese asked the ATU to end the strike and pledged to “revisit” the issue if one of them is elected mayor. The pledge avoided embracing the Employee Protection Plan (“EPP”) demand by name, while warning the ATU that all decisions will be “fiscally responsible,” that is, maintaining the threat of lowered wages and benefits for workers.<sup>254</sup>

## **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services**

As previously noted, Mr. Liu said he would require that all taxicabs be accessible, echoing a theme from his criticism of the Bloomberg administration's Taxi of Tomorrow.<sup>255</sup>

## **9. Sustainable Transportation**

### **a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives**

Liu has stated, “Transportation has an extraordinary impact on the environment. Our mass transit system prevents a massive amount of harmful greenhouse gases from entering the atmosphere. Properly investing in our public transportation system is not just good economic policy, it is also smart environmental policy.”<sup>256</sup>

### **b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans**<sup>257</sup>

With regard to sustainability, Liu has said that “a healthy and modernized transit system is New York City’s greatest contribution to sustainability. New York State is dead last in gasoline consumption per capita due to NYC’s transit system. I will fight to make sure the MTA is funded adequately to provide effective transit service options.

## **10. Passenger Rail**

### **a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) - N/A**

### **b. Moynihan Station Development Project**

John C. Liu has called on the Garden to vacate its home atop the underground rail station so that a new structure can be built that would more safely accommodate transit riders and serve as a grand entry point to the city.<sup>258</sup>

## **11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements - N/A**

## **12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans) - N/A**

## George T. McDonald<sup>259</sup>



Doe Fund founder and President George T. McDonald

### ***Biography***<sup>260</sup>

George McDonald has dedicated his life to serving New York City and the people who call it home. Through a nearly 30-year career that exemplifies the power of combining business experience and public service, McDonald has helped to transform the streets of New York and improved the lives of hundreds of thousands.

After two successful decades as an apparel industry executive, he has spent the last 27 years employing innovative business models to create jobs and economic opportunities for low-income New Yorkers. As Founder and President of The Doe Fund, one of the country's most celebrated nonprofit organizations, McDonald has proven that providing paid work opportunities to individuals can transform their lives for the better.

What began as a dream at the kitchen table with his wife, Harriet Karr-McDonald, The Doe Fund grew from a \$1.5 million operation serving 70 individuals a day in 1990 to a \$50 million organization serving 1,000 individuals each day. For more than 20 years, The Doe Fund's nationally acclaimed paid work and training program, Ready, Willing & Able, has strategically addressed the ever-changing face of homelessness in New York, expanding to meet the needs of ex-offenders, homeless military veterans, fathers, and young adults. Fueled by McDonald's belief that "work works," The Doe Fund and Ready, Willing & Able have helped more than 18,000 individuals transform their lives and the lives of the people they touch.

McDonald has utilized his passion, business savvy, and private sector experience to launch additional innovative social enterprises that provide paid jobs and vocational training, offer valuable services to the community, and generate substantial revenue to support program operations.

Since 1989, The Doe Fund has raised nearly \$700 million from a diverse, mixed-market revenue structure; and has generated over \$260 million in direct community and

government benefits, including more than \$100 million in work stipends paid directly to Ready, Willing & Able participants.

A champion of bipartisan criminal justice reform efforts that use employment-based strategies to reduce recidivism and the collateral costs of crime and incarceration, McDonald chaired New York State's Independent Committee on Reentry and Employment in 2005. He currently sits on Governor Cuomo's Work for Success Executive Committee, part of a statewide, cross-sector partnership working to increase employment opportunities for formerly incarcerated individuals.

McDonald has received numerous individual accolades, including the Manhattan Institute's William E. Simon Lifetime Achievement Award in Social Entrepreneurship, a New York Post Liberty Medal, St. John's University's Spirit of Service Award, and an honorary degree from Hobart and William Smith Colleges.

Through his entrepreneurial spirit, tireless advocacy, and effective leadership, McDonald has helped transform thousands of lives, creating meaningful opportunities for upward economic mobility, improving local communities, and generating tangible social and financial outcomes for the benefit of all New Yorkers.

### **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

#### **1. Bicycle Use in New York City**

##### **a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

Asked how he would have handled the bike lane as mayor, McDonald said, "Well, you know, I'm not." Bernstein asked him to suppose he had been. "I mean, what if? What if?" McDonald said, while the crowd laughed. McDonald said it should be "up to the community," and touted himself as a founding member of the new bike share program.<sup>261</sup>

#### **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

##### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow - N/A**

##### **b. Smartphone Apps - N/A**

#### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

##### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) - N/A**

##### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service – N/A**

##### **c. Livery Street Hails – N/A**

#### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

##### **d. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A**

a. Parking Policy – N/A

b. Pedestrian Plazas

Mr. McDonald recently disclosed his position on the fairly recently established pedestrian plazas, such as the ones in Times Square and Herald Square. Mr. McDonald, if elected, would not re-open these pedestrian plazas to motor vehicle traffic. “The third candidate, **George McDonald**, was alone among Republican candidates in broadly endorsing Bloomberg's transportation policies. First, McDonald said he would not re-open Herald or Times Square pedestrian plazas to car traffic.”<sup>262</sup>

c. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A

## **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

a. Service Improvements and Restorations – N/A

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

George McDonald criticized Joe Lhota over MTA fare hikes that were approved when Lhota was the MTA Chairman.

“It’s about the tolls being too damn high, that’s what it’s about. And who raised the tolls before they left the MTA? My friend Joe! And he said it was an act of political courage.”<sup>263</sup>

c. Second Avenue Subway Project

When asked what was the scariest moment of his life, McDonald replied, “First time I heard the Second Avenue subway explosion and every day since.”<sup>264</sup>

“Our townhouse is 100 feet from where the Second Avenue subway is being built. If someday it’s finished, our house’s value will go up, but who knows when that is or who’ll live that long? We’re scared to death each day. It shakes every 11 seconds.”

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor’s Role – N/A

## **6. Transportation Funding**

a. New and Existing Funding Sources – N/A

b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance – N/A

c. Congestion Pricing – N/A

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels) – N/A

## **7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

George McDonald, founder of the Doe Fund, sided with Mr. Bloomberg with regard to the school bus contract dispute, accusing the bus drivers of abandoning special needs students and undermining their safety.<sup>265</sup>

With over 152,000 students including 22,500 special needs students facing the prospect of no transportation for school on Wednesday morning, Doe Fund Founder and mayoral candidate George McDonald called on drivers to get back to work and not risk the lives of our young children. McDonald said, “We’ve seen this movie before, it can end in tragedy. It is unconscionable that the union would put our children in harm’s way for any reason, let alone for the sake of job protections that a court has ruled illegal.”

In 2005, New York City firefighter Matt Long was critically injured when he was struck by a bus during the illegal MTA transit strike. Long was crushed and nearly killed by a charter bus hired to shuttle workers to and from Bear Stearns. McDonald said, “Matt Long’s accident was a direct result of the strike, he only survived because of an incredible will, support of his family and superior physical conditioning. We can not and must not subject our children to such unnecessary risks.”

McDonald urged Mayor Bloomberg to follow President Ronald Reagan’s lead in addressing the situation with Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1811. In 1981, President Reagan fired more than 11,000 air traffic controllers who ignored his order to return to work. Lawyers for the school bus companies have indicated that they will ask federal labor authorities for an injunction to stop the strike since the disagreement is with the city, raising the specter that the strike is illegal.

Said McDonald, “I respect the right of workers in the private sector to strike, but I also believe we have a basic obligation to get our students to school safely. Our children face enough obstacles receiving an education, getting to school in one piece shouldn’t be one of them. That is why I am urging the Mayor to tell union drivers to get back to work or move forward with bidding on new contracts.”<sup>266</sup>

McDonald, founder of the Doe Fund, said he’d go even further by giving the strikers 48 hours to return to work or else he’d accelerate the bidding process that set them off in the first place.<sup>267</sup>

## **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services** – N/A

## **9. Sustainable Transportation**

a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives – N/A

b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans – N/A

**10. Passenger Rail**

- a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) – N/A
- b. Moynihan Station Development Project – N/A

**11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements** – N/A

**12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)** – N/A

Christine C. Quinn



***Biography***<sup>268</sup>

Christine C. Quinn has spent her career in public service, fighting for policies and services that are critical to the lives of New Yorkers. Quinn started out as a housing organizer, helping low-income tenants stay in their homes and protecting affordable housing. As the director of the Gay & Lesbian Anti-Violence Project, Quinn worked closely with the NYPD against hate crimes.

Since 1999, Quinn has served Manhattan's lower west side in the City Council. Elected Speaker in 2006, she has negotiated on-time, balanced City budgets, reducing government spending, and preventing firehouse closings, teacher layoffs and cuts to key services.

Quinn has worked to find innovative and fiscally responsible ways to spark job creation. She has been a leader in the fight to eliminate unfair taxes, particularly the double taxation of freelancers and sole proprietors. She has fought to eliminate unnecessary regulation on small businesses, and created a program that has drastically reduced the average wait for government inspections for new businesses. She has worked to diversify our economy, investing in growing job sectors like health care and food manufacturing. And Quinn has helped our City develop an economy of innovation through tax credits and initiatives to support new ventures in the five boroughs.

A longtime advocate for affordable housing, Quinn renewed incentives for developers who build affordable units. Protecting tenants is a top priority – Speaker Quinn passed legislation to allow landlords to be taken to court for threatening tenants or interrupting essential services, as well as forcing landlords to repair dangerous apartments. Her innovative Housing Asset Renewal Program has turned unsold condominiums into affordable middle-income housing.

Speaker Quinn has long advocated investment in early childhood education and has worked to expand the City's universal Pre-Kindergarten program. She has also worked

extensively to better our middle schools, and at her urging the Department of Education has funded innovative new programs at the highest-need middle schools in the city.

Quinn and the Council led the environmental movement with legislation, the first of its kind in the nation, requiring manufacturers to collect and recycle electronic waste, and passed a bill establishing a plastic bag recycling program. And Quinn has passed bills to improve energy efficiency in large commercial buildings – a move that will reduce the city's carbon footprint.

As the first openly gay Speaker of the City Council, Quinn has worked extensively on issues of justice and equality. She emerged as a leading voice in the fight for marriage equality in New York State, and has made fighting hate crimes a particular emphasis. Speaker Quinn legislated against harassment at reproductive health clinics and exposed anti-abortion front groups that pretend to be family planning clinics. She coordinated a public/private partnership to expand free HIV testing for tens of thousands of public hospital patients.

Working with immigrants' rights organizations, Quinn recently ended the injustice at Riker's Island that was turning innocent immigrants over to the INS and splitting up families.

Quinn has worked extensively to expand access to healthy food and reduce hunger. She's expanded access to food stamps for those that need them, and make sure they could be used to buy fresh produce at Greenmarkets around the city.

Quinn and her wife, Kim Catullo, live in Chelsea, with their dogs.

### **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

Christine Quinn's official website emphasizes the importance of an efficient and robust transportation system to New Yorkers and the city's economy. Quinn's transit plan includes the following key points:<sup>269</sup>

- Ensure that no New Yorker has to spend more than one hour commuting in either direction by 2023.
- Reduce pedestrian, cyclist and driver fatalities 50 percent by 2021.
- Give New York City control of the MTA.
- Launch 10 new Select Bus Service routes in the next 4 years.
- Install MetroCard kiosks above ground at major bus stops and along select bus service routes.
- Expand five borough ferry service, to provide more transportation options and stimulate the local economy.



- Install countdown clocks outside of subway stations, so New Yorkers can see when the next train is coming before they enter.
- Save commuters valuable travel time from the Bronx and West Side of Manhattan.
- Provide additional bicycle parking options at transit hubs for New Yorkers who want to commute part of the way to work on a bicycle.

## 1. **Bicycle Use in New York City**

### a. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes

City Council Speaker Christine Quinn has generally been supportive of the bike-share program, although she has expressed concern about the Citi logos in a landmarked area. “I think a good point is raised. It kind of is advertising in landmark districts, which we don't really allow,” Ms. Quinn said.<sup>270</sup>

Speaker Quinn has said bike lanes raise such fierce opinions that she won't even discuss them at dinner parties. She told WNYC Radio that she placed bike lanes “in the category of things you shouldn't discuss at dinner parties,” alongside money, politics and religion.<sup>271</sup>

“I think it's a funny joke,” she said in an interview, adding that now “it'll be completely dead as material.” In her remarks to WNYC, Ms. Quinn called the city's lanes “clearly controversial,” and said that some had been constructed “without consultation with communities and community boards.”

But Ms. Quinn has said that the Department of Transportation had begun to work more collaboratively with neighborhoods on bike lanes since the City Council passed a law in 2011 requiring the department to “hold hearings with affected community boards before a bicycle lane is constructed or removed.”

Ms. Quinn also said she supported cycling in general, and rode occasionally near her weekend home in New Jersey. “My district is crazy for bike lanes,” she said. Christine Quinn: “I'm a supporter of bike lanes — but the way the Department of Transportation had been implementing them, without any meaningful outreach or dialogue with local communities and community boards, was not the right approach. As speaker, we changed the policy to make it mandatory that Department of Transportation consult with local community boards.”<sup>272</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

With regard to the fact that the Nissan NV200 is currently unavailable, Speaker Quinn has stated, “I think we all support the goal of expanding taxi cab accessibility. Taxicab issues, as we’ve discussed, are complicated at the moment partly because of matters related to the budget and in Albany.”

Since the “Taxi of Tomorrow” became “official” a number of people have tried to stop it. Quinn's office said in a statement that “she believes taxi service should be accessible to all,” but her remarks make it clear she is not willing to mandate that all taxicabs be accessible.”<sup>273</sup>

### **b. Smartphone Apps – N/A**

## **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans)**

When New York City TLC voted unanimously to authorize a pilot program that would create a framework for livery van group ride service in certain areas throughout the city that are either underserved by mass transit or impacted by recent MTA service cuts, Speaker Quinn joined Mayor Bloomberg, and TLC Commissioner David Yassky at a press conference on June 22, 2010 to show her support for the pilot program.<sup>274</sup>

### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service**

Quinn said she'd aim to add ten Select Bus Service routes in four years. Given that it's taken five years for NYC DOT to roll out the four lines, that would be a significant acceleration of the program. Quinn said that, by her calculations, they're a cost-effective way to expand the transportation network: “it costs a million dollars per mile to build a Select Bus line, as opposed to roughly a billion dollars per mile for a new subway.”<sup>275</sup>

### **c. Livery Street Hails**

Ms. Quinn said she would embrace the Bloomberg administration's all-borough taxi plan, which has already brought a smattering of “green cabs” to the road. She has had a complicated relationship with the plan in the past. Under her leadership, the City Council did not pass the proposal, and Ms. Quinn has at times been noncommittal about its merits.<sup>276</sup>

## **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

### **a. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A**

b. Parking Policy

Ms. Quinn further pointed to several ideas she said had come directly from constituent outreach, including rules that ensure the city's parking meters don't charge drivers when they're out of paper.<sup>277</sup> Quinn said her constituents aren't especially worried about curbside parking, but said she considers it "one of the top issues" citywide.<sup>278</sup>

c. Pedestrian Plazas

Speaker Quinn has pledged to cut the number of fatalities in half by 2021. She also helped push for the passage of legislation to permit the use of speed enforcement cameras and has proposed the creation of a so-called safe streets working group.<sup>279</sup>

d. Trucking and Freight Delivery – N/A

**5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

a. Service Improvements and Restorations

Asked to name one thing she would do as mayor to improve the subway service, Ms. Quinn's response was "one thing" is a big one: wresting control of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority from the state government "so New Yorkers are in charge of their own subway system." A more modest proposal from Ms. Quinn: countdown clocks outside subway stations, displaying train arrival information at street level.<sup>280</sup>

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

Council Speaker Christine Quinn has had little to say about MTA surcharges specifically, but more about the relationship shared with the MTA and the City. Quinn calls for Mayoral control of the MTA, since "...the MTA doesn't respond quickly enough to the needs of New Yorkers and the changing face of our city."<sup>281</sup>

"We ... have to all come together and really wage a campaign to get the commuter tax back," said Quinn during a mayoral forum on transportation hosted by the Transport Workers Union.<sup>282</sup>

c. Second Avenue Subway Project

City Council Speaker Christine Quinn said: "For years, the Second Avenue Subway line has been a lot like the rumors of alligators living in the sewers. The Second Avenue subway line will ensure our city's infrastructure keeps pace with both population and economic growth. It is a project that will benefit nearly every New Yorker."<sup>283</sup>

#### d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role

Give New York City control of the MTA: Of the 1.8 billion people who ride the MTA system each year, more than 90% use New York City's subways and buses. And the vast majority of the dollars that fund that system come from the five boroughs through fares, tolls, and taxes. But right now New Yorkers have little say in how that system is run.<sup>284</sup> The Governor appoints the MTA Chair, and the Mayor has a minority of the appointments to the MTA Board, with the majority of members being appointed by the Governor and by county leaders outside the city. Speaker Quinn's plan would give the mayor the power to appoint the head of New York City Transit and a majority of the MTA board members. At a candidate's forum on mass transit in February, the City Council speaker recalled her grandfather's work as a trolley car driver.<sup>285</sup> Much of the discussion turned on what role the city's mayor could even have in mass transit, since the transportation authority is run by the state. Ms. Quinn was among the candidates who seemed to call for a reordering of this power structure.

"None of us mind subsidizing Nassau or Suffolk or Westchester," she said. "We mind subsidizing their mass transit as much as we do. And that's not going to stop until we have real control over our own mass transit."

But most candidates, including Ms. Quinn, a Democrat, demurred when asked if they would pledge to substantially raise the share of the city budget devoted to mass transit.

### 6. Transportation Funding

#### a. New and Existing Funding Sources

I have spoken out numerous times in opposition to recent fare hikes, which have put an increased burden on New Yorkers at a time when many are already struggling to make ends meet. The MTA needs to develop a consistent funding stream for the future, instead of balancing their books on the backs of working New Yorkers. I also believe we need to be exploring alternative sources for transit funding at all levels of government.<sup>286</sup>

"We ... have to all come together and really wage a campaign to get the commuter tax back," said Quinn during a mayoral forum on transportation hosted by the Transport Workers Union.

"And if you talk about the commuter tax in the context of funding mass transit, it makes perfect sense for commuters," she continued. "Because what do they do when they get off the Metro-North or the LIRR or the PATH? They get on the subways and the buses."

#### b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance

New York City's aging infrastructure is due for new investment. Hurricane Sandy reminded us all just how vulnerable New York City is to the effects of climate change.<sup>287</sup> Speaker Quinn believes we need to invest in significant infrastructure upgrades to ensure

that all of the city's neighborhoods are able to handle future storms. With interest rates at all time lows, now is a great time for the City, State, and Federal government to invest in New York City's future. In addition to protecting New Yorkers against future disasters, these critical investments will also create good jobs and stimulate our economy.

c. Congestion Pricing

Council Speaker Christine Quinn, who supported congestion pricing in theory, but who is no longer pushing for it, called for a commuter tax.<sup>288</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

The Bloomberg proposal that Quinn supported, but that the mayor failed to get through Albany, would have charged drivers to enter Manhattan's CBD, in part by levying tolls on East River bridges, and would have used the ensuing revenue to prop up the MTA<sup>289</sup>

**7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

At a mayoral candidate forum hosted by the UFT, Speaker slammed City Hall's handling of this past winter's school bus strike.<sup>290</sup>

On Feb. 15, 2013, a deal, apparently brokered by ATU International President Larry Hanley, was announced in a statement released by five Democratic candidates for the mayoral election in November. Candidates Christine Quinn, Bill Thompson, John Liu, Bill de Blasio, and Sal Albanese asked the ATU to end the strike and pledged to "revisit" the issue if one of them is elected mayor. The pledge avoided embracing the Employee Protection Plan ("EPP") demand by name, while warning the ATU that all decisions will be "fiscally responsible," that is, maintaining the threat of lowered wages and benefits for workers.<sup>291</sup>

**8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services – N/A**

**9. Sustainable Transportation**

a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives

Quinn has promised to remove cars from the road by providing better access to green transportation, including launching the highly successful East River Ferry and expanding bike storage and parking.<sup>292</sup> In addition, under her leadership, the City Council passed alternative fuel medallion laws to foster a "greener" taxicab fleet.

b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans

The New York City Economic Development Corporation and City Council Speaker Christine C. Quinn released details of the new, expanded East River ferry service that will launch this spring. Delivering on Mayor Bloomberg and Speaker Quinn's vision for a sustainable City, the service will provide a new transportation option to residents of

emerging Brooklyn and Queens neighborhoods, and will provide a link to some of the City's most exciting recreation destinations.<sup>293</sup>

"East River ferry service is set to make a big splash this spring in our already-burgeoning East River communities and their surrounding neighborhoods," said Speaker Quinn. "The launch of this much anticipated mass transit option is particularly exciting as we continue to move large infrastructure projects forward in a responsible, efficient and sustainable way."

This initiative is part of the Waterfront Vision and Enhancement Strategy ("WAVES"), a citywide initiative launched by Mayor Bloomberg and Speaker Quinn, which will create a new sustainable blueprint for the City's more than 500 miles of shoreline. WAVES has two core components: Vision 2020: The New York City Comprehensive Waterfront Plan, which will establish long-term goals for the next decade and beyond, and the New York City Waterfront Action Agenda, which will set forth priority initiatives to be implemented within three years. Together, the initiatives will provide a blueprint for the City's waterfront and waterways, and focus on the following categories: open space and recreation, the working waterfront, housing and economic development, natural habitats, climate change adaptation and waterborne transportation.

#### **10. Passenger Rail**

- a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) – N/A
- b. Moynihan Station Development Project

Democratic candidates, including Christine C. Quinn, called on Madison Square Garden to vacate its home atop the underground rail station so that a new structure can be built that would more safely accommodate transit riders and serve as a grand entry point to the city.<sup>294</sup>

Ms. Quinn joined some of the city's most prominent civic groups, which have long lamented the demise of the celebrated structure, in asking the city to approve a measure that would extend the Garden's operating permit for only 10 years. That would provide enough time to find an alternative home for the Garden and to devise plans for an expanded Penn Station and the development of the surrounding neighborhood.

Speaker Quinn called for the elimination of the loophole and a shorter limit on the permit, 10 years. Ms. Quinn also called for the creation of a Commission for a 21st Century Penn Station to find a new home for the Garden and to build a station that suits the needs of the people who use it.

At Ms. Quinn's urging, the Council sent the measure back to the City Planning Commission for modifications.

## **11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements**

Mayoral candidate Christine Quinn said that, if elected, she would appoint an interagency “Safe Streets Working Group” tasked with cutting traffic fatalities in half by 2021. The working group, featuring “high level staff” from DOT, NYPD, City Planning, and the Department of Health, would coordinate automated enforcement, police enforcement, street design, and traffic calming interventions.

Achieving that goal would entail a significant acceleration in the reduction of citywide traffic deaths, which dropped 17.5 percent — from 297 to 245 — between 2004 and 2011, then increased to 274 last year.

Speaker Quinn’s transportation section in her campaign’s website has a mobile app. The app also lays out a few other ideas related to transit and bicycling: installing countdown clocks outside of subway stations, installing MetroCard vending machines above ground at transit hubs along Select Bus Service routes, reducing the amount of time between a bike rack request and its installation, and increasing the amount of bike parking at train stations, bus stops, and ferry landings.

In February 2013, Quinn made a major transportation speech in which she focused on expanding ferry service, increasing city control of the MTA, rolling out 10 new Select Bus Service routes in the next four years, and an already-planned expansion of Metro-North service through the Bronx to Penn Station.<sup>295</sup>

## **12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)**

New York City’s aging infrastructure is due for new investment. Hurricane Sandy reminded us all just how vulnerable New York City is to the effects of climate change.<sup>296</sup> Speaker Quinn believes we need to invest in significant infrastructure upgrades to ensure that all of the city’s neighborhoods are able to handle future storms. With interest rates at all time lows, now is a great time for the City, State, and Federal government to invest in New York City’s future. In addition to protecting New Yorkers against future disasters, these critical investments will also create jobs and stimulate our economy.

## Bill Thompson



Democratic Nominee Bill Thompson campaigning on primary day.  
Website: <http://www.billthompsonformayor.com/><sup>297</sup>

### *Biography*<sup>298</sup>

As Comptroller of New York City from 2002 through 2009, Bill Thompson was responsible for managing the finances of the nation's largest municipality and supervised a staff of 700 professionals. As a lifelong Democrat and the city's top financial watchdog, he oversaw the city's \$100 billion pension fund and made crucial investments in affordable housing for lower- and middle-class families.

Because of a last-minute change to the city's charter revision law, Thompson was given the opportunity to run for a third term in 2009. He chose not to violate the two-term limit put in place by the voters, announcing that he would run for Mayor of New York City instead. As the Democratic nominee, he was outspent 14 to 1 and still came within just a few percentage points of unseating a lavishly self-financed incumbent.

A product of New York City's public schools, Thompson has a deep understanding of the needs of both students and educators. As the head of the Board of Education for five terms, he oversaw a school system with 1.1 million students and 130,000 employees. He has been a persistent champion of meaningful accountability, more extensive after-school programs, an expanded arts curriculum, and higher standards of teaching.

Thompson is also Chair of Governor Cuomo's Minority and Women-Owned Business Enterprise Team, which seeks to promote economic opportunities and eliminate barriers for minority- and women-owned businesses. In 2012, he stepped down as Chairman of the Hugh L. Carey Battery Park City Authority to focus on his campaign for Mayor.

In addition to his eight years of service as a citywide executive, Thompson has valuable private sector experience. He currently serves as the Chief Administrative Officer and Senior Managing Director at Siebert, Brandford, Shank & Co. LLC, the nation's largest



minority public finance firm, where he leads efforts to underwrite loans for schools, roads, bridges and infrastructure projects.

A son of Bedford-Stuyvesant who moved to Manhattan in 2008 after a lifetime in Brooklyn, Thompson is proud of what he calls his dual citizenship. He lives in Harlem with his wife, Elsie McCabe Thompson, and two stepchildren. He is also the proud father of a grown daughter, Jennifer.

### ***Political career***

Upon his graduation from Tufts in 1974 until 1982, Thompson served as special assistant and chief of staff to former Brooklyn Democratic Rep. Fred Richmond, who pleaded guilty to income tax evasion, marijuana possession and making an illegal payment to a government employee and who resigned his seat pursuant to a plea agreement in 1982. Later, Thompson became the youngest Brooklyn Deputy Borough President. As Deputy to Borough President Howard Golden, Thompson was Golden's designee to the New York City Board of Estimate. Following the Crown Heights riots, Thompson worked to fix the racial divide that had paralyzed Brooklyn. In 1993, Thompson moved to the private sector for one year, taking a position as senior vice president of the investment firm George K. Baum & Co.

In 1994, Borough President Golden appointed Thompson to be Brooklyn's representative to the New York City Board of Education. Two years later, with the backing of Mayor Rudolph Giuliani, Thompson was elected President of the Board, ousting the incumbent Carol Gresser. As Board of Education President, he worked for a more centralized management of the public school system that eventually led to mayoral control. Thompson also fought for better after-school programs, improved teacher quality, and an expanded arts curriculum.

While serving on the Board of Education, Thompson also supported himself by working as a political consultant, as a director of KeySpan Energy (now National Grid USA) and as a director of a small financial firm run by Michael W. Geffrard, a former deputy city comptroller. Thompson resigned from the Board of Education in March 2001 to run for the office of Comptroller.

Thompson was opposed by Tony Avella, a New York City Councilman from Queens, for the Democratic nomination to run in November 2009 against incumbent mayor Michael Bloomberg. On September 15, 2009, Thompson overwhelmingly won the Democratic nomination, defeating Avella by 70 points.

On July 9, 2009, Thompson was endorsed by the Working Families Party.

On July 21, 2009, the Comptroller's office released a report suggesting that the Bloomberg administration had falsely inflated graduation rates in city schools. Thompson's report did not demonstrate any conclusive evidence of manipulation, "saying only that a lack of oversight, coupled with intense pressure to push up the graduation rate, created the potential for abuse." Thompson also criticized Bloomberg's managerial style

as creating incentives for schools to graduate unqualified students. The New York City Department of Education released a 38-page rebuttal to Thompson's allegations. In addition on July 21, 2009, Thompson said on NY1 that School's Chancellor Joel Klein should be fired, referring to his Department of Education as "The Enron of American education. Showing the gains and hiding the losses." It was reported that on October 29, 2009 the principal of Lehman High School was being investigated for granting students credits inappropriately and graduating students without them having completed the required course work. Thompson reiterated once again that the mayoral control of schools breeds abuse. On July 28, 2009, the Quinnipiac University Polling Institute released a poll showing that Thompson has cut Bloomberg's lead from June in half, now only trailing Bloomberg by 10 percentage points, 47% to 37%. The poll also found that Thompson made significant gains among black voters: Thompson now leads Bloomberg 56% to 30% (up 25 points from June); Democrats: Thompson now leads Bloomberg 45% to 42% (up 12 points from June); and Independents: Bloomberg leads Thompson 49% to 27% (70% to 14% in June). Subsequent Quinnipiac polls, however, have shown Bloomberg's lead increase to as much as 16 percentage points, 56%-36%.

As of October 6, 2009, Mayor Bloomberg's lead over Thompson had shrunk to 8%.

On November 3, 2009, Thompson was defeated in his campaign for mayor, losing by 4.6% to Mayor Bloomberg, who is now serving his third consecutive term as Mayor of New York City.

### ***2013 Mayoral Campaign***

Thompson has announced his intention to run again for mayor as a Democrat in 2013, when the seat will next be up for election. Unlike his 2009 campaign, there will be no incumbent in the race in 2013, as New York's term-limits law prohibits Mayor Bloomberg from running for a fourth term.

According to the NYC Campaign Finance Board website, as of the March 2013 filing deadline Thompson has raised over \$2.7 million in private funds, fourth among registered Democratic contenders, and fifth overall (former Congressman Anthony Weiner had yet to register but is reportedly considering a bid. According to a report in the New York Times, former New York Republican Senator Al D'Amato was Thompson's largest financial backer as of May 2013.

### **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

Thompson Calls for Renewed Focus on Repairing Our Streets, Reducing Commuting Times to Work and Expanding Transportation Options.<sup>299</sup> Former City Comptroller Bill Thompson outlined a new transportation plan promising to bring New York's roads and transportation systems into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. Thompson's transportation plan calls for the following steps to be taken to improve New York City transit:

- Repair Our Roadways.
- Reduce Commute Times to Work.
- Restore Bus Routes.
- Expand Ferry Service.
- Expand City Ticket During Weekdays.
- Create More Park-and-Ride Options.
- Expand Bus Rapid Transit.
- Improve Access-A-Ride.
- Keeping our Airports Consumer Strong.
- Protect Our Transit System During Emergencies.

“I will be a Mayor who is a transit advocate - fixing our roads, boosting safety, expanding ferry service and increasing bus rapid transit routes so that New Yorkers who work the second shift and even the overnight shift can get home quickly and safely. I'll take common sense steps to make sure that communities outside of central Manhattan have the same transit options as other New Yorkers. They have waited too long for a train or bus - but as Mayor, I won't wait to invest in a fairer system to help them,” said Bill Thompson. More about Bill Thompson’s Mass-Transit plans for New York City is found on his official website: <http://billthompsonformayor.com/issues>

## 1. **Bicycle Use in New York City**

### a. **Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

Campaigning at Memorial Day parades across the city, mayoral candidates had different views. “If it works, I'll expand it,” said Bill Thompson, the Democratic former city comptroller.

Cyclists remember William C. Thompson Jr., a former comptroller and a likely Democratic candidate, for pledging, during a 2009 campaign against Mr. Bloomberg, to rip out a bike lane on Grand Street if he was elected. In an interview last week, he said he had no intention of removing lanes, and added that he would even consider expanding bike projects if the bike-share program, scheduled to begin in May, proved successful.

“I think it's a problem, with the way the Bloomberg administration proceeded with bike lanes, and I don't think the Prospect Park one was any different,” said Bill Thompson. “They put them in and then they talk to the community after the fact. That's not the way it

should have gone.” Bernstein pointed out that the community board had in fact voted to approve the bike lane. Thompson responded by saying, again, that the administration tended to talk to affected communities after the fact.

Mr. Thompson said that he had “no plans to remove” existing lanes and that his transportation commissioner would work with neighborhoods to determine where lanes should be added. He called for “better lighted paths, better paved roads and larger signs that seniors and people with disabilities can read” along existing lanes<sup>300</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

Thompson supported, and has called for, measures that would require that all of New York City’s taxicab fleet be wheelchair-accessible.

### **b. Smartphone Apps – N/A**

### **c. Opportunity Medallions**

On August 15, 2013, Thompson called for providing special financing terms for owner-drivers who purchase taxi medallions at the next auction. Thompson said the new "Opportunity Medallions" initiative would create a new path to the middle class for the city's taxi drivers.

The "Opportunity Medallions" initiative would offer owner-drivers more favorable financing terms for the purchase of a medallion, with the city deferring 50 percent of the cost for five years so that low-wage workers have a greater ability to afford a down payment on a medallion. These financing terms would be available to the 40 percent of medallions sold specifically to owner-drivers. The remaining 60 percent of taxi medallions would be made available to fleet owners as usual, a move that would still generate an estimated \$1.4 billion in revenue for the city.

Over the last 10 years, however, the price of taxi medallions has skyrocketed, with the price for an owner/independent medallion jumping from \$230,000 to \$1 million. Because of these costs, few drivers can save enough for a down payment. Individuals who are able to purchase a medallion face high mortgage payments.

Thompson believes his plan would help level the financial playing field for taxi drivers. In exchange for receiving special financing terms, owners would have to meet certain credit requirements, attend business counseling sessions aimed at preventing mortgage default and be required to drive the vehicle at least part-time. If conditions are not met and the owner-driver defaults, the medallion can be foreclosed upon as an item of personal property. Thompson will keep in place the historic assurance in the law that 40 percent of medallions be slotted for owner-drivers. Additionally, the auction of medallions will be spaced out over time and subject to any pending or future environmental impact reviews.

“The City should be looking for ways to help make it more affordable for taxi drivers to become small business owners,” said Thompson. “But no matter how hard a driver works, he cannot keep up with the rising cost of medallions. My plan is a common sense step to turn low-wage fleet drivers into middle-income workers. As Mayor, I will always look for ways to give working families a leg-up and work to create a path to the middle-class.”

### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

#### **a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A**

#### **b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service**

Thompson pledged to work to restore cut bus routes around the five-boroughs, particularly in areas underserved by subways like Co-op City. He also promised to restore eliminated cross-town bus routes to best serve our seniors and people with disabilities who rely on buses for travel.<sup>301</sup>

Bus Rapid Transit (“BRT”) is the future of transportation infrastructure in an era of increasing growth. Bill Thompson said he would create a true BRT system in under-served transit areas like Staten Island and Southeast Queens, promoting greater economic development in areas throughout the city.<sup>302</sup>

#### **c. Livery Street Hails**

Thompson issued the following statement when the Street Hail Livery Law was passed: “I applaud Gov. Andrew Cuomo for his commitment to negotiate a deal and enact this much needed legislation. However, the governor needs to ensure that any compromise does not eliminate the outer borough street hail provisions and other elements that deserve essential transportation services.”<sup>303</sup>

Thompson stated, “I will be a mayor who expands transportation options for every community, not just central Manhattan.”

On June 6, 2013, Thompson released the following statement praising the New York State Court of Appeals ruling that livery cabs can pick up passengers who hail them outside of Manhattan's central business district:

“Today's ruling is a victory for all New Yorkers who receive the short end of the stick when it comes to safe, reliable taxi service,” Bill Thompson said. “New Yorkers in Washington Heights, Soundview, East New York and every community need a Mayor who will expand transportation options for hardworking families and minority communities. I will be that Mayor.”

Mr. Thompson, who has been perhaps the most outspoken supporter of the mayor's all-borough taxi plan since it was upheld by the New York State Court of Appeals, said he planned to continue to put the proposal into effect after Mr. Bloomberg leaves office.<sup>304</sup>

#### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

- a. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A
- b. Parking Policy

Thompson said his administration will also install mobile pay parking meters that allow residents to conveniently pay for parking time using their mobile phones.<sup>305</sup> This measure will stop excessive parking fines on small businesses and residents. A record 714 million parking tickets were issued in FY2013, with revenue expected to generate over \$518 million - about a \$34 million increase from last fiscal year. Mobile parking technology is used in hundreds of cities across the world and New Yorkers deserve a break for their wallets.

- c. Pedestrian Plazas – N/A
- d. Trucking and Freight Delivery

Thompson will ensure the safety of pedestrians, drivers and cyclists by investing in and fixing our roads. Utility companies that use our streets will stop the cheap patch jobs that turn into potholes months later; the City will employ more durable road surfaces with better material.<sup>306</sup> Thompson will ensure that the Department of Transportation issues permits to do major road closures during off-peak hours.

#### **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

- a. Service Improvements and Restorations

During Bloomberg's eight years in office, the city's financial contribution to the Metropolitan Transportation Authority has remained relatively stagnant -- even while the city had surpluses.<sup>307</sup>

Addressing the MTA's mismanagement, Thompson said, "I will appoint MTA Board members who are transit activists and more representatives of the riding public—unlike the Bloomberg Administration's loyalists who have no special knowledge or even prior familiarity with transit. My appointees will be instructed that raising fares will not be the silver bullet solution to the MTA's mismanagement and bloated budget."

Thompson will call on the MTA to expand the City Ticket program to allow New Yorkers traveling within City limits to ride Metro-North and Long Island Rail Road trains during weekdays and for the same price as a single MetroCard ride. This measure will create fairness between New York and its neighboring counties, increase affordability and help New Yorkers get to work faster.<sup>308</sup>

Thompson's plan would allow New Yorkers traveling within the city limits to ride on Metro-North and Long Island Rail Road trains for the price of a regular MetroCard ride.<sup>309</sup>

Thompson will work to reduce commute times for New Yorkers. An estimated 750,000 people commute an hour or more to work. He will focus our efforts to make transit more reliable, safer and desirable, which will increase usage, restoring bus service, reducing wait-times on our letter trains and speeding up the installation of countdown clocks in subways.<sup>310</sup>

Mr. Thompson said he would push to reduce waiting times between trains and to accelerate the installation of countdown clocks across the system -- already a priority of the transportation authority.<sup>311</sup>

b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge

Former New York City Comptroller and now Mayoral candidate Bill Thompson has much to say regarding the policies regarding the budget and fare/toll pricing structure of the MTA. As Comptroller, Thompson found \$725 Million which could be used to supplement the MTA's budget, which was enough to do away with the MTA fare hikes introduced in 2008 and 2009. Thompson is popularly known to strongly oppose any and all MTA surcharges, and is constantly proposing plans to supplement the MTA's shrinking budget so as to prevent the need for fare hikes. When MTA fare hikes were introduced in the past, Thompson called for reforms like restoring state funding to New York City Transit so as to close the gap in the MTA's budget in order to eliminate the need for a fare hike. Also, Thompson has always been strongly against any MTA fare hikes on Access-A-Ride users, stating that a group of people such as handicapped New Yorkers should not be asked to pay more than they are already paying, since Access-A-Ride service is the only mass transit service which caters specifically to the handicapped and disabled. Contrary to his running mates, Thompson is against imposing any tolls on East River and Harlem bridges, claiming that it would be unfair to charge New Yorkers who live outside of Manhattan just to come into Manhattan to do their jobs.<sup>312</sup>

c. Second Avenue Subway Project – N/A

d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role – N/A

**6. Transportation Funding**

a. New and Existing Funding Sources

As candidate Bill Thompson stated, we need to fund transit fairly, it needs to be more affordable and existing dollars need to be spent correctly.<sup>313</sup>

Thompson stated goal is to ensure that New York City gets its fair share of transit dollars. He identified more than \$725 million that could be used to eliminate the 2008 and 2009 fare hikes.<sup>314</sup>

Thompson also proposed a weight-based auto surcharge designed to generate annual revenue of approximately \$1 billion. Such additional revenue would help close the current MTA budget gap and help fund the agency's vital 2010-2014 capital program.

Thompson has stated that New York City Transit is not getting its fair share of MTA Core Capital funding and that the system is still 1-2 decades from achieving a “State of Good Repair.”

b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance – N/A

c. Congestion Pricing

Comptroller Bill Thompson supports a commuter tax.

In an interview conducted by NBC’s Jay De Dapper on air in 2008, Thompson expressed his strong opposition to the proposal based on the un-fairness he felt congestion pricing showed to the residents of New York City, and the slack it gave to commuters who came to the city daily from other places such as New Jersey and Long Island.<sup>315</sup>

d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)

Bill Thompson joined State and City elected officials in opposing bridge tolls over the East and Harlem Rivers that would create hardship for working families and small businesses and disproportionately hurt New Yorkers living outside Manhattan.<sup>316</sup>

## **7. School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)**

At a UFT forum:

Bill Thompson criticized City Hall’s handling of last winter’s school bus strike. “It was simply union busting,” said Thompson.

Mr. Thompson released an expanded statement on the bus strike that seemed to adopt some of the union's positions, while laying the blame on the mayor.

“As I have stated before, the bus contracts should be rebid to include job protections that will minimize disruption for our school children, maintain the jobs of experienced drivers and, importantly, save taxpayers' money,” he said. “Our children and their families are now caught in a political tug-of-war initiated by the Mayor that must be prevented.”

On Feb. 15, 2013, a deal, apparently brokered by ATU International President Larry Hanley, was announced in a statement released by five Democratic candidates for the mayoral election in November. Candidates Christine Quinn, Bill Thompson, John Liu, Bill de Blasio, and Sal Albanese asked the ATU to end the strike and pledged to “revisit” the issue if one of them is elected mayor. The pledge avoided embracing the EPP demand by name, while warning the ATU that all decisions will be “fiscally responsible,” that is, maintaining the threat of lowered wages and benefits for workers.



## **8. Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services**

It is estimated that Access-A-Ride loses hundreds of millions of dollars a year.<sup>317</sup> Thompson will improve Access-A-Ride by updating the fleet so more people can ride, exploring the use of vouchers, and working with the MTA to find additional cost savings by reducing non-transportation expenses and eliminating redundant functions, which were estimated to cost the agency \$2 billion.

## **9. Sustainable Transportation**

- a. Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives – N/A
- b. Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans

Thompson will work with leading transit advocates to develop a plan to create year-round ferry service to underserved neighborhoods. He will increase night and weekend service to the Staten Island Ferry, find additional means to keep ferry service in the Rockaways by utilizing federal transportation dollars and public-private partnerships.<sup>318</sup>

Instead of working to build additional costly parking lots that take up valuable land, Thompson will work in partnership with the faith-based community to offer subsidies to acquire parking lot space during weekdays for drivers. Since most services are on weekends, many parking lots go unused during the week and thus can be made available.<sup>319</sup>

## **10. Passenger Rail**

- a. ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak) – N/A
- b. Moynihan Station Development Project – N/A

## **11. Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements**

Thompson recommended that area airports modernize the local air traffic control system, consider market-based landing fees with peak and off-peak pricing, and explore the capping of flights to prevent delays and save time and money.<sup>320</sup>

## **12. Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)**

To better prepare for future storms like Hurricane Sandy, Thompson will advocate for increased federal dollars to increase transit resiliency at our bridges and tunnels, airports and subways.<sup>321</sup>

Anthony Weiner



Member of the U.S. House of Representatives  
from New York's 9th district  
Website: <http://www.anthonyweiner.com/>

***Biography***<sup>322</sup>

***Early life, Education, and Family***

Weiner was born in Brooklyn, New York, one of three sons of Mort Weiner, a lawyer, and his wife Frances (née Finkelstein), a public high school mathematics teacher. The family lived for a time in the Park Slope neighborhood of Brooklyn. Weiner described his ethnic and religious background in 2011: “We weren't a very religious household,” he said, “but we had a very strong sense of our Judaism.” His older brother, Seth, was killed at age 39 in a hit-and-run vehicle-pedestrian accident in May 2000. His younger brother, Jason, is a chef and co-owner of several New York restaurants.

Weiner took the Specialized High Schools Admissions Test (SHSAT), qualified for Brooklyn Technical High School, and graduated in 1981. He attended the State University of New York at Plattsburgh, where he played on the hockey team and initially aspired to become a television weatherman. He spent his junior year as an exchange student at The College of William and Mary, where he befriended future comic/political commentator, Jon Stewart. His interests turned towards politics; he became active in student government and was named most effective student senator.

Upon receiving his Bachelor of Arts degree in political science in 1985, Weiner joined the staff of then-Congressman and current Senator Chuck Schumer. He worked in Schumer's Washington, D.C. office for three years, then transferred to Schumer's district office in Brooklyn in 1988 when Schumer encouraged him to become involved in local politics.

### ***New York City Council Member: 1992–98***

After six years of working for Schumer, Weiner's first chance at political office came in 1991 when the New York City Council was expanded from 35 to 51 seats. Considered a long-shot, Weiner faced strong primary competition from two other candidates who had better local name recognition and more funds. Right before the September 1991 primary, Weiner blanketed the largely white 48th council district with anonymous race-baiting leaflets playing on the voters' fears and racial hostility in the immediate aftermath of the Crown Heights race riots and tying his white opponents to black politicians who were deeply unpopular in the district. Weiner won the primary in a surprising upset, besting his opponents by 125 and 195 votes, and guaranteeing his victory in the general election in the majority Democratic district. Weiner then became, at age 27, the youngest councilman in City history. Over the next seven years on the City Council, Weiner initiated programs to tackle quality of life concerns. He started a program to put at-risk and troubled teens to work cleaning up graffiti. He spearheaded development plans for historic Sheepshead Bay that led to a revival of the area; and, when supermarkets started leaving the neighborhood, Weiner worked to reverse the trend.

As Chairman of the Subcommittee on public housing, he fought to increase federal funding, to ban dangerous dogs, and to add more police officers to the beat. His investigation into the cause of sudden, fatal stairwell fires made headlines; he exposed dangerous practices that eventually led the city to replace the paint in developments citywide.

### ***Member of the U.S. House of Representatives: 1999–2011***

In the 1998 primary election, Weiner won the Democratic nomination to succeed his mentor and long-term boss, U.S. Representative Chuck Schumer who had given up his seat in the House to run for the U.S. Senate. At that time, victory in the primary was tantamount to election in the heavily Democratic 9th District which included parts of southern Brooklyn and south and central Queens. Upon winning the general election, Weiner became only the fifth person to represent the District since its creation in 1920.

### ***Personal life***

Weiner became engaged to Huma Abedin, a longtime personal aide of Hillary Clinton, in May 2009; they married in July 2010 in an interfaith ceremony with former president Bill Clinton officiating. On December 21, 2011, Abedin gave birth to the couple's first child, son Jordan Zain Weiner.

## **Transportation Related Policy Statements**

Anthony Weiner's official campaign website includes a description of the candidate's transportation and infrastructure plan for New York City. His plan includes the following key points:<sup>323</sup>

- Launch Ferries in All Five Boroughs.
- Install Cell Service on Every Subway Platform.
- Give Breaks to Employers to Promote Biking to Work.
- Mandate More Bike Spots in New Buildings.
- Expand Citi Bike to All Five Boroughs.
- Replace Access-A-Ride with 2,000 New Accessible Cab Medallions.
- Turn Abandoned Train Tracks into Pedestrian, Biking, and Sightseeing Walkways.
- Bring Back the "Barnes Dance."
- Launch Cab Stands in Every Zip Code.
- Increase Parking Spots Near Fire Hydrants.
- Adopt Neighborhood Parking Stickers.
- Ban Horse-drawn Carriages.
- Get More Control of the MTA from Albany.

### **1. Bike Sharing and Bicycle Lanes**

"I'm going to hold up my bike share tag. I love bicycling, I hope that more people do it, I look forward to the bike share program. I don't think I'll be having ribbon cuttings to do that, but I can tell you this: I think they succeeded in taking a unifying issue -- the thing that people agree upon in this city, they like bicyclists, they like biking -- and they made it a divisive one. And it shows you how you manage the city and how you pursue the job a mayor manages -- how it influences how these issues get considered. Now you have people who are venomous about bike lanes, who -- that if we had a smarter policy with more conversation and more consideration -- then I think ...you would have probably gotten to a similar place without having funny conversations like that."

"By the way," Weiner added, "I wasn't the only one having that conversation. A lot of people talk about it. But I love bikes, and I would point people to the idea in my book

which is to mirror the federal tax benefit that people get when they help their workers find bike equipment, find places to park and the like -- I think that's some way the city can help.”

“I don't like the bike lane on Prospect Park West,” Weiner said, “I reserve the right to do things and policies and propose things -- again, I'm not getting wrecking crews out or ribbon cuttings started -- you know, I've not been a fan of that one, but I understand people are and I'm not looking to re-litigate every bike lane in the city.”

But, does he want to expand the bike lane network?

“I always want to increase the amount of bike riding that we have in the city, I like the bike share program, I've got (a station) right on my corner, I'm going to use it, I've got my fob in my pocket...but I will say this: the way we pursued this policy left a lot of people feeling like this was a policy that was brought down upon them in their neighborhood without a lot of consultation, without a real conversation about what it is we're trying to do, and a larger vision. I want to try to change the tenor of that conversation, and make it more about the balance that we need to strike and figuring out the right way to do things and the wrong way to do things. But I want to do that with every policy.”

“The issue is whether there was a sense that this process was fair and opened and not predetermined...we have a tendency to want to see every election as 'let's go back and re-litigate that fight and see where you've been. For the most part most New Yorkers want to know in an election where you're going to go forward. Here's how I'm going to pursue the issue of biking. One, I'm going to try to offer them tax incentives, employers tax incentives, to make it easier to bike to work. Two: I'm going to try to make sure the bike share program works (and) works well, and that the process is open and thoughtful about where we put the stanchions. And I'm also going to say about bike lanes: I want to have a conversation about where we do them and how we do them and what tradeoffs we make when we do them.”

Anthony Weiner said he would “remove lanes that are either not working or are unsafe, while adding them wherever practical.” While in Congress, he once used an obscenity to describe the mayor's bike lanes and told him that he would remove them from the streets. He later said he was kidding, and has softened his stance slightly, often brandishing his membership key for the city's bike-share program.<sup>324</sup>

## **2. For-Hire Ground Transportation Services**

### **a. The Taxi of Tomorrow**

During a televised mayoral debate, Mr. Weiner voiced his concerns regarding the transition from New York City yellow cabs as we know them now, to the upcoming Nissan NV200 vehicle model. Since the entire fleet of NYC yellow cabs will eventually be comprised of Nissan NV200 vehicles, it is Mr. Weiner's concern that should Nissan issue a recall for any reason of the new NV200 the city's entire fleet of yellow taxicabs will be out of commission, therefore crippling the City. "This Taxi of Tomorrow is all

one type of taxi, not handicap accessible—by the way it doesn't exist yet—not handicap accessible," he said. "I'd ask you this, my friends: what happens when that brand new car comes out and they have a recall on the brake liners or something? Every single cab in the entire city is going to be offline."<sup>325</sup>

- b. Smartphone Apps – N/A

### **3. Outer-Borough Transportation Issues**

- a. Commuter Vans (Dollar Vans) – N/A
- b. Bus Services/Select Bus Service – N/A
- c. Livery Street Hails

Mr. Weiner, an opponent of the all-borough taxi plan, said he would ensure that passengers in green cabs “have access to cars that pass the same standards as the yellow cabs” that patrol Manhattan.<sup>326</sup>

### **4. Traffic Issues – Congestion and Safety Plans & Improvements**

- a. Curb-Space Allocation – N/A
- b. Parking Policy

“You know, back in the days when I was a city councilman, when they opened the mikvah and they put 20-minute parking meters all around it, I understood you can’t do that and I changed it. I understand the idea that when Hatzolah wants to move into a place, you have to have slightly different parking restrictions around that as well,” he added.<sup>327</sup>

- c. Pedestrian Plazas

Anthony Weiner has recently called for increased use of the so-called Barnes Dance, which are areas where vehicle traffic is temporarily frozen in all four directions at intersections, allowing pedestrians to cross in any direction.<sup>328</sup>

- d. Trucking and Freight Delivery

Rep. Anthony Weiner, a Democrat who represents parts of Queens and Brooklyn, said truck traffic has increased by 30% since 1998. In a four-point plan that included the toll increase, he also proposed a federal tax incentive for nighttime truck deliveries that would match a city incentive proposed in the past. He also recommended better enforcement of truck traffic laws and endorsed a plan by Rep. Jerrold Nadler, a Democrat of Manhattan and Brooklyn, to build a rail freight tunnel.

## **5. Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Issues**

### **a. Service Improvements and Restorations**

Mr. Weiner said he would push for majority voting control for the mayor and the city on the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's board of 17 voting members. Currently, all board members are nominated by the governor, with four of them recommended by the mayor. Mr. Weiner has also called for the installation of cell phone service on every subway platform, which the authority has already planned.<sup>329</sup>

### **b. MTA Payroll Tax & the MTA Taxi Surcharge – N/A**

### **c. Second Avenue Subway Project – N/A**

### **d. Governance Issues & NYC Mayor's Role**

“Why do we have a whole bunch of people in New York City having big decisions governed by an unelected authority,” he continued. “We have to change that ethos. That should be the conversation. And you should have had it when you were there, my friend.” The former congressman, who's running a surprisingly successful campaign for mayor, said today that he wants “to reform the public authorities that govern so much that is integral to New York City.”<sup>330</sup>

## **6. Transportation Funding**

### **a. New and Existing Funding Sources – N/A**

### **b. Infrastructure Repair and Maintenance – N/A**

### **c. Congestion Pricing**

Anthony Weiner, has a history of being strongly opposed to the concept of congestion pricing. During Mayor Bloomberg's press conference regarding congestion pricing on April 30th, 2007, Anthony Weiner made a comment expressing how he felt about the plan which was to be proposed by Mayor Bloomberg the following day. Weiner said that the congestion pricing plan was like putting a “tax” of sorts on the middle class and poor New Yorkers.<sup>331</sup>

### **d. Toll Policies (Bridges & Tunnels)**

Rep. Anthony Weiner (D-Brooklyn, Queens), blasted the proposal as “regressive tax on middle-class and working New Yorkers.” “This idea should stay dead,” he said.<sup>332</sup> Representative Anthony D. Weiner released his new version of a rescue plan for the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, in which tolls on the East River and Harlem River bridges that would be paid only by people who do not live in New York City. Mr. Weiner, a Democrat whose district includes parts of Queens and Brooklyn, and who is

planning to run for mayor in November, has long been an opponent of putting tolls on bridges where they don't already exist.

Making new tolls — which he would set at \$4.15 — payable only by non-city residents would be a compromise that could gain traction in Albany and would be a bit like reviving the commuter tax, which was eliminated 10 years ago. He predicted the tolls would raise \$391 million each year. “This is my contribution to trying to solve this problem,” Mr. Weiner said in a telephone interview. Acknowledging that he has fought tolls in the past, he said: “We seem to be slipping from, should we have them, to, how should we have them. And I’m trying to engage that second discussion.”<sup>333</sup>

7. **School Bus Transportation (strike, new contracts, etc...)** – N/A

8. **Accessible Transportation & Paratransit Services**

Weiner has stated that the “Access-A- Ride program is a more than \$600 million boondoggle. Taxpayers and the disabled alike are being taken for a ride (if the car ever shows up, that is) at a cost of nearly \$66 per ride.”

“The city should issue 2,000 new medallions only for handicap-accessible yellow cabs that can be dispatched in all five boroughs. We would raise revenue for the city, and raise expectations for the disabled.”<sup>334</sup>

9. **Sustainable Transportation**

a. **Alternative Fueled Vehicles & Incentives**

Mr. Weiner supports giving breaks to employers who promote biking to work.

“The IRS offers tax breaks to employers who offer up to \$20 a month to workers to buy, fix, or store their bikes. For the employee, this is tax free compensation and a strong incentive to pedal to work. The city should offer a similar deal.”<sup>335</sup>

Weiner called for promoting more taxicabs.

“The so-called “Taxi of Tomorrow” will soon become the only cab that a hack can drive in New York City. It is not a hybrid or electric or any other forward-looking technology.” According to Mr. Weiner this would have the effect of forcing many hybrid cabs off the road at a time when we should be using more. “The push for a “one-size-fits-all” approach should be scrapped in favor of incentives for driving the most environmentally sound cabs.”<sup>336</sup>

b. **Sustainability & Mobility Management Plans** – N/A

10. **Passenger Rail**

a. **ARC Tunnel Project – Gateway Project (Amtrak)** – N/A



b. Moynihan Station Development Project

“I think that anyone who looks at Penn Station, whether you're looking at it from the bowels of that building or from a larger architectural perspective...would say the best place for Madison Square Garden is further to the west,” Mr. Weiner said after a mayoral forum Wednesday.<sup>337</sup>

11. *Use of Big Data and Technology for Transportation Improvements* – N/A

12. *Emergency Preparedness & Evacuations (Transportation Plans)* – N/A